HERBERT GRUNDMANN (1902–1970)

Essays on Heresy, Inquisition and Literacy

Edited by JENNIFER KOLPACOFF DEANE

Heresy and Inquisition in the Middle Ages
Volume 9

HERBERT GRUNDMANN (1902–1970)

YORK MEDIEVAL PRESS

York Medieval Press is published by the University of York's Centre for Medieval Studies in association with Boydell & Brewer Limited. Our objective is the promotion of innovative scholarship and fresh criticism on medieval culture. We have a special commitment to interdisciplinary study, in line with the Centre's belief that the future of Medieval Studies lies in those areas in which its major constituent disciplines at once inform and challenge each other.

All enquiries of an editorial kind, including suggestions for monographs and essay collections, should be addressed to: The Academic Editor, York Medieval Press, Department of History, University of York, Heslington, York, YO10 5DD (E-mail: pete.biller@york.ac.uk)

Heresy and Inquisition in the Middle Ages

ISSN 2046–8938

Heresy had social, cultural and political implications in the middle ages, and countering heresy was often a central component in the development of orthodoxy. This series publishes work on heresy, and the repression of heresy, from late antiquity to the Reformation, including monographs, collections of essays, and editions of texts.

Previous volumes in the series are listed at the back of this volume.

Herbert Grundmann (1902–1970)

Essays on Heresy, Inquisition, and Literacy

Edited by Jennifer Kolpacoff Deane

Translated by Steven Rowan

THE UNIVERSITY of York

YORK MEDIEVAL PRESS

First published 2019

A York Medieval Press publication
in association with The Boydell Press
an imprint of Boydell & Brewer Ltd
PO Box 9, Woodbridge, Suffolk IP12 3DF, UK
and of Boydell & Brewer Inc.
668 Mt Hope Avenue, Rochester, NY 14620–2731, USA
website: www.boydellandbrewer.com
and with the
Centre for Medieval Studies, University of York
www.york.ac.uk/medieval-studies

ISBN 978-1-903153-93-2

A CIP catalogue record for this book is available
from the British Library

This publication is printed on acid-free paper

Contents

Acknowledgements

The process of translating and editing scholarly work is always challenging, and the nature of this particular volume – linguistically dense, intellectually complex and heavily sourced – made wide consultation with colleagues a necessity. I am indebted to all below, whether for precise technical assistance, the many valuable suggestions or for encouragement at tricky junctures over the course of the project. In particular, sincere appreciation to John Arnold and Peter Biller, editors of the 'Heresy and Inquisition in the Middle Ages' series with York Medieval Press, for initially proposing and entrusting me with the project. No editorial pair could have been more collegial, attentive or patient – a remarkable feat given the necessarily frequent use of email to communicate across the Atlantic. It was a genuine pleasure to work with and learn from two colleagues whose own research has long inspired me and who bring such a gracious spirit to scholarship. Our collaborative day-long editing session in September 2018 and lovely meal that evening at King's College, Cambridge, were particular high points. I would also like to thank Caroline Palmer for her patience and support as an editor, and the rest of the team at Boydell & Brewer for their expertise and efficiency in the design and production of this book.

In terms of translation contributions, the debts are many. Thanks to Steven Rowan (University of Missouri, St Louis) for cheerfully and speedily providing translations of the modern German and French essays. Stephen Carey at the University of Minnesota, Morris, offered prompt and always enlightening help with medieval German passages and literary contexts. Considerable thanks are also due to Joe Canning, who translated Latin passages within the text and footnotes; Sam Ottewill-Soulsby, for providing translations from existing editions where available; and Nikolaos Poulopoulos (University of Missouri, St Louis) for help with the Greek. And finally, my dear friend and admired fellow historian, Dr Letha Böhringer, was an invaluable resource from beginning to end – suggesting alternate translations across multiple languages, helping to develop the Introduction's framework and themes and annotating the translation of Arno Borst's obituary essay of Herbert Grundmann with key historical and historiographical context. No one provides energising and kind *Ermutigung* like she does.

A wide range of colleagues at various institutions also provided feedback or expertise along the way, including Stephen Anderson, Alison Armstrong, Michael Bailey, Bill Burgwinkle, Martina Duetmann, Sean Field, Anne E. Lester, Hugo Service and Shelagh Sneddon. Elizabeth Dillenburg at the University of Minnesota provided scrupulously careful and timely editorial service. At the UMM Briggs Library, Sandy Kill worked her usual magic with Interlibrary

Loan despite the abundance of diacritical marks and hard-to-locate journals. Generous research funding was provided by the University of Minnesota Grant-in-Aid of Research programme and Imagine Fund award, and also by the University of Minnesota, Morris, Faculty Research Enhancement Funds (FREF). Substantial blocks of work were completed while I was on retreat at St John's Abbey, where the medieval tradition of Benedictine hospitality continues to flourish in central Minnesota.

On a personal note, I would like to acknowledge my doctoral advisors Robert E. Lerner and Richard Kieckhefer for the specific introduction to Herbert Grundmann's scholarship and its complex historical and historiographical consequences. My cherished friends and writing partners, Jennifer Rothchild and Julie Eckerle, offered unfailing moral support as well as substantial interdisciplinary insight. And to my husband, Brad – thank you for the love and support, and for gamely discussing medieval German historiography at all hours.

Finally, I would like to express gratitude for permissions to publish translations, to Frau Dr Ulrike Borst for Arno Borst's account of Herbert Grundmann, and above all to Frau Barbara Dierichs and the whole Grundmann family for Grundmann's essays. The publication of these translations secures the wider dissemination in the English-speaking world of the works of one of the greatest medieval historians of the 20th century: this would not have been possible without their support.

Abbreviations

Abh Berlin	*Abhandlungen der Akademie der Wissenschaften zu Berlin*
Abh Göttingen	*Abhandlungen der Akademie der Wissenschaften zu Göttingen*
Abh Munich	*Abhandlungen der bayerischen Akademie der Wissenschaften*
Abh Prague	*Abhandlungen der Königlichen Böhmischen Gesellschaft der Wissenschaften*
AFH	*Archivum Franciscanum Historicum*
AKG	*Archiv für Kulturgeschichte*
Alan of Lille, *De fide*	Alan de Lille, *De fide catholica contra hereticos sui temporis*, *PL* 210
Alcuin *Ep*.	Alcuin, *Epistolae, MG Epp.* 4, pp. 1–481
Annales d'hist. écon. et soc.	*Annales d'historie économique et sociale*
Anonymous of Passau, ed. Gretser	Anonymous of Passau, <*Tractatus*>, ed. J. Gretser, *Lucae Tudensis episcopi, scriptores aliquot succedanei contra sectam Waldensium* (Ingolstadt, 1613), cited from the unaltered reprint in *MBVP* 25 (1677), pp. 262–77 and 310–12
Bernard Gui, *Liber sententiarum*	*Liber Sententiarum Inquisitionis Tholosanae Ab anno Christi mcccvii ad annum mcccxxiii*, ed. P. van Limborch [= second part of P. van Limborch, *Historia Inquisitionis, cui subiungitur Liber Sententiarum …* (Amsterdam, 1692)]
Bernard Gui, *Practica*	Bernard Gui, *Practica Inquisitionis Heretice Pravitatis*, ed. C. Douais (Paris, 1886)
Bernard of Clairvaux, *Sermones in Cantica*	Bernard of Clairvaux, *Sermones in Cantica* 65, *PL* 183
Bibl. lit. Ver. Stuttgart	Bibliothek des literarischen Vereins in Stuttgart
Böhmer and Redlich, *Reg. Imp*. (Innsbruck, 1898)	J. F. Böhmer and O. Redlich, *Regesta Imperii*, vol. VI, part 1, *Die Regesten des Kaiserreichs unter Rudolf, Albrecht, Heinrich VII, 1273–1313* (Innsbruck, 1898)

Bouquet, *Recueil*	M. Bouquet, ed., *Recueil des historiens des Gaules et de la France*, new 3rd edn under the direction of L. Delisle, 24 vols. (Paris, 1854–1904)
Brutus. Orator	Cicero, *Brutus. Orator*, trans. G. L. Hendrickson, H. M. Hubbell (Cambridge, MA, 1939)
Caesarius of Heisterbach, *Dial. mirac.*, ed. Strange	Caesarius of Heisterbach, *Dialogus miraculorum*, ed. J. Strange, 2 vols. (Cologne, 1851)
Cassiodorus, *Documents*	*The* Variae *of Magnus Aurelius Cassiodorus Senator: Being Documents of the Kingdom of the Ostrogoths in Italy*, trans. S. J. B. Barnish (Liverpool, 1992)
CC	Corpus Christianorum. Series Latina
CSEL	Corpus Scriptorum Ecclesiasticorum Latinorum
DA	*Deutsches Archiv für Erforschung des Mittelalters*
De inquisitione hereticorum, ed. Preger	*Tractatus de inquisitione hereticorum*, ed. W. Preger, 'Der Tractat des David von Augsburg über die Waldesier', *Abhandlungen der bayerischen Akademie der Wissenschaften*, Philosophisch-historische Klasse 14 (1879), pp. 204–35
Döllinger, *Beiträge*	J. J. I. von Döllinger, *Beiträge zur Sektengeschichte des Mittelalters*, 2 vols. (Munich, 1890).
Du Cange, *Glossarium*	Charles du Fresne, sieur du Cange, et al., *Glossarium mediæ et infimæ latinitatis*, 10 vols. (Niort, 1883–87)
DVLG	*Deutsche Vierteljahrsschrift für Literaturwissenschaft und Geistegeschichte*
Fam.	Cicero, *Epistulae ad Familiares*
Fließende Licht, ed. Morel	*Fließende Licht der Gottheit*, ed. G. Morel (Regensburg, 1869)
Frédéricq	*Corpus Documentorum Inquisitionis Neerlandicae*, ed. P. Frédéricq, 5 vols. (Ghent, 1889–1903)
Friedberg	*Corpus iuris canonici*, ed. E. Friedberg, 2 vols. (Leipzig, 1879)
Grundmann, *Religiöse Bewegungen*	H. Grundmann, *Religiöse Bewegungen im Mittelalter* (Berlin, 1935)
Grundmann, *Religious Movements*	H. Grundmann, *Religious Movements in the Middle Ages* (Notre Dame, 1995)

Hartzheim, *Conc. Germ.*	J. Hartzheim, *Concilia Germaniae*, 11 vols (Cologne, 1759–90)
HV	*Historische Vierteljahresschrift*
Jaffé, ed. *Bibl. rer. Germ.*	P. Jaffé, ed. *Bibliotheca rerum germanicarum*, 6 vols (Berlin, 1865–73)
Mansi	J. D. Mansi et al., eds., *Sacrorum conciliorum nova et amplissima collectio*, 31 vols. (Florence, 1759–98)
Martianus Capella, trans. Stahl	*Martianus Capella and the Seven Liberal Arts*, trans. W. H. Stahl, R. Johnson and E. L. Burge, 2 vols. (New York, 1971–77)
MBVP	*Maxima Bibliotheca Veterum Patrum*, ed. M. de la Bigne, 28 vols (Geneva, 1677–1707)
MGH Auct. Ant	Monumenta Germaniae Historica, Auctores antiquissimi
MGH Capit.	Monumenta Germaniae Historica, Capitula episcoporum
MGH Capit. reg. Fr.	Monumenta Germaniae Historica, Capitularia regum Francorum
MGH Dt. MA.	Monumenta Germaniae Historica, Deutsches Mittelalter. Kristiche Studientexte
MGH Epp.	Monumenta Germaniae Historica, Epistolae
MGH Epp. sel.	Monumenta Germaniae Historica, Epistolae selectae
MGH Fontes iuris antiqui	Monumenta Germaniae Historica, Fontes iuris Germanici antique in usum scholarum ex Monumentis Germaniae historicis separatim editi
MGH Leges	Monumenta Germaniae Historica, Leges
MGH Libelli de lite	Monumenta Germaniae Historica, Libelli de lite imperatorum et pontificum
MGH Poetae	Monumenta Germaniae Historica, Poetae Latini aevi Carolini
MGH Quellen zur Geistesgeschichte des Mittelalters	Monumenta Germaniae Historica, Quellen zur Geistesgeschichte des Mittelalters
MGH Schriften	Monumenta Germaniae Historica, Staatschriften des späteren Mittelalters
MGH Scr. rer. Merov.	Monumenta Germaniae Historica, Scriptores rerum Merovingicarum

MGH SRG	Monumenta Germaniae Historica, Scriptores Rerum Germanicarum
MGH SS	Monumenta Germaniae Historica, Scriptores
MIÖG	*Mitteilungen des Instituts für österreichische Geschichtsforschung*
MPL	*Monumenta Philologum Londiniense*
NA	*Neues Archiv der Gesellschaft für ältere deutsche Geschichtskunde zur Beförderung einer Gesamtausgabe der Quellenschriften deutscher Geschichten des Mittelalters*
Niederdt. Jahrb.	*Niederdeutsches Jahrbuch. Jahrbuch des Vereins für niederdeutsche Sprachforschung*
Opera	Opera Omnia
Otto of Freising, *Gesta Friderici*	Otto of Freising-Rahewin, *Gesta Friderici Imperatoris*, ed. G. Waitz and B. von Simson, MGH SRG 46, 3rd edn (Hanover, 1912)
PBB	*Beiträge zur Geschichte der deutschen Sprache und Literatur*
PG	J. P. Migne, ed., *Patrologiae cursus completus. Series Graeca*, 163 vols. (Paris, 1857–1912)
PL	J. P. Migne, ed., *Patrologiae cursus completus. Series Latina*, 221 vols. (Paris, 1857–66)
PRE	A. Hauck, ed., *Paulys Realenzyklopädie für protestantische Theologie und Kirche*, 24 vols. (Leipzig, 1896–1913)
Pro Archia. Post Reditum	*Cicero, Pro Archia. Post Reditum in Senatu. Post Reditum ad Quirites. De Domo Sua. De Haruspicum Responsis. Pro Plancio*, trans. N. H. Watts, (Cambridge, MA, 1923)
Rec. des Hist. des Croisades, Occid	*Recueils des historiens des Croisades, Historiens occidentaux* (Paris, 1844–1895)
Rheinische Beiträge	*Rheinische Beiträge und Hülfsbücher zur germanischen Philologie und Volkskunde*
SB Berlin	*Sitzungsberichte der Deutschen Akademie der Wissenschaften zu Berlin*
SB Wien	*Sitzungsberichte der Österreichischen Akademie der Wissenschaften in Wien*

Schönbach, *Das Wirken Bertholds*	A. E. Schönbach, *Das Wirken Bertholds von Regensburg gegen die Ketzer*, Sitzungsberichte der philosophisch-historischen Klasse der kaiserlichen Akademie der Wissenschaften 147 (Vienna, 1904)
Stephen of Bourbon, *Tractatus*	Stephen of Bourbon, *Tractatus de diversis materiis praedicabilibus*, ed. A. Lecoy de la Marche, *Anecdotes historiques, légendes et apologues tirés du receuil inédit d'Étienne de Bourbon, Dominicain du XIIIe siècle* (Paris, 1877)
UB Straßburg	*Urkundenbuch der Stadt Straßburg*. 7 vols. (Straßburg, 1879–1900)
Wattenbach, *Deutschlands Geschichtsquellen im Mittelalter*	W. Wattenbach, *Deutschlands Geschichtsquellen im Mittelalter bis zur Mitte des dreizehnten Jahrhunderts*, 2 vols., 6th edn (Berlin, 1893); 7th edn (Berlin, 1904)
ZKG	*Zeitschrift für Kirchengeschichte*

Introduction: Heresy, Inquisition, Literacy

> The historian, with all respect and understanding for the office, cannot permit this way of seeing – the form of questioning and judging that needs only decide between orthodoxy and heresy – to intrude if he wishes to understand the intellectual and religious life of that time in its variety of views, in its tensions and contradictions, and hence in its symptoms and causes of change. (Herbert Grundmann, 'Heresy Interrogations' [see p. 126 in this volume])

Over the nearly fifty years since his death in 1970, Herbert Grundmann's formative influence on the field of medieval religious history has become increasingly evident. Renowned for his innovative and scrupulous research into the beliefs, ideas, practices and processes that shaped religious worlds from the twelfth to the sixteenth centuries, Grundmann revealed entirely new vistas of the medieval past. Generations of scholars have since approached their research from vantage points shaped by his arguments, whether those points of view were attained via personal contact, by reading his many publications or inherited through doctoral work and other secondary scholarship. Central to this gradually widening circle of influence were his German students, whom he mentored up until his death.[1]

By the last decades of the twentieth century, this secular, source-based and cultural-historical approach had rippled through French, Italian, British and other European scholarship, producing in its wake research on a wide range of topics: monasticism, education, literacy, universities, theology, apostolic life, women's religious communities and expression, heresy and inquisition, popular or lay religious life, apocalyptic thought and prophecy and so on.[2] American scholars inspired by Grundmann's methods soon generated their

[1] Among those students whose influence is best known among English speakers are Arno Borst, Kaspar Elm and Alexander Patschovsky.

[2] An abbreviated reading list of English-language publications influenced by or engaged with Grundmann's theses is included at the end of this Introduction as a starting point for readers new to the field. It is by no means intended to be an exhaustive inventory, as it would be nearly impossible to capture the vast range of relevant scholarship in the space allotted here.

own studies of the medieval religious landscape, in turn introducing their own doctoral students to the 'Grundmann'sche' model. That Grundmann opened his door to foreign graduate students both at home and at the Monumenta Germaniae Historica suggests awareness of, and perhaps a sense of kinship with, these far-flung circles of medieval scholarship.

By the time of this publication, Grundmann's influence has been incorporated, whether consciously or not, into the research of hundreds of medievalists around the globe. Yet, for those without skill in reading German, the precise and subtle distinctions of Grundmann's arguments have been largely inaccessible. The 1995 English translation of his masterwork *Religiöse Bewegungen* into *Religious Movements of the Middle Ages* was an invaluable contribution to that audience and generated new waves of engagement with Grundmann's complex and wide-ranging theses.[3] Yet the majority of his writings still remain untranslated and thus difficult for students or those without advanced German to access.

The present volume addresses this gap by contributing translations of six of his most significant essays written between 1927 and 1968. As indicated by the volume's title, the central topic is Grundmann's perceptive approach to the intellectual intertwining of heresy, inquisition and literacy, and the historical-cultural processes which gave rise to them between the twelfth and fifteenth centuries. Although these texts were selected in order to illustrate the essential themes, scope and method of his work, the choice of essays to represent them is itself a matter of debate and unlikely to satisfy every reader. Our goal in providing greater access to Grundmann's scholarship is thus not so much to reflect on the past in terms of his full *oeuvre* but, rather, to stimulate discussion of his influence and the future of scholarship in medieval religious history. For, although sustained consideration of Grundmann's thought and personal context is overdue, it is not yet possible to write an intellectual biography. Scarce evidence survives from his formative early years, and many of his personal papers from his later life will not be public until the late 2020s; in the meantime, readers interested in biographical details can profitably consult Robert E. Lerner's introduction to *Religious Movements.*

The six essays selected here for translation are presented in chronological order of publication, a sequence that also reveals the development of key themes and interests over time. Blending what one might now call literary, sociological and historical approaches, Grundmann drew attention to the diachronically shifting meaning of words and labels in an innovative manner anticipating much later historiography, and used them to map entirely new topographies of medieval religious thought and expression. A current reader of Grundmann is likely to be struck by the still-fresh insights, unexpected linkages and novel perspectives they contain – attributes gained largely as a

[3] See Bibliography, nos. 13, 59, 97 and 104.

consequence of his openness to the newly developing field of sociology and its focus upon the relational dynamics of communities, individuals, women, men and institutions. In addition to this foundational attention to cultural history, 'Grundmann embraced both rigorous source criticism and an instinct for broader synthesis – a combination in evidence across all his work, from his study of Joachim of Fiore's thought to the broad panorama of [*Religious Movements*] and beyond'.[4]

In 1927, when he published 'Profile of the Heretic', Grundmann was only twenty-five years old, a young scholar ambitious to prove himself and the quality of his ideas. He opens the essay with a flourish, reflecting briefly on the 'history of heresy' before boldly declaring such a history intellectually impossible: 'Fundamentally, the very process of research in intellectual history of course negates the possibility of a distinct "history of heresy", as it does not recognise a distinction between heretical and orthodox as the last word in historical wisdom.' In this brief piece with its electrifying thesis that 'every heretical movement must be understood as a single intelligible facet of the broader spiritual development of its time', he cast the distortions and misdirections of inquisitorial sources into sharp relief. 'Whoever, as an historian, does not dare to understand what the Church judges to be heretical and orthodox as phenomena of *one* intellectual world assumes the position of a judge of heresy, ordering the complexity of life according to the measures of Church doctrine.'[5] Never a particularly religious man himself,[6] he had a rare ability to see through ecclesiastical strictures and official categories and to discern previously hidden relationships deep in the source record.

Grundmann developed an equally innovative and arguably even more radical perspective in his 1935 exploration of the development of vernacular writing in the later Middle Ages. In 'Women and Literature', he argued that it was women's literacy and literate interests that bridged clerical Latin and a reading laity, and which in turn ignited the dramatic late-medieval expansion of pious vernacular writing. Put succinctly, noble German women read, and, as they did so, they changed the content to reflect their increasingly spiritual interests. The following illustrates something of the scope and verve of the piece: 'So if female readers are to be thanked both for the rise of a religious German literature as well as the reception of German poetry into script,' he writes, 'then the religious turn of German literature in the course of the thirteenth century has a comparable origin. From *minne*-poetry

[4] *Religious Life Between Jerusalem, the Desert, and the World: Selected Essays by Kaspar Elm*, ed. and trans. J. D. Mixson (Leiden and Boston, 2015), p. 10.

[5] Chapter 1 in this volume; p. 16 below.

[6] On the question of Grundmann's personal religious and ideological leanings, see Letha Böhringer, 'Herbert Grundmann, Confession, and "Religious Movements"', *Between Orders and Heresy: Rethinking Medieval Religious Movements*, ed. Jennifer Kolpacoff Deane and Anne E. Lester (University of Toronto Press, forthcoming).

to mysticism, from Gottfried to Eckhart, the new forms emerged because of women's interests and activities: seized by a powerful religious movement that alienated them from courtly social culture, its ideals and its arts, German women of this time were awakening instead to a life of Christian surrender and religious dedication.'[7]

In this essay, as with 'Profile of the Heretic', he demonstrated a willingness to disregard traditional intellectual boundaries in the pursuit of understanding, and a tenacious commitment to careful source analysis. His ability to see across the gender prejudices of his day thus yielded insights about medieval source materials that feminist research would take up only many decades later.

At the age of thirty-seven Grundmann arrived at the University of Königsberg, with his wife and family, to assume the chair of medieval history, but was soon thereafter called to military service. From the outbreak of the Second World War, through its aftermath in the later 1940s, Grundmann's career took several sudden turns, and his publications on medieval religious history ceased for a decade and a half. Age and poor vision kept him from the front and in more varied work – service in anti-aircraft and anti-tank units, and a stint as a truck driver, but especially lectures and presentations to diverse audiences. Not only did these include universities and *Volkshochschule* [community colleges] but also German officers' camps and even French prisoners of war. In 1945 he was shot in the wrist, subsequently imprisoned in an English camp and released in July of that year to return to Münster.

At the University of Münster, Grundmann continued to be a teacher and mentor who advocated freedom of thought for his pupils; the curiosity and diverse research paths of Grundmann's many students illustrate the extent of his limber, dynamic intellectual stance. Cautioning both students and readers against theological modes, he decried judging the medieval past by modern criteria and argued with equal force against materialist frameworks which explained medieval religious movements as symptomatic of class-based social upheaval. Such positions reflect Grundmann's dislike of rigid or static explanatory models, especially those whose misapplication to the medieval past distorted historical understanding. One would be hard pressed to see an ideologue in this curious and dedicated mentor who continued to attract bright, innovative and often strong-willed students over the years to come.

In 1957, and after substantial strategising and networking towards the goal, Grundmann was named head of the MGH and entered the 'elder statesman' period of his career. One discerns here an evident appetite for, and skill in, administrative politics – for example, his successful efforts to organise a solid pension plan for colleagues at the MGH, or supervision of the move to new quarters in the Bayerisches Staatsbibliothek. Continuing

[7] No. 18; 'Women and Literature', p. 30 below.

to research and publish from the chair's office in the decade from 1958 to 1968, Grundmann also published three important and quite diverse essays and a brief but compelling conference paper whose translations close out the present volume.

Returning to the themes and methods of his groundbreaking 1935 argument about women's roles in literary culture, he published in 1958 the weighty essay *Literatus–Illiteratus*. The essay explored, in effect, what words about words meant from antiquity through the Middle Ages, painstakingly tracing back through historical and literary materials the medieval shift 'in the valuation and appreciation of writing, of letters, and a transformation in attitude and relation to literature'. In antiquity and the Middle Ages, the apparent opposites of 'analphabeten' and 'literatus' were not polar extremes on a spectrum of value but, rather, two equally valid conditions, each appropriate for a particular station and neither burdened with negative connotations. Grundmann demonstrates that as 'the distinction between *litterati* and *illitterati* underwent strong fluctuations over the course of time […] the meaning and value of these concepts become a sort of seismograph of intellectual history'. The original meaning of literacy-as-Latin-knowledge began to unravel and shift in response to socio-economic and political quickening in the central medieval era. By the fifteenth century, he argues, a new style of vernacular school emerged in Germany:

> often scorned as *Winkelschulen* [schools in city 'nooks and crannies'], they had to overcome considerable clerical opposition; even Luther still railed against them. But the practical need for such German writing schools grew unstoppably, promoted by printing, while the translation of the Bible made the knowledge of Latin completely unnecessary for many.

Grundmann argues that, as a consequence, the very concept of *litteratus* had substantially dissolved by the late Middle Ages, becoming 'less unified and less characteristic of specific intellectual structures or movements' over time, eventually morphing into a label of so many possible meanings as to be functionally useless. In tracing the 'guiding thread of one word's history through the centuries', Grundmann at the same time insisted upon the foundational influence of historical context upon meaning – upon the 'manifold changing social and national conditions, ideational forces, and cultural efforts' with which new meanings were assigned to the concept of literacy over time.

A few years later, in the 1963 essay *Oportet et haereses esse*, Grundmann returned to the triangulation of language, erudition and understandings of heresy and inquisitorial responsibilities in the central and later Middle Ages. What authoritative texts – particularly scripture – were drawn on to engage with or excise heretics from the community? Which texts were *not* so deployed, and why? Pulling the title from St Paul's assertion 'oportet et haereses esse' ('there must be heresies'), Grundmann pointed out the bind

into which this statement put later theologians and inquisitorial thinkers. If heresy must be, how should one respond to it? Were heretics to be avoided, converted or pursued for punishment? And how was one to learn about heretics in the first place? Different passages from scripture and the Church Fathers, especially St Augustine, offered textual ammunition for quite distinct positions on and approaches to the problem of heresy. Indeed, the Middle Ages 'knew the whole of patristic writings concerning and opposing the old heresies, particularly Augustine's polemics against the Manichees, the Donatists, the Pelagians, and so on, and additionally a whole series of heretic catalogs in which names and teachings of all the old heresies were collected in a condensed, comprehensible form'.[8] Replete with ancient stereotypes, medieval inquisitors and other Church authorities were thus unable to perceive and record accurately the shifting nature of contemporary religious dissent. 'Hence in medieval testimonies on heresies it is not easy to distinguish what came from actual experience, knowledge and observation or only from an acquired literature, whose concepts and names were simply applied to present-day heretics in order to sort them out, as in a questionnaire, as long-known and long-condemned.'[9] The essay incorporates the long and perhaps slightly weary backwards view of a scholar in his later years: 'Great patience is required to read the same commentaries again and again and to establish where they originate,' he writes. 'One can all too easily make a mistake and discover, either later or never, that a seemingly new sentence was yet another patristic citation.'[10] Such acknowledgement might well have been appreciated by his doctoral students, grappling with such methodological and interpretive quagmires in their own research for the first time.

Two years later, in the essay 'Heresy Interrogations in the Late Middle Ages as a Source-Critical Problem' (1965), Grundmann expanded on the themes developed in 'Profile of the Heretic', exploring the literary machinery of inquisitorial process and the relationship between documentation and what can be known within the broader framework of intellectual history. By highlighting the process by which prefigured constructions of 'the heretic' decisively shaped inquisitorial procedure, he demonstrated how the documentary record (*interrogatorium*) revealed much about inquisitors' assumptions and ambitions but very little regarding the original beliefs and statements of those questioned. 'For in most cases, one wanted less to discover the actual thoughts of individual heretics than to confirm their agreement with already-condemned heresies, to determine their membership in an already-known sect.' In keeping with his interest in language and the formulation of meaning, Grundmann also parsed the 'translation problem' inherent to the inquisitorial process: formularies were first 'stated in Latin

[8] Chapter 5 in this volume.
[9] See below, p. 187.
[10] See below, p. 195.

and then translated point by point into the language of the interrogated person (who seldom knew Latin) for their response', then rendered back into Latin in the protocol. 'How then were less-educated souls to make themselves understood in an oral hearing? How far were their answers – to stereotyped questions formulated elsewhere, and protocolled in Latin – to be taken seriously as reflecting what they thought and meant?' One of the most significant arguments in the essay is 'how powerfully the Latin wording of the question framed the Latin form of the answer'.

Grundmann's view on the survival of authentic voices and beliefs in the source material is not entirely sceptical; his perspective was nuanced, leaving space for the echo of an original voice even through the bureaucratic interventions of the source. '[H]aving once experienced how the objects of these processes spoke in exceptional cases, without the pressure of questions, and sometimes even in their own writings, one notes how surprisingly different they sound from protocolled expressions before an inquisitorial court.' Having already identified the literary construction of 'heretic' derived from the eight characteristics outlined in *Ad nostrum* (an antiheretical decree issued at the Council of Vienne in 1311 and published with some revisions in 1317), Grundmann uses the last half of the article to trace inquisitorial interpretation of suspects' statements (via both inclusions and omission) across four cases in the fourteenth and fifteenth centuries. Here he fully develops the claim that '[d]espite their correspondences and dependence on set forms, the records also permitted the differences and peculiarities of each to be understood, so that they could be seen as really quite different'. Grundmann challenges historians to a critical interpretation of protocolled statements, clarifying 'the painstaking care with which one must analyse such hearing protocols and their "templates" in order to listen to each on its own, to distinguish between more or less formulaic repetitions'. Yet the argument ultimately rests on a certainty that, textual interventions notwithstanding, it is possible via scrupulous analysis to 'hear them [the interrogated] speak with their own words'. For Grundmann, only in this way can the history of heresy and inquisition become a source of conclusive intellectual history, in which the inquisitor and heretic, orthodox and the erring or seeker are equally involved, not as opponents, but as partners of an intellectual world encompassing both. The inquisitors, too, can become more comprehensible to us, providing the most indispensable, productive witnesses to that for which *and* against which they worked.

The last of Grundmann's essays contained in this volume is a brief set of comments presented in 1968, two years before his death, for the International Colloquium at Royaumont. Entitled 'Learned and Popular Heresies of the Middle Ages', the paper responds to several guiding questions posed by the conference organiser and medievalist Jacques Le Goff: 'Is heresy a matter for simple people or for the learned? Were there popular heresies and learned heresies? Did they play the same roles in the process of seizing the conscience? How did learned elaboration and popular belief relate to the development of

that heresy?' In this short piece, Grundmann contributes two key ideas about the relationship between heresy, inquisition and literacy.

First, he identifies the common thread across all heresy as a fundamentally literary effort 'to comprehend and seize the original and authentic intentions of Christianity […] to attain the true intelligence of the Bible, of the Gospels, and the apostolic writings'. All medieval heretics, he argued, fundamentally believed that their conception of scripture and divine will was superior to that of the Church and its inquisitors. Second, he complicates the familiar dichotomy of learned/popular with a sharper distinction, that 'between primordial or initial heresies – those of the heresiarchs (learned or not, founders of sects or not), and the heresies of the sectarians' or the later communities and networks of enthusiastic adherents. Refusing static models of medieval belief, Grundmann instead here applies the crucial historical-temporal aspect of change over time – of *differences* between the originating context of 'heretical' ideas (such as an individual scholar in an academic milieu) and the varied settings across which such ideas subsequently rippled and were absorbed, transformed and recirculated by enthusiastic (often lay) adherents. In particular, as illustrated by the cases of Wyclif and Hus, social and political factors would separate 'founders' from later 'followers' even more profoundly than did doctrinal or spiritual tenets. The key insight here is the historian's attention to contextual difference – to change over time and space, to the distinction between individuals and communities and to the protean adaptability of beliefs as they were mediated and remediated through institutions and texts.

In contrast, the final text included here in translation – a substantial obituary written by Grundmann's pupil and friend Arno Borst (1925–2007) – was composed with precisely the opposite aim in mind: to underscore the senior scholar's unwavering consistency across the decades. It has been included at the end of the volume as a means of locating the older man's life and contributions in their own historical context, and to provide readers with a sense of the atmosphere of German medieval scholarship in 1970. Borst's task in writing the 25-page obituary essay was twofold: on the one hand, he knew Grundmann well, had been deeply influenced by him and strove to represent him in recognisable form; on the other, he faced the broader challenge of honouring the career of a man whose personal chronology stretched from the Kaiserreich all the way to the Bundesrepublik. In a sense, his piece spoke to that entire generation of historians; and it goes without saying that an intellectual life spanning much of the tumultuous twentieth century experienced *Brüche und Widersprüche*, or breaks and contradictions.

Moreover, Borst's text is challenging – not only because it follows a highly stylised literary convention which veers at times into hagiography, but also because it contains multiple historical allusions and contextual insinuations hardly comprehensible to a twenty-first-century reader. Thus, brief footnoted annotations provide contextual information to readers seeking to understand

the shifting ground of Grundmann's personal historical environment. Following Borst's essay in the original German publication was a bibliography of Grundmann's works compiled by Hilda Lietzmann, numbered chronologically for ease of reference. In this volume Borst's essay is also followed by a bibliography, which draws mainly upon this and the 'Literature Database for the Middle Ages' of the Regesta Imperii; it follows Lietzmann's numbers, whilst adding various items. Reflecting on Borst's texts, inclusions and omissions regarding the life of his mentor offers the opportunity to explore the historical contours and pressures in which Grundmann's thought developed.

Three characteristics of Borst's essay require brief discussion, as it was composed in a style quite unlike an honorary or memorial essay today. The first is his curious – one might well say 'forced' – linkage between Grundmann and the medieval figures on which his scholarship focused. At one point or another in this obituary, Borst explicitly equates Grundmann and every hero of his articles, particularly Joachim of Fiore, Alexander of Roes, Francis of Assisi and the others among 'Grundmann's old friends'. Borst remarks that 'Joachim and his biographer shared the conviction … that "perfection was not sought beyond everything earthly, a negation of mutability, but rather perfection could be a condition on earth, a possibility that could be achieved both in life and history".'[11] Thus 'per Joachim and Grundmann alike', history 'must be patiently derived from the interpretation of complex texts and events, and every answer remained subject to future correction'. According to Borst, Grundmann also found in the Cologne canon Alexander of Roes a kindred scholarly spirit: 'What warmed him [Grundmann] even more to Alexander of Roes was the discovery that he had written his *Memoriale* in four different versions and "relentlessly believed that he could improve his first version":[12] he was a man who stood by his conclusions and yet remained open to new experience.' And, like the famous figures of twelfth and thirteenth centuries who renounced material possessions in favour of a spiritual path, Grundmann is depicted here as uninterested in money or power and focused instead upon unearthing historical truth: '[t]he young Grundmann resisted commercial gain … even in his childhood he subscribed to Jesus' motto of voluntary poverty (Matthew 19: 21) which Valdes and Francis had encountered in a similar setting'. Borst thus employs medieval historical figures to represent facets of Grundmann's own experience, whether as the brilliant and voluntarily impoverished maverick (Francis), the scrupulous researcher (Alexander of Roes) or finally, later in life, the shrewd and powerful administrator (Innocent III). In representing Grundmann as a modern counterpart to religious heroes of the medieval past, Borst implicitly insists upon an essential link between his subject's life and his work – in particular, that of resisting

[11] No. 1, p. 11.
[12] No. 43, p. 23.

closed systems in turbulent times. The extent to which Grundmann actually enacted such systemic challenge is debatable, however; any thoughtful answer will need to wait until his private papers are made available.

Second, a temporal theme weaves through Borst's essay in which past, present and future entwine to form a particular narrative of success. Distinctly teleological in terms of the completed arc of Grundmann's life, the account of his origins clearly shaped by what followed, this narrative paradoxically also questions outcomes and the knowability of the future. Three years before his death, Grundmann had drawn on one of Goethe's reflections ('Where it is going, who knows? He can hardly recall where he came from') to make a more specific claim about the scholarly enterprise: 'We historians attempt […] to grasp how it came about; we do this by projecting into the future, always with the wish that it will lead to the good life'.[13] Having written the piece in the wake of 1968 and an era of massive social change, Borst returns repeatedly to the perhaps comforting theme of continuity between past and present in the historian's own experience. For instance, he draws a parallel between Grundmann (departing academia to chair the Monumenta Germaniae Historica, or MGH) and the warrior-count turned pious recluse, Gottfried von Cappenberg: 'The feelings of the 57-year-old [Grundmann] as he departed Münster in April 1959 resembled those of Gottfried von Cappenberg; he did not want to establish himself where he pleased, he wanted to work where he was needed. What would come of it remained to be seen.' To Germans of the postwar era, history was firmly anchored to the past, whether distant or recent; but, at the same time, the spirit of history also necessarily projected its implications and consequences forward into the future. The repeated refrain 'what would come of it remained to be seen' evokes this sense of unease with the unknowability of a future simultaneously so dependent upon both past and present. Borst uses Grundmann's own language and sympathetic eye for radical medieval thought to reflect on the temporal arc of history and individual lives:

> The movement to an open future, to world history, began in the Middle Ages, even though it perceived itself as the end time. This movement was not invented, only discovered, recognised from the twelfth century and then accelerated by Grundmann's old friends who reappear here one more time: Joachim of Fiore, mendicant brothers and the heretical poor in spirit, Innocent III, Frederick II, Alexander of Roes, Dante, Meister Eckhart. They burst open the seemingly closed world without themselves knowing what would come from it, or where this expanding universe was headed.

To an attentive German reader of 1970, Borst's remarks would have carried a decidedly double meaning.

[13] No. 162, p. 81.

Finally, Borst weaves the theme of a 'Konsequentes' and 'glückliches Leben' throughout the essay. Translating poorly into English as a 'consistent' and 'fortunate' or 'happy life', the original terms bear the implication of successful fulfilment or completion. As Grundmann himself said, remarks Borst, 'We historians attempt to recall this and to grasp how it came about; we do this by projecting into the future, always with the wish that it will lead to the good life.' Borst's commitment to the theme as a structuring device for the obituary is striking, given that the life he describes included two world wars, hunger, economic hardship, early loss, paternal bankruptcy, severe injury as a soldier and a nearly fatal automobile accident. Despite all the evidence for breaks and disruptions in his subject's lifetime, he nonetheless depicts Grundmann's life as a blessed one of service and rich contentment.[14] As mentioned earlier, Borst moulds his subject as a wise hermit, echoing Grundmann's own descriptions of Joachim of Fiore as 'no visionary living already half-blind in his own future, but a prudent man of peace who took seriously the day's obligation and for its sake left his lonely cell'. That the parallel was a stretch is putting it mildly; envisioning Grundmann as a humble recluse only reluctantly engaged with the world hardly squares with his evident taste for political manoeuvring, networking and academic power brokering. Although an obituary of this style and quasi-hagiographical tone sits firmly at odds with twenty-first-century academic writing, Borst's essay thus reveals much about the world-view of senior German academics, particularly during the turbulent late 1960s. About the content and influence of Grundmann's life, however, it conveys considerably less.

Instead, Borst offers readers an image of his mentor as turned toward the distant past, open to the future and ambivalent toward the present. And, rather than delineating change over the course of a lifetime, he emphasised his mentor's steadiness through the decades ('a life so frankly consistent across forty years') and his nearly devotional commitment to historical method. Yet, in contrast to Borst's rather static representation of his mentor, the most characteristic quality of Grundmann's work is arguably the ability to transcend given interpretive frameworks in favour of new perspectives – an intellectual mode that yielded insights quite out of step with mid-century mores. Grundmann valued German power and, like many of his generation, longed to see the bitter defeat of the First World War undone and the Versailles treaty dismantled, and was not utterly unstained by the Nazi era; what he felt about such matters after 1945 remains to be seen. But revelations

[14] In German, the phrase 'glückliches Leben' implies both externally bestowed good fortune and also a feeling of happiness. 'Ich bin glucklich' means 'I am happy', while 'ich habe Glück' translates as I am lucky. Evoking Herbert Grundmann's 'glückliches Leben' here would likely have reminded a German reader of the folktale hero Lucky Hans, who starts his adventure with a bar of gold and ends with nothing … yet is happy.

about the pivotal and creative contribution of women to medieval literacy, for example, or the shared historical roots of (and tendentious distinctions between) 'orthodox' and 'heretical', or the insufficiency of categories such as 'learned' and 'popular' for comprehending medieval religious history hardly seem the product of an intellect bent to mass ideological will. In the meantime, it is our hope that this volume will stimulate interest in his work among a broader audience and – as Grundmann himself would certainly have wanted – catalyse fresh new perspectives on the medieval religious past.

For Further Reading

A Sample of English-Language Publications Influenced by Grundmann's Essays

C. Caldwell Ames, *Righteous Persecution: Inquisition, Dominicans, and Christianity in the Middle Ages* (Philadelphia, PA, 2009).
J. H. Arnold, *Belief and Unbelief in Medieval Europe* (London, 2005).
J. H. Arnold, *Inquisition and Power: Catharism and the Confessing Subject in Medieval Languedoc* (Philadelphia, PA, 2001).
M. Bailey, *Battling Demons: Witchcraft, Heresy, and Reform in the Late Middle Ages* (University Park, PA, 2003).
A. Beach, *Women As Scribes: Book Production and Monastic Reform in Twelfth-Century Bavaria* (Cambridge, 2004).
P. Biller, *The Waldenses, 1170–1530* (Aldershot, 2001).
P. Biller and A. Hudson, eds., *Heresy and Literacy, 1000–1530* (Cambridge, 1994).
B. Bolton, *The Medieval Reformation* (London, 1983).
D. Bornstein and R. Rusconi, eds., *Women and Religion in Medieval and Renaissance Italy* (Chicago, 1996).
R. B. Brooke, *The Coming of the Friars* (London and New York, 1975).
C. Bruschi, *The Wandering Heretics of Languedoc* (Cambridge, 2009).
I. Bueno, *Defining Heresy: Inquisition, Theology, and Papal Policy in the Time of Jacques Fournier* (Leiden, 2015).
L. Burnham, *So Great a Light, so Great a Smoke: The Beguin Heretics of Languedoc* (Ithaca, NY, 2008).
C. Walker Bynum, *Holy Feast and Holy Fast: The Religious Significance of Food to Medieval Women* (Berkeley, CA, 1987).
M. T. Clanchy, *From Memory to Written Record. England, 1066–1307* (Oxford and Cambridge, MA, 1979); 2nd and 3rd edns (Cambridge, MA, Chichester and Oxford, 1993, 2013).
G. Constable, *Three Studies in Medieval Religious and Social Thought* (New York, 1995).

D. L. d'Avray, *The Preaching of the Friars. Sermons Diffused from Paris before 1300* (Oxford, 1985).
D. Elliot, *Proving Woman: Female Spirituality and Inquisitional Culture in the Later Middle Ages* (Princeton, NJ, 2009).
S. Field, *The Beguine, the Angel, and the Inquisitor: The Trials of Marguerite Porete and Guiard of Cressonessart* (Notre Dame, IN, 2012).
J. Freed, *The Friars and German Society in the Thirteenth Century* (Cambridge, MA, 1977).
F. J. Griffiths, *The Garden of Delights: Reform and Renaissance for Women in the Twelfth Century* (Philadelphia, PA, 2006).
D. Hobbins, *Authorship and Publicity Before Print: Jean Gerson and the Transformation of Late Medieval Learning* (Philadelphia, PA, 2009).
A. Hudson, *The Premature Reformation: Wycliffite Texts and Lollard History* (Oxford, 1988).
L. Kaelber, *Schools of Asceticism. Ideology and Organization in Medieval Religious Communities* (University Park, PA, 1998).
K. Kerby-Fulton, *Books Under Suspicion? Censorship and Tolerance of Revelatory Writing in Late Medieval England* (Notre Dame, IN, 2006).
R. Kieckhefer, *Repression of Heresy in Medieval Germany* (Philadelphia, 1979).
R. Kieckhefer, *European Witch Trials: Their Foundations in Popular and Learned Culture, 1300–1500* (Berkeley, CA, 1976).
F. C. Kneupper, *The Empire at the End of Time: Identity and Reform in Late-Medieval German Prophecy* (Oxford, 2016)
M. D. Lambert, *Medieval Heresy. Popular Movements from Bogomil to Hus* (London, 1977); 2nd and 3rd edns with revised title, *Medieval Heresy. Popular Movements from the Gregorian Reform to the Reformation* (Oxford, 1992, 2002).
R. E. Lerner, *The Heresy of the Free Spirit in the Later Middle Ages* (Berkeley, CA, 1972).
A. E. Lester, *Creating Cistercian Nuns: The Women's Religious Movement and Its Reform in Thirteenth-Century Champagne* (Ithaca, NY, 2011).
H. Leyser, *Hermits and the New Monasticism. A Study of Religious Communities in Western Europe, 1100–1500* (London, 1984).
E. W. McDonnell, *The Beguines and Beghards in Medieval Culture. With Special Emphasis on the Belgian Scene* (New Brunswick, NJ, 1954).
B. McGinn, *The Flowering of Mysticism: Men and Women in the New Mysticism: 1200–1350* (New York, 1991).
J. Mixson, *Poverty's Proprietors: Ownership and Mortal Sin at the Origins of the Observant Movement* (Leiden, 2009).
A. Murray, *Reason and Society in the Middle Ages* (Oxford, 1978).
B. Newman, *From Virile Woman to WomanChrist: Studies in Medieval Religion and Literature* (Philadelphia, PA, 1995).
M. J. Reeves, *The Influence of Prophecy in the Later Middle Ages. A Study in Joachism* (Oxford, 1969).

L. J. Sackville, *Heresy and Heretics in the Thirteenth Century: The Textual Representations*, Heresy and Inquisition in the Middle Ages 1 (York, 2011).
W. Simons, *Cities of Ladies: Beguine Communities in the Medieval Low Countries, 1200–1565* (Philadelphia, PA, 2001).
R. W. Southern, *Western Society and the Church in the Middle Ages* (Harmondsworth, 1970), Ch. 3, 'The Religious Orders'.
C. Taylor-Jones, *Ruling the Spirit: Women, Liturgy, and Dominican Reform in Late Medieval Germany* (Philadelphia, PA, 2017).
The Uses of Literacy in the Early Middle Ages, ed. R. McKitterick, rev. edn (Cambridge, 2008).
J. Van Engen, *Sisters and Brothers of the Common Life: The Devotio Moderna and the World of the Later Middle Ages* (Philadelphia, PA, 2008).
B. Whalen, *Dominion of God: Christendom and Apocalypse in the Middle Ages* (Cambridge, MA, 2009).

Note on the Text

Herbert Grundmann's publications extend from 1927 to his death in 1970; some items were published posthumously. A selection of his articles were published by the Monumenta Germaniae Historica in three volumes between 1976 and 1978, *Ausgewählte Aufsätze*, and we have further selected from these. We provide, in chapters 1, 4, 5 and 6 of this book, translations of articles republished in the first volume of *Ausgewählte Aufsätze* (1976), which concentrated on heresy and inquisition; and, in chapters 2 and 3, translations of articles republished in the third volume (1978), which focus on literacy and education. Chapter 7 provides a translation of Arno Borst's account of Grundmann's life and career, published in the first volume of *Ausgewählte Aufsätze* (1976). Our collection is rounded off in chapter 8 by a bibliography which selects from and adds to that originally compiled by Hilda Lietzmann, also published in that first volume.

The translation of Grundmann's prose tries to keep literal meaning and fluency in balance. The conventions used in Grundmann's footnotes have been converted to the house style of York Medieval Press. We have preserved the numeration of the original footnotes; it should be noted that the footnotes of each sub-section in chapter 3 are autonomous – each series begins anew at no. 1. In the original version of chapter 7 references were contained within the text; we have converted these into footnotes.

Editorial interventions – additions and corrections – in the reprints of the *Ausgewählte Aufsätze* have been translated, and they are signalled within square brackets thus: [1976 reprint: …]; [1978 reprint: …]. We have intervened quite freely in chapter 7, providing glosses to points and personalities in Grundmann's career that might well be obscure to an Anglophone reader. But we have done this only very rarely in footnotes to Grundmann's own

essays, generally confining ourselves to references to a few important recent editions or studies. Our own editorial interventions are signalled by their being contained within undated square brackets thus: [...]. York Medieval Press requires modern English translation alongside the citation of material in medieval Latin or vernaculars, and we have provided this in all cases, apart from the trial texts edited at the end of chapter 4. Where the translation is derived from a published work, both the translation and acknowledgement are placed within square brackets.