Pneumatology at the Beginning of the Third Millennium
Theology at the Beginning of the Third Millennium is a series of theological monographs which seek to examine the status quaestionis of various sub-disciplines within the field of theology in this second decade of the third millennium and some half a century after the conclusion of the Second Vatican Council. While the initial impetus for the series came from scholars at the University of Notre Dame (Australia), the Catholic Institute of Sydney, and Campion College (Sydney), contributors to the volumes come from a diverse array of theological academies. A feature of the series is the fact that although the majority of the contributors are situated within the Catholic intellectual tradition, scholars from other traditions are also welcome.

The various sub-disciplines which form the subject of each volume are examined from the perspective of scripture scholarship, fundamental, systematic and dogmatic theology, spirituality, historical theology, ecumenical and pastoral theology and the theology of culture. This is consistent with the Balthasarian metaphor that “Truth is Symphonic” and thus created by a harmonious integration of different disciplines or “sections” of the theological orchestra. Consistent with the charism of St. James, the contributors share a high degree of respect for the deposit of the faith, a Johannine interest in integrating spirituality and mystical theology with dogmatic and fundamental theology, a Pauline sensitivity to the influence of the Holy Spirit, a Petrine interest in official magisterial teaching and, above all, a Marian disposition of receptivity to the Divine Logos.
Pneumatology at the Beginning of the Third Millennium

THEOLOGY AT THE BEGINNING OF THE THIRD MILLENNIUM

Edited by

KEVIN WAGNER
PETER JOHN MCGREGOR
and
M. ISABELL NAUMANN

© PICKWICK Publications · Eugene, Oregon
CONTENTS

Contributors | ix

Preface | xv

KEVIN WAGNER

1 Introduction to Pneumatology at the Beginning of the Third Millennium | 1
PETER JOHN MCGREGOR

2 The Work of Pneuma in the Emptiness of Golgotha | 20
NIGEL ZIMMERMANN

3 Hope and Expectation: Mary’s Co-operation with the Holy Spirit in the Church | 34
M. ISABELL NAUMANN, ISSM

4 “I Will Pour Out My Spirit upon All Flesh”: The Spirit in the Book of the Twelve as the Solution to Prophetic Conflict | 50
FR. ROBERT KRISHNA, OP

5 Tertullian and the New Prophecy: A Test-Case for the Contemporary Quest for Openness to the Spirit | 66
ADAM G. COOPER

6 Prophecy and Oneirology in the Early Latin Patristic Corpus | 81
REV. DR. JOSEPH HAMILTON

7 The Spirit as Dove in Patristic Interpretations of the Canticle of Canticles | 104
KEVIN A. WAGNER
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>God’s Presence in History: The Work of Christ and the Spirit in St. Gregory of Nazianzus’ Fifth Theological Oration and Oration 38 On the Nativity</td>
<td>124</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>MARIO BAGHOS</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Christian Transformation: Bonaventure’s Appraisal of the Holy Spirit’s Work in Francis of Assisi</td>
<td>143</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>BENJAMIN LUKE JOHNSON, OFMCAP</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Aquinas, His Interpreters, and Spirit Christology</td>
<td>163</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>MATTHEW LEVERING</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>St. Thomas Aquinas on the Primacy of the Divine Teacher in the Person of the Holy Spirit: Some Pedagogical Implications</td>
<td>186</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>PAMELA VAN OPLOO</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>The Holy Spirit in Ignatian Spirituality</td>
<td>210</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>ROBIN KONING, SJ</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>The Holy Spirit and the Sacrament of Confirmation</td>
<td>228</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>PETER PELLICAAN</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>Confirmation and Transfiguration</td>
<td>247</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>JOSEPH VNUK, OP</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>Milestones in Pneumatology from Divinum Illud Munus to Dominum et Vivificantem</td>
<td>264</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>TRACEY ROWLAND</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>He Has Spoken through the Prophets</td>
<td>277</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>SR. SUSANNA EDMUNDS, OP</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>Servais Pinckaers and the New Law in the Spirit: A Pneumatological Approach to Morality</td>
<td>300</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>REV. DR. PASCAL M. CORBY, OFM CONV.</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>Procession of the Holy Spirit and Ecclesiology: Some Contemporary Perspectives</td>
<td>317</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>MARIUSZ BILINIEWICZ</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

VI
19  The Net and the Pneumatic Body of Christ  |  331
MATTHEW JOHN PAUL TAN

20  The “Age of the Spirit”: An Idea That Refuses to Die  |  344
DAVID PATRICK COLLITS
CONTRIBUTORS

Mario Baghos is an Academic Sessional at the University of Notre Dame (Sydney) and Adjunct Lecturer in Theology in the Faculty of Arts and Education at Charles Sturt University. From 2010–17 and 2020–22, he taught Patristics and Church History at St. Andrew's Greek Orthodox Theological College (Sydney College of Divinity). He has also lectured in the discipline of Studies in Religion at the University of Sydney and has published extensively in the disciplines of patristics and Byzantine studies. His most recent publication is entitled From the Ancient Near East to Christian Byzantium: Kings, Symbols, and Cities (Cambridge Scholars Publishing, 2021).

Mariusz Biliniewicz currently serves as Director of the Liturgy Office in the Archdiocese of Sydney. He has worked at the University of Notre Dame Australia as Senior Lecturer in Theology and Associate Dean of Research and Academic Development. He has studied and taught in Poland, Ireland and Australia and has spoken and published internationally on a number of theological topics. His interests include contemporary Catholic theology, liturgy, sacraments, Second Vatican Council, intersections between ecclesiology and moral theology, faith and reason and general systematic theology.

David Collits is an independent scholar and Sydney-based lawyer. His undergraduate degrees were in history and law. He was awarded a PhD in theology from the University of Notre Dame, Australia. His thesis explored the hope-history debate in fundamental theology and the cleavage in contemporary theology between the Communio and Concilium schools. He has been on the personal staff of the Archbishop of Sydney, (Most Rev.) Anthony Fisher, OP, and has been Lecturer in Catholic Theology at the University of Notre Dame, Australia.

Adam Cooper is Associate Professor of Theology at Catholic Theological College and teaches in the departments of Systematic Theology and Church History. He has taught Greek at the University of Durham (NT), patristics
at the Melbourne Institute of Orthodox Christian Studies and Theological Anthropology, Historical Theology, and Moral Theology at John Paul II Institute for Marriage and Family.

**Paschal M. Corby** is a priest of the Order of Friars Minor Conventual. He is a Lecturer in Moral Theology at the University of Notre Dame, Australia (Sydney) and the University of Divinity/Catholic Theological College (Melbourne). With a background in Medicine, he has a particular interest in Bioethics. He is the author of *The Hope and Despair of Human Bioenhancement* (Pickwick, 2019).

**Sr. Susanna Edmunds, OP**, is currently the Dean of Studies at the Seminary of the Good Shepherd, Sydney. She has a degree in Education (Secondary) and has completed a range of other studies in philosophy and theology. Sr Susanna has recently submitted a Masters thesis in Biblical Theology at the University of Notre Dame, Australia.

**Joseph Hamilton** is a priest of the Catholic Archdiocese of Sydney and Associate Professor of Theology at the Pontifical University of St. Tomas (Angelicum) in Rome. He gained his license in Patristic Science from the Pontifical Institute Augustinianum and completed doctoral studies in Patristics at Christ Church, University of Oxford. His principal areas of research are patristic pneumatology, angelology, and the understanding of charismatic phenomena in the early Church.

**Robin Koning** is a Jesuit priest of the Australian Province and an Honorary Fellow of Australian Catholic University. He has taught systematic theology and philosophy at the United Faculty of Theology in the Melbourne College of Divinity. His main areas of research have been in the work of Bernard Lonergan and Robert Doran as well as inculturation and culture as a category in theology, grounded in his work in a remote Aboriginal community in the 1990s. In recent years his research has also turned to Ignatian spirituality. He currently serves as Provincial Assistant for Vocations for the Australian Jesuits and is much involved in young adult ministry. He offers spiritual direction and retreats as well as workshops on Ignatian prayer and the Rules for Discernment of Spirits.

**Robert Krishna, OP**, is a Dominican friar and Catholic priest. He has a BSc (Hons), and a PhD from Sydney University in History and Philosophy of Science, and a BTheol and MTheol from the University of Divinity. He is a member of the Dominican Province of the Assumption (Australia and New Zealand), and is currently studying for a License in Sacred Scripture at the Ecole Biblique in Jerusalem. He was ordained a priest in 2017, and has
served as the Catholic Chaplain at the University of Technology Sydney and Monash University (Clayton, Vic). His research interests include the Twelve Prophets, Biblical Intertextuality, and Christian and Jewish interpretation of the Scriptures in late antiquity.

**Benjamin Johnson, OFMCap,** is a Capuchin Franciscan of the Province of Australia. In 2022, he completed his doctorate at the Pontifical Lateran University in Rome on the relationship between the sacraments of the Eucharist and Marriage in the thought of Saint Bonaventure of Bagnoregio. His research interests include the relationship between Franciscan theology and Christian experience, and scholastic sacramental theology. Br. Ben lectures in sacramental theology at the University of Notre Dame, Australia.

**Matthew Levering** holds the James N. and Mary D. Perry Jr. Chair of Theology at Mundelein Seminary. He is the author or co-author of over thirty-five books and editor or co-editor of over twenty books. His most recent book, published with Cambridge University Press, is *Reconfiguring Thomistic Christology* (2023). Matthew is the director of the Center for Scriptural Exegesis, Philosophy, and Doctrine; past president (2021–22) of the Academy of Catholic Theology; and a longtime member of Evangelicals and Catholics Together. He serves as co-editor of two scholarly journals, *Nova et Vetera* and *International Journal of Systematic Theology.*

**Peter John McGregor** is a lecturer in Dogmatic Theology and Spiritual Theology at the Catholic Institute of Sydney and the University of Notre Dame Australia. He is the author of *Heart to Heart: The Spiritual Christology of Joseph Ratzinger,* and a co-editor of *Healing Fractures in Contemporary Theology* and the *Theology at the Beginning of the Third Millennium* series. He is also a contributor to the forthcoming *Cambridge Companion to Joseph Ratzinger* and the *Joseph Ratzinger Dictionary: Central Concepts.* His current research interests include the theology of Joseph Ratzinger, the relationship between theology and spirituality, theological anthropology, fundamental theology, postmodern theology, and missiology.

**M. Isabell Naumann, ISSM,** is the President of the Catholic Institute of Sydney (Ecclesiastical Faculty of Theology) and a Professor of Systematic Theology. She is a Member of the Secular Institute of the Schoenstatt Sisters of Mary (ISSM) where holds the position of provincial for Australia and the Philippines. For over ten years, she served as the Academic Dean of Studies at the Seminary of the Good Shepherd, Sydney and taught Systematic Theology at the Catholic Institute of Sydney. She is also an Adjunct Professor in Systematic Theology at the University of Notre Dame,
Sydney. She has served, and currently serves, on various national and international academic boards and councils, including two terms at the Pontifical Council for Culture. She has been a member of the International Theological Commission since 2021.

**Peter Pellicaan** currently serves as the Executive Director of Evangelisation Brisbane, an Agency of the Archdiocese of Brisbane. He is involved with the Archdiocesan Centre for Catholic Formation in Brisbane teaching courses on scripture and the sacraments. Peter completed his PhD in Theology at the University of Notre Dame Australia developing a theology of confirmation from the canon of scripture. Peter has been involved in leadership in the Church for over twenty years, is a Deacon and is married with five children.

**Tracey Rowland** holds the St. John Paul II Chair of Theology at the University of Notre Dame (Australia). Her civil doctorate (PhD) is from the Divinity School of the University of Cambridge and her pontifical doctorate (STD) is from the Lateran University in Rome. She was a member of the IXth International Theological Commission (2014–19) and is currently a member of the Pontifical Academy of the Social Sciences. Her most recent book is *Beyond Kant and Nietzsche: The Munich Defence of Christian Humanism* (Bloomsbury, 2021) and she is a co-editor of *Joseph Ratzinger in Dialogue with Philosophical Traditions* (Bloomsbury, 2024).

**Matthew John Paul Tan** is the Dean of Studies at Vianney College, the seminary of the Diocese of Wagga Wagga, and Adjunct Senior Lecturer in Theology at the University of Notre Dame Australia. He completed his Doctorate in Theology at the University of Notre Dame Australia, and did his License in Sacred Theology at the Pontifical University of St. Thomas Aquinas in Rome. He has published two books, *Justice, Unity and the Hidden Christ* (Pickwick, 2014) and *Redeeming Flesh: The Way of the Cross with Zombie Jesus* (Cascade, 2016).

**Pamela Van Oploo** is a Lecturer at the University of Notre Dame, Sydney who has a background in Earth and Environmental Science, having completed a Bachelor of Science and Mathematics (Hons) and a PhD in Science and Technology. She is currently completing a second PhD on the educational philosophy of St. Thomas Aquinas and the pedagogical implications of this as gleaned from his writings.

**Joseph Vnuk, OP**, is a Dominican friar whose theological motto is “taking every thought captive and rendering it obedient to Christ.” Joseph has an STL from Catholic Institute of Sydney and a doctorate from the University of Nottingham. His doctoral thesis focused on sacraments and grace
according to Thomas. Joseph has taught both in Papua New Guinea and at CTC Melbourne.

**Kevin Wagner** is the principal convener of the *Theology at the Beginning of the Third Millennium* conference series and co-editor of the eponymous book series. He is a Senior Lecturer in Theology at the University of Notre Dame, Australia, specializing in patristics, early Church history, and Scripture. Kevin was previously the Director of the Emmanuel School of Mission in Rome, a role he shared with his wife.

**Nigel Zimmermann** is Director of Catholic Mission and Identity at Melbourne Archdiocesan Catholic Schools (MACS). He is an Adjunct Lecturer with the Institute for Ethics & Society at the University of Notre Dame Australia and Senior Fellow with the PM Glynn Institute, Australian Catholic University. Nigel has authored numerous works in theology and bioethics including *Levinas and Theology* (Bloomsbury, 2013), *Facing the Other: John Paul II, Levinas, and the Body* (Cascade, 2015), and *The Great Grace: Receiving Vatican II Today* (T. & T. Clark, 2015).
PREFACE

Kevin Wagner

The Theology at the Beginning of the Third Millennium book series began with a chance encounter in 2015 between three lay theologians of the Emmanuel Community (la Communauté de l’Emmanuel), a Public Association of the Faithful. Members of the Emmanuel Community have a special devotion to Mary, and each prays a daily consecration to her. Inspired by the thought to place Mariology back on the radar of Australian theologians, the three conspired to organize a conference on the topic. The quality of the papers delivered meant it was an easy decision to publish the best of them in a monograph, entitled Mariology at the Beginning of the Third Millennium.

What began with a desire to give the theology of Mary a more prominent place in academia, has become a biannual conference series, as well as a series of books published by the good folks at Wipf and Stock. Thus far we have taken up the topics of ecclesiology, theological anthropology, and pneumatology. And it is this final topic that is the theme of this book.

As is usual in this series, we begin with a chapter detailing the status quaestionis of our theme. Here, Peter McGregor, one the “founding fathers” of the Third Millennium series, draws on both his extensive experience in the Catholic charismatic renewal and his theological prowess. McGregor presents a fascinating and useful account of the development of pneumatology from the rise of Pentecostalism in the nineteenth century and its early appropriation by Catholics, through the Catholic Charismatic Renewal of the 1960s, and up to the current time. His chapter concludes by raising two important points. First, he muses on the role of the Spirit in resolving the apparent conflict between history and ontology. Second and finally, Peter emphasizes the place of the gifts of the Spirit for theologizing.

Chapters 2–4 are explicitly scriptural contributions. Chapter 2 begins by asking the question “What was the Holy Spirit doing when Jesus died on the
Cross?” Drawing on patristic and contemporary witnesses, Zimmermann offers a compelling argument that the Spirit plays a cooperative role in the sacrifice of Jesus on the Cross.

Next, in chapter 3, Naumann shows how Mary cooperated with the Holy Spirit at the time of Pentecost and continues to do so today through her mediatory role in the Church. Indeed, the Mother of God is presented to the readers as a model both for the individual Christian and for the Church; the homo viator (person on pilgrimage) and the homo spiritualis (the spiritual person).

Chapter 4 examines the corpus of the minor prophets—the Book of the Twelve—in order to show how God’s Spirit disrupts the life of the prophet such that he or she is inspired to act as a conduit for God’s salvific purpose. But this work of the Spirit continues, Krishna shows, in the time of Christ and is evidenced in Luke-Acts. This observation from the Dominican, should give us hope that the Spirit can continue to disrupt prophets for our own time!

Chapters 5–8 may be classified as works of patristic pneumatology. Cooper leads the way by wrestling with the complicated character of Tertullian and his flirtations with the New Prophecy. This chapter is particularly insightful and helpful for the light it shines on the different ways Tertullian and modern liberals understand openness to the Spirit.

Hamilton, in chapter 6, also offers an account of the Spirit’s role in prophecy, but here the focus is on the particular phenomena of dreams and visions. Focusing on early Latin texts, Hamilton offers a scholarly survey of the oneiric experiences of Tertullian, Perpetua, and Cyprian. In the process, Hamilton demonstrates admirably that the Spirit is manifested to some through such experiences.

My own chapter, chapter 7, is motivated by the desire to deepen our reflections on the image of the Holy Spirit as dove. It strikes me that the dove is too often presented in modern catechesis in a cursory or banal way, such that the Spirit—who the dove usually represents—is emasculated and stripped of all Its divinity. Here I seek to remedy this somewhat by drawing on the collective genius of Origen and Gregory of Nyssa as expressed in their commentaries on the Canticle. I can only hope that the enjoyment I had in reading these works deeply can stimulate further reflection on the Holy Spirit as dove.

Chapter 8 draws on two orations of St. Gregory Nazianzen in order to demonstrate that history is pneumatological; that is, it is guided by the Holy Spirit. In this chapter, Baghos argues convincingly for a view of history that takes seriously protology and teleology. This alone makes his chapter
an important read for those disheartened by the state of many modern approaches to historiography.

Chapters 9–12 take us on a journey through the Middle Ages through to the Council of Trent. Johnson gets us started with his account of Bonaventure’s insights on mystical experience, the theological virtues, and the role of the Spirit in leading the soul towards union with God. Here we are introduced to the Seraphic Doctor’s reflections on the crucified One and on the work of the Spirit in St. Francis, that great founder of Bonaventure’s order who sought so admirably to imitate Him. What we discover in Johnson’s account of Bonaventure is a rugged and attractive spirituality that places poverty and humility at the center of the Christian’s life. And this is all for the sake of better imitating the incarnate and crucified One.

Chapter 10 is a masterful piece of Catholic theology from a veritable master of Catholic theology, Matthew Levering. Contra to some who over-emphasize the division between Logos and Spirit Christologies, Levering argues that a true Logos Christology is also a Spirit Christology “because the Word . . . is never present without the Spirit.” Levering takes the reader through a spirited engagement with Aquinas’ Trinitarian Christology and some of Thomas’ more important interpreters, including Suarez, Garrigou-Lagrange, and Legge. This chapter is a fine demonstration of a theological method that preferences holding truths in tension over the easier path of falling to one or other side of an argument.

Van Oploo, in chapter 11, draws on Aquinas for a different end. Her primary objective is to show that God is our Primary teacher and that the Father, Son, and Spirit each have their own particular pedagogies. Having established this, van Oploo goes on to show that the Spirit and the Spirit’s gifts are key in the classroom. Her insights, drawn both from her studies and classroom experience, are invaluable in an age where education is focused more on techne than eudaimonia.

Chapter 12 focuses attention on the apparent “paucity of explicit references to the Spirit” in the Spiritual Exercises of St. Ignatius of Loyola. Koning begins his chapter by showing that Ignatius was strongly influenced by his historical context (particularly the rise of the Alumbrados) and by his various encounters with the Inquisition. This context alone goes some way to understanding why Ignatius steers clear of explicit references to the Spirit in the Exercises. Koning then introduces the reader to the pneumatology of the founding documents of the Society of Jesus and of the Exercises. The end result of his efforts is a convincing argument that the Exercises is replete with allusions to the Spirit and that the Exercises stand in continuity with Ignatius’ other writings.
Chapters 13 and 14 should be required reading for all who teach the sacrament of confirmation or prepare people for its reception. In the first of these chapters, Pellicaan sets himself the task of answering the question “What is the role of the Holy Spirit in confirmation?” Drawing first on the Scriptures and then on the documents of the Church—principally the *Catechism*—Pellicaan shows that confirmation is ordered to the mission of building up the Church.

The Dominican, Joseph Vnuk, takes a different, though compatible, approach in seeking to show that confirmation is concerned with transformation; a transformation rooted in the unity of Christ and the Spirit. Taking the reader on a journey through the scriptures, patristic literature, and the writings of the scholastics, Vnuk demonstrates that baptism and confirmation are indeed both Christic and pneumatological, and that this realization should impact our pastoral approach to preparing confirmands.

The remaining chapters of this book deal with a somewhat eclectic array of topics. Chapter 15 offers an overview of key milestones in pneumatology between the publications of *Divinum Illud Munus* (1897) and *Dominum et vivificantem* (1986). Rowland presents a survey of a veritable who’s who of Catholic theologians—Rahner, Congar, La Soujeole, Bouyer, Balthasar, Daniélou, Guillou, John Paul II—and their work in the field of pneumatology. In the process, Rowland not only affirms Vnuk’s assumption that pneumatology and Christology are inseparable, she reminds us of “the importance of understanding the bridges or links between pneumatology and ecclesiology and pneumatology and theological anthropology.”

The topic of scriptural inspiration takes center stage in Chapter Sixteen. Here, Edmunds brings Thomism and the Pontifical Biblical Commission’s *The Inspiration and Truth of Sacred Scripture* into dialogue in order to better understand revelation, inspiration, and prophecy, and the relationships between these. Edmunds is particularly concerned with showing how the prophet is a model for understanding the writer of the scriptures. Her efforts in the chapter reveal that an inadequate understanding of prophecy can leave “the historicity of biblical events in ambiguity.” What we discover in Edmunds’ work is a key to re-affirming the veracity of the doctrine of scriptural inerrancy. Needless to say, this is of great importance today.

Chapter 17, written by the Conventual Franciscan Paschal Corby, places the Holy Spirit at the center of a Christian moral theology. Corby expounds on the work of Servais Pinckaers, who proposed a revolution in moral theology away from a morality of obligation and towards a morality of “self-fulfilment in beatitude.” This self-fulfilment is not an exercise in self-will devoid of grace. Rather, Corby shows, it is attained through the
welcoming of the Holy Spirit into the heart of believer such that the New
Law inscribed thereon conforms the believer to the living God.

Biliniewicz, in chapter 18, dives into the age-old controversy concerning
the procession of the Holy Spirit. Rather than engaging with the standard
debates over the inclusion or exclusion of the *filioque* in the Creed, or how
one ought to interpret the Second Ecumenical Council of Constantinople,
or other such matters, Biliniewicz prefers to simply pose the question, does
this doctrine influence ecclesiology? What we find in Biliniewicz’s chapter is
not so much a downplaying of the classic problems, but rather, a call to turn
our attention to fundamental theology and to theological method. It is by
doing this, the author suggests, that we may find more points of agreement
with theologians across the divide, and thus, I would suggest, more hope of
a way forward in ecumenical dialogue.

It is a truism to say that the writers of the scriptures could not have
imagined cyberspace, nor could they have envisioned online liturgical
participation! This being so, what can Jerusalem have to say about this
new Athens that exists in this virtual space? In chapter 19, Tan poses two
interrelated questions: “Is . . . encountering the person of Jesus Christ
attainable in a real way in cyberspace?” and “is there a proper dogmatic
basis on which we can justify an internet end-user having a real encounter
with the body of Jesus Christ on the net?” Through a strong engagement
with the work of Chiara Lubich and her concept of Christ abandoned, Tan
convincingly argues in the affirmative, though perhaps not in the way we
might expect!

The so-called Joachimite expectation that the Spirit will usher in a new
age in which the visual church is superseded by a spiritual one, is compelling
both for opponents of organized Christianity and for those enthralled by
utopianism. Our final chapter, by David Collits, brings Augustine's theology
of history into conversation with that of Joachim of Fiore—through the
interlocutor, Joseph Ratzinger—in order to demonstrate the “enduring
value of the Augustinian vision of history.” Augustine’s genius on this
point, expounded convincingly by Collits, is that it affirms the teleological
dimension of history and the salvific work of the Holy Spirit in and through
the Church.

It is the editors’ hope that this book will contribute to the discussion
on the place of the Holy Spirit in the theologate, in the sacramental and
liturgical life of the Church, and in the lives of individuals. We leave it to the
Spirit to determine the fruits you may each experience in partaking of this
product of our collective labors!
INTRODUCTION TO PNEUMATOLOGY AT THE BEGINNING OF THE THIRD MILLENNIUM

Peter John McGregor

In this first chapter I wish to present something a little different from what one would expect to find in an introduction to a specific theological subject. In its second half I will be looking at how Pneumatology has developed in the twentieth and twenty-first centuries, contrasting its character before the Second Vatican Council with what comes after the Council. This will be followed by an identification of eight quaestiones disputatae in contemporary Pneumatology. Finally, I will look at two pneumatological topics that are of particular interest to me. Yet I wish to begin this chapter with a more than cursory account of something different from Pneumatology as a theological topic. This is an account of the action of the Holy Spirit in the Church from the late nineteenth century until today, under the headings of (1) Pentecostalism, (2) Pope Leo XIII and Elena Guerra, and (3) the Catholic Charismatic Renewal. I will reveal the reason for this approach in due course.

PENTECOSTALISM

Let us look at the beginnings of a movement that has become very influential within contemporary Christianity, a movement called Pentecostalism.¹

¹. For an introduction to the history of Pentecostalism in the twentieth century, see Synan, Century of the Holy Spirit.
During the nineteenth century, radical evangelical revival movements began to appear in the United States of America and Great Britain, the most important of these being the Wesleyan Holiness movement. Within this radical evangelicalism, themes such as restorationism, premillennialism, faith healing, and greater attention to the person and work of the Holy Spirit emerged. Believing that the second coming of Christ was imminent, these Christians expected an end-time revival of apostolic power, spiritual gifts, and miracle working. As expectation grew, especially in the Great Britain, some Protestant ministers began to investigate reports of manifestations of charismata, believing that they would be signs that the return of Christ was imminent. For example, one Edward Irving, the pastor of a prestigious London Presbyterian church, travelled all the way to Scotland to investigate reports of miraculous healings and glossolalia. In 1831 he established the Catholic Apostolic Church, wherein speaking in tongues and prophesying were encouraged. About twenty-five years later, people such as the British Baptist minister C. H. Spurgeon and the British Methodist minister William Arthur, were preaching and writing about a coming new outpouring of the Holy Spirit. Some twenty years later, preachers in the USA such as Dwight L. Moody, R. A. Torrey, and A. B. Simpson, began to speak of an experience available to all Christians which would empower believers to evangelize the world. This experience was called “baptism in the Holy Spirit.”

Ultimately, no one person or group founded Pentecostalism. Instead, isolated Christian groups experienced charismatic phenomena such as divine healing and speaking in tongues. The Methodist holiness movement provided a theological explanation for what was happening to these Christians, and they adapted Wesleyan soteriology to accommodate their new understanding. As it happens, the Wesleyan understanding of salvation is very like the Catholic one. Hence the Pentecostal understanding of salvation and sanctification are often like the Catholic understanding.

An important figure in the emergence of Pentecostalism was Charles Fox Parham, an independent holiness evangelist who believed in divine healing. He was important for the emergence of Pentecostalism as a distinct Christian movement. In 1900, he started a school near Topeka, Kansas, which he named Bethel Bible School. There he taught that speaking in tongues was the scriptural evidence for the reception of the baptism with

5. For what follows about Parham and the Azuza Street Revival, see Owens, “Azuza Street Revival,” 39–68.
the Holy Spirit. On January 1, 1901, after a vigil service, the students at this school prayed for and apparently received the baptism with the Holy Spirit with the evidence of speaking in tongues. Later, Parham received this same experience as his students and began preaching about it in all his services. Parham taught that the baptism with the Holy Spirit was a third experience, after conversion and sanctification. Sanctification cleansed the believer, but Spirit baptism empowered for service.

At about the same time that Parham was spreading his doctrine, the Welsh Revival of 1904 to 1905 saw thousands of conversions and also exhibited speaking in tongues.6 In 1905, Parham moved to Houston, Texas, where he started a Bible training school. One of his students was William J. Seymour, a one-eyed black preacher. Seymour travelled to Los Angeles where his preaching sparked the three-year-long Azusa Street Revival, beginning in 1906. Worship at the racially integrated Azusa Mission featured an absence of any order of service. People preached and testified as moved by the Spirit, spoke and sung in tongues, and fell in the Spirit. The revival attracted both religious and secular media attention, and thousands of visitors flocked to the mission, carrying the experience back to their home churches. Crowds of blacks and whites worshiped together at the Mission. This set the tone for much of the early Pentecostal movement. From 1906 to 1924, Pentecostals defied social, cultural, and political norms vis-à-vis racial segregation. As the Azusa participants carried their new experience back to their own churches, sometimes whole churches were converted to the Pentecostal acceptance of charismata. But more often Pentecostals were forced to establish new religious communities when their experience was rejected by their own churches. It was not until 1960 that the use of charismatic gifts à la Pentecostalism began to be accepted in many Protestant Churches.

From such small beginnings, by 2011, there were about 280 million Pentecostal Christians worldwide, making up nearly 13 percent of the Christian population. Other charismatic Christians, including Catholics, numbered some 305 million, or about 14 percent of the Christian population, making an overall total of 27 percent.

POPE LEO XIII AND ELENA GUERRA

As the Pentecostal movement was coalescing during the nineteenth century, what was happening in the Catholic Church? Certainly, there was no equivalent expectation of an imminent return of Christ. However,
theologically, there was some movement vis-à-vis Pneumatology. Most notable is the work of two theologians, Johann Adam Möhler and Matthias Scheeben. In 1825, Möhler published his *Unity in the Church, or, the Principle of Catholicism*. Therein he stressed that the Church was more like an organism than a juridical society, and that the principle of this organism’s life was the Holy Spirit.\(^7\) In the second half of the century, Scheeben brought a renewed focus to the role of the Holy Spirit in the *theosis* (divinization, deification) of the Christian.\(^8\) However, these theological advances were not accompanied by the kind of spiritual activity witnessed in Protestantism.

The next stage in the story of the manifest activity of the Holy Spirit in the Catholic Church begins at the end of the nineteenth century. Between 1895 and 1903 a religious sister called Elena Guerra wrote twelve confidential letters to Pope Leo XIII. The purpose of these letters was to urge the pope to renew the Church through a return to the Holy Spirit. In one of these she wrote:

Pentecost is not over. In fact, it is continually going on in every time and in every place, because the Holy Spirit desired to give himself to all men, and all who want him can always receive him, so we do not have to envy the apostles and the first believers; we only have to dispose ourselves like them to receive him well, and He will come to us as he did to them. . . . The mystery of Pentecost is a permanent mystery. The Spirit continues to come to all souls who truly desire Him. . . . If they only want Him . . . if they only invoke Him . . . if they only prepare a place for Him in their hearts. . . . Who is hungry enough? Who is thirsty enough? Who is humble enough? Who is zealous enough? . . . It is necessary that we return to the Holy Spirit so that the Holy Spirit may return to us.\(^9\)

Leo XIII took these letters seriously, so seriously that he wrote three documents in response to them. After the first letter he published *Provida Matris Caritate* in 1895, in which he asked the entire Church to celebrate a solemn novena to the Holy Spirit each year between the feasts of the Ascension and Pentecost. After the third letter, he wrote the encyclical *Divinum Illud Munus* in 1897 on the doctrine of the Holy Spirit. Following the ninth letter the pope wrote a letter to the bishops, *Ad Fovendum in Christiano Populo* in

---


1902, reminding them of the obligation to make the novena annually.\textsuperscript{10} Also, in this ninth letter to Pope Leo XIII, written on October 15, 1900, Elena begged the pope to exhort all Catholics to pray for the new century and to place it under the sign of the Holy Spirit. She wrote, “Most Holy Father, I humbly present with confidence to your Holiness that the new century may begin with the hymn \textit{Veni Creator Spiritus} to be sung at the beginning of the Mass of the first day of the year.”\textsuperscript{11} As a result of this request, the pope intoned the \textit{Veni Creator Spiritus} in the name of the whole Church, on January 1, 1901, the same day that Parham’s students experienced their “baptism in the Holy Spirit.”

THE CATHOLIC CHARISMATIC RENEWAL

I will now look at the beginnings of what is called the Catholic Charismatic Renewal. In a homily on Pentecost Sunday in 1959, Pope John XXIII expressed his desire that the upcoming ecumenical council would convene like a new Pentecost. On September 23rd of that same year, he prayed for the council with the words, “Renew your wonders in this our day as by a new Pentecost.” On October 11, 1962, the Second Vatican Council opened with the praying of the \textit{Veni Creator Spiritus}. But it was not until February 1967 that there was any public manifestation of a dramatic answer to this prayer. I say “public” deliberately, for we do not know what private manifestations may have been occurring. I remember an Australian Marist priest telling me that as a young seminarian in Rome at the time of Vatican II he had privately and spontaneously experienced something that he identified as a “baptism in the Holy Spirit,” which included praying in tongues.

In 1967, David Mangan was a graduate student at Duquesne University in Pittsburgh. He belonged to the Chi Rho society, a group of Catholic students who met before classes to pray and study Scripture. In February of that year, they went away together on retreat at The Ark and The Dove retreat center. Mangan recounts that, “We were given a little paperback book called \textit{The Cross and the Switchblade} by David Wilkerson, who was a Pentecostal pastor who worked with drug addicts and, in miraculous ways, brought them to healing and salvation merely through prayer.”\textsuperscript{12} Another student, Patti Mansfield, recalls,

\textsuperscript{10} This letter is not available on the official Vatican website.
\textsuperscript{11} Mansfield, “Blessed Elena Guerra,” para. 10.
\textsuperscript{12} Wilcox, “Exploring the Roots,” para. 25. For more on the beginning of the Catholic Charismatic Renewal, see Mansfield, \textit{As by a New Pentecost}.
I kept saying, “This is happening today? Well, why aren’t these things happening in my life?” I thought, “Here I am, I’m baptized, I’m confirmed, I’ve received the Holy Spirit. Why isn’t the Holy Spirit doing this in my life?” And, we were told to do three things, first, pray with expectant faith. The next thing was to take the Bible and read the first four chapters of the Acts of the Apostles. To tell you how ignorant I was of Scripture, I had no idea where to find the Acts of the Apostles. I figured it was in the New Testament because I knew the Apostles were in the time of Jesus.\textsuperscript{13}

 Returning to Mangan’s account,

The students opened each session of the retreat with the hymn “\textit{Veni Creator Spiritus}”—“Come, Holy Spirit”—the same hymn Pope Leo invoked over the 20th century. One of the speakers taught from Jesus’ words in Acts 1:8, “but you will receive power when the Holy Spirit comes upon you.” The word for power is the same Greek word where we, in English, would get the word dynamite. And He (Jesus) likened the coming of the Holy Spirit to dynamite, And, that struck me extremely deeply, because I’d been raised a good Catholic boy, and I was with the Lord. He hadn’t abandoned me at all and I knew that’s where I belonged and where I was but, I don’t think I could have used the word “dynamite” as an adjective to describe my spiritual life at that point.\textsuperscript{14}

David joined his small group session and asked a question: “Where is the dynamite?” He later recorded in his notes his desire to hear someone speak in tongues. “And then I put a dash. And I put ‘me!’ with an exclamation point.”\textsuperscript{15} David went off by himself to reflect on the teaching. He recalls,

When I opened the door and walked into the chapel, the presence of God was so powerful, I could hardly move. The only way I could say this, “I was lost in Christ, and happy to be so.” And, I forgot—completely forgot—about all my pushing to say, “Where’s the dynamite? Where’s the dynamite?” And that’s exactly what it felt like. It felt like little explosions in my body were going off as part of this whole experience. I don’t even know how to describe it beyond that. So, I started opening my

\textsuperscript{13} Wilcox, “Exploring the Roots,” para. 26.

\textsuperscript{14} Wilcox, “Exploring the Roots,” para. 27–28.

\textsuperscript{15} Wilcox, “Exploring the Roots,” 29.
mouth to thank God for what he had done, and I started praying in another language.¹⁶

Later Patti joined David in the chapel. She remembers,

I began to tremble. I remember thinking, “But God is here. And he's holy, and I'm not holy.” And so, just kneeling there in the quiet of my heart . . . I said, “Father, I give my life to you. Whatever you ask, I accept it.” I was lying there prostrate, and I felt immersed in the love of God. I felt like I was swimming in the mercy of God. I remember thinking, just [whispering] to Him, “Stay, stay, stay.”¹⁷

Other students were drawn into the chapel. Mansfield recalls,

“Some people were laughing for joy, others were weeping for joy. Some said they felt like they wanted to praise God, but they didn’t know if it was going to come out in English. We were there and just in awe of the sovereign God.” Mangan remembers, “Everything changed at that point . . . Now, I didn’t spot it all right away, but I mean everything was different, as it turned out—after this happened to me.”¹⁸

Please note that the experiences recounted above are not just about the reception and exercise of charismatic gifts, but also about experiences of God himself: his presence, his love, his mercy, and his holiness. As of 2013, this Catholic charismatic renewal, which began in 1967, was estimated to have affected over 160 million Catholics, mostly in third world countries.

CATHOLIC PNEUMATOLOGY PRIOR TO VATICAN II

Now, why am I talking about all this in an introductory chapter on the theology of the Holy Spirit at the beginning of the third millennium? It may be interesting, even inspiring, but what does it have to do with Pneumatology today? It is because I want to contrast the apparent work of the Holy Spirit in the lives of so many Christians in the twentieth century with the relative paucity of theological reflection on the Holy Spirit, at least for much of that century. In Catholic circles prior to the Second Vatican Council there is very little. This situation does not begin to change until the time of the Council itself. Just a cursory glance at Catholic Pneumatology

in the six decades before the Council reveals almost no awareness of what could be called widespread and growing pneumatological phenomena. Perhaps this is because these phenomena were Protestant phenomena. When there was a Catholic response, it was usually along the lines of Ronald Knox’s *Enthusiasm*, published in 1950, where, in his chapter entitled “Some Vagaries of Modern Revivalism,” he gives the following opinion.

> We have seen Quaker and Camisard and Wesleyan so carried away in prayer as to behave like automata rather than human beings; we shall be more ready to believe it when we find the Irvingites speaking with tongues. . . . Perhaps the most striking thing about the claim to speak with tongues is its infrequency. All enthusiastic movements are fain to revive, in a more or less degree, the experience of Pentecost; a new outpouring of the Holy Spirit has taken place, and a chosen body of witnesses is there to attest it. What is more likely than that they should aspire to imitate Pentecost in this, its most characteristic manifestation? Accordingly, if you consult the works of reference, you will find a long litany, copied from one encyclopaedia into another, purporting to show that all the enthusiastic movements have in fact given rise to glossolaly.19

Regarding “enthusiasm” in the twentieth century, Knox says no more than, “In our own island [Britain], for the last century, revivalism has shown a law of diminishing returns; each new wave, as it recedes, registers less of a high-water mark—Moody and Sankey, Torrey and Alexander, Aimée Macpherson.”20 Of these, only the last was Pentecostal.

Typical of Catholic Pneumatology in this period is a 1937 work by Fr. Edward Leen of the Congregation of the Holy Spirit entitled *The Holy Ghost and his Work in Souls*. This book looks at the Holy Spirit as God’s loving kindness to his creatures, as divine love subsistent, the work of the Holy Spirit, the relation of the Holy Spirit to the Incarnation, the Holy Spirit as the Fount of Life and the Gift of God, the Mission of the Holy Spirit, the relation of the Holy Spirit to Baptism, the Holy Spirit as the Spirit of Adoption, the principles of supernatural growth, and the gifts, fruits, and beatitudes. The sources most frequently referred to in the footnotes are Sacred Scripture, Thomas Aquinas’ *Summa Theologica*, *Sentences*, and *Summa Contra Gentiles*, and Aristotle’s *Nicomachean Ethics*.

It is both necessary and important that we broaden and deepen our theological reflection upon the Holy Spirit. We should not be theologizing just

about what has happened in the past, but also about what is happening now. Pope Francis speaks of this in *Evangelii Gaudium* when he says, “Expressions of popular piety have much to teach us; for those who are capable of reading them, they are a *locus theologicus* which demands our attention, especially at a time when we are looking to the new evangelization.”

**CATHOLIC PNEUMATOLOGY AFTER VATICAN II**

However, even during Vatican II, things do start to get moving. One theologian who jumps right in is a German Council *peritus* named Heribert Mühlen. For Mühlen, his engagement with Pentecostalism and the Catholic Charismatic Renewal led to a broadening of his early speculative theology in a practical direction. For example, while he is quoted as saying that “The doctrine and person of the Holy Spirit is not one doctrine among others, but a fundamental doctrine and reality in the church,” he also states that “As I looked into the charismatic renewal I was amazed to see many of my theological observations of the Holy Spirit happening in the daily lives of people.”

Better known in the Anglosphere than Mühlen's theologizing about the Holy Spirit are the pneumatological writings of Yves Congar. His magisterial three volume work, entitled *I Believe in the Holy Spirit*, was published between 1979 and 1980. The first volume focused on the experience of


23. Vondrey, *Heribert Mühlen*, xv. Unfortunately, the source of this quotation is not clear in the accompanying footnote. It may be from the work quoted in the next footnote, *Kirche wächst von Innen*.

the Holy Spirit as recounted in the Sacred Scriptures and throughout the history of the Church. The second looked at how the Holy Spirit animates the Church and the individual believer, as well as giving an assessment of the Charismatic Renewal and Pentecostalism. The third investigated the Holy Spirit from the perspective of the development of the doctrine of the Holy Spirit in the Trinity and in the Sacraments. Here, particular attention was given to the issue of the *filioque*. In 1984 he published *The Word and the Spirit*, which looked specifically at the relationship between Pneumatology and Christology. Earlier than the Council, but not to be neglected, is his *Esquisses du Mystère de l’Eglise* (*Outline of the Mystery of the Church*), first published in 1941.

Other important theologians who take an interest in Pneumatology are Karl Rahner, Hans Urs von Balthasar, Louis Bouyer, and Walter Kasper. Published in English as *The Spirit and the Church* in 1979, this book of Rahner’s is composed of three earlier works, *Erfahrung des Geistes; Das Charismatische in der Kirche; Visionen und Prophezeiungen* (*Experience of the Spirit* from 1977, and *The Charismatic in the Church and Visions and Prophecies*, both published in 1962). One could say that Rahner, in these last two mentioned works, was ahead of his time, in that, as yet there was no widespread manifestation of visions, prophecies, or other extraordinary charisms in the Catholic Church. Von Balthasar’s more explicit work on the Holy Spirit is to be found in the third and fourth volumes of his five-volume *Explorations in Theology*. These are *Spiritus Creator* (1967) and *Pneuma and Institution* (1974). Yet he too seems to have been unconsciously ahead of his time, as in 1954 he published *Thomas und die Charismatic* (*Thomas and the Charismatics*). With Louis Bouyer the pneumatological *foci* are two, the Church and the Trinity. He addresses the first in his 1970 *The Church of God: Body of Christ and Temple of the Holy Spirit*. The second is addressed as one of three volumes on the Trinity, the third being *Le Consolateur: Esprit-Saint et Vie de Grace* (*The Consoler: Holy Spirit and Life of Grace*) in 1982. Finally, we have Walter Kasper’s 1976 *Kirche: Ort des Geistes* (*The Church: Place of the Spirit*).

Departing briefly from Catholic shores, we should not neglect the works of important Orthodox and Protestant theologians such as Sergius Bulgakov’s 1939 *The Comforter*, Paul Evdokimov’s 1969 *L’Esprit Saint dans la Tradition Orthodoxe* (*The Holy Spirit in the Orthodox Tradition*), James D. G. Dunn’s 1970 *Baptism in the Holy Spirit*, and Jürgen Moltmann’s 1975 *The Church in the Power of the Spirit*.

Besides the work of these top tier theologians, we should pay attention also to that of some lesser, albeit shining, lights. From France we have the contribution of three biblical theologians, François-Xavier Durrwell
with *The Holy Spirit of God: An Essay in Biblical Theology*, Ignace de la Potterie, with *The Christian Lives by the Spirit*, and Stanislaus Lyonnet, who, with de la Potterie, wrote *Life according to the Spirit: The Condition of the Christian*. From Italy we have the work of the sometime preacher to the Papal Household, Raniero Cantalamessa, with his two-volume *Sober Intoxication of the Spirit*, as well as *Life in Christ: A Spiritual Commentary on the Letter to the Romans, The Holy Spirit in the Life of Jesus*, and *Come, Creator Spirit*. And from Australia we have the work of a Professor Emeritus of the Catholic Institute of Sydney, David Coffey, with *The “Incarnation” of the Holy Spirit in Christ*, and *Grace: The Gift of the Holy Spirit*. We have liberation approaches to the Holy Spirit, such as Leonardo Boff’s *Come, Holy Spirit*, and Joseph Comblin’s *The Holy Spirit and Liberation*, feminist approaches such as Elizabeth Johnson’s *Women, Earth, and Creator Spirit*, ecological approaches such as Denis Edward’s *Breath of Life: A Theology of the Creator Spirit*, and something called Spirit Christology in the work of people like David Coffey, Ralph Del Colle, Myk Habets, Frank Macchia, and Piet Schoonenberg.  

Finally, we have the work of theologians in the USA who themselves became involved in the Catholic Charismatic Renewal, such as the biblical scholar George Montague, as well as the theologians Donald Gelpi and Kilian McDonnell.

I will not sail any further on this tack since, as the Finnish, sometime Pentecostal, now Lutheran theologian Velli-Matti Kärkkäinen wrote in 2010, “In recent years, one of the most exciting developments in theology has been an unprecedented interest in the Holy Spirit.”  

I think that anyone wanting a good introduction to this development could do worse than read the work of Kärkkäinen. As a very recent example of a renewed interest in the Holy Spirit, I refer the reader to an article published in the *Irish Theological Quarterly* on June 7, 2022, by John Stayne. It is entitled, “Post-Conciliar Developments in the Catholic Doctrine of Charisms: *Lumen Gentium* and *Iuvenescit Ecclesia* Compared.” As of the end of June 2023 it had over 550 views and downloads, an extraordinary amount of interest in such a short time.


Taking all these above-mentioned theologians together, we find the following foci: the Holy Spirit and experience, the charismatic gifts, conversion, biblical theology, Trinitarian theology, Christology, Ecclesiology, Grace, Theological Anthropology, Social Justice, Women, and Creation. We can see that, as with all theology, it is not possible to focus on Pneumatology in isolation from every other aspect of theology. To speak about the Holy Spirit means also speaking about the theology of Revelation and Inspiration, the Trinity, the Christ, the Church, the sacraments of the Church, the mission of the Church, the human person, grace, human morality, creation, eschatology, spiritual theology, the work of the Holy Spirit outside the Church, and so on.

It also means speaking of not just the “content” of theology, but the “method” of theology as well. What role does the Holy Spirit play in how we theologize? At the very beginning of his book Engaging the Doctrine of the Holy Spirit, Matthew Levering quotes Graham Tomlin, who says that “today we need not just a theology of the Holy Spirit, but theology done in the Holy Spirit.”

St. Paul tells us that we are to “live according to the Spirit” (Rom 8:2). Since theologizing is a part of living, this must mean that we are to theologize in accord with the Holy Spirit. Related to this need is a current division between what could be called spiritual or mystical theology on the one hand, and fundamental and dogmatic theology on the other. Various diagnoses have been given regarding the causes and chronology of this split, but many theologians indicate sometime in the Middle Ages, some placing it pre-Aquinas and Bonaventure, while others place it post. Thinking of this split as one that is gradually evolving can help to explain this divergence in opinion.

By way of a contemporary example, I am slowly working my way through the theology of Lieven Boeve, a postmodern Catholic theologian, who advocates what he calls a recontextualizing theology of interruption. Amongst the numerous deficiencies in this theology, one thing that strikes me is its thoroughly a-pneumatic character, both in method and content. Although Boeve occasionally mentions the Holy Spirit, he does not theologize about the Holy Spirit, nor does the Holy Spirit play any discernible role in how he theologizes.

30. See McGregor, “Theology and Spirituality.”
31. For example, see Boeve, Interrupting Tradition; Boeve, God Interrupts History; Boeve, Lyotard and Theology.
EIGHT DISPUTED QUESTIONS IN CONTEMPORARY PNEUMATOLOGY

I will now very briefly introduce some of the _quaestiones disputatae_ in contemporary Pneumatology. Some of these will be addressed in subsequent chapters of this book. I will not be mentioning some issues that are not so much matters of dispute as of development. Many such issues will also be covered in this volume.

My disputed questions are eight in number. They are:

1. How should the Holy Spirit be named? For example, can he be named as Love and Gift? This question is also related to how the Holy Spirit should be named in the Trinity. For example, is the triad Creator-Redeemer-Sanctifier a valid alternative to Father-Son-Holy Spirit?

2. Is Spirit Christology opposed to Logos Christology? This question draws us into the work of Catholic theologians such as Piet Schoonenberg, David Coffey, and Ralph Del Colle, as well Protestant theologians such as the Baptist Myk Habets, and the Pentecostal Frank Macchia.

3. Is there any solution to the Filioque controversy?

4. What role does the Holy Spirit play in _theosis_?

5. Are the missions of Christ and the Holy Spirit separable?

6. How is the Holy Spirit at work outside the visible temporal Church? These last two questions are especially related to the issue of the significance of non-Christian religions.

7. Is Confirmation a sacrament in search of a theology?

8. How does the Holy Spirit inspire people? This includes the question of how the Holy Spirit inspires the Holy Scriptures.

---

32. For example, see Levering, _Engaging the Doctrine of the Holy Spirit_, 51–71.

33. On this question, see the Dicastery for Promoting Christian Unity, _Greek and the Latin Traditions_.

34. For example, see Kanjamela, “_Redemptoris Missio_ and Mission in India,” 203; McGregor, “Universal Work of the Holy Spirit.”

35. For example, see Dupuis, _Toward a Christian Theology of Religious Pluralism_. 
TWO PERSONAL INTERESTS

Since I do not get to give my own more specific chapter, I beg your indulgence in allowing me to finish with two points that have become particularly interesting to me. The first is a brief reflection on how the Holy Spirit might help us overcome what Joseph Ratzinger has called the “fundamental crisis of our age,” which is “coming to an understanding of the mediation of history in the realm of ontology.” Is it possible that the Holy Spirit can help us overcome the apparent conflict between history and ontology? Ratzinger points out that while Christ has assumed human nature, the Holy Spirit is given to each person. From this I conclude that the Holy Spirit is able to make the ontological Christ present in us in the historical now by transforming an ontological presence of Christ into a relational abiding presence. The Holy Spirit is new each day, and makes Christ present, the same yesterday, today, and forever (cf. Heb 13:8).

Another way of saying this is that the Holy Spirit can make the historical Christ present in us. There is only one Christ, who is both ontological and historical. On this point, I would like to quote Hans Urs von Balthasar’s Theology of History. So von Balthasar writes,

This carving out of a section of history in order to make it relevant to the whole of history is a process involving several factors, all interconnected in their dependence upon the Holy Spirit, but nonetheless distinguishable. The first concerns the working of the Spirit upon the Incarnate Son himself. . . . A second factor is the working of the Spirit as he relates to Christ, thus transformed, to the historical Church of every age, which is expressed typically in the sacraments, and most fully in the Eucharist. A third completes this relation by creating the missions of the Church and individual as applications of the life of Christ to every Christian life and the whole life of the Church.

Of this passage Tracey Rowland says, “Prescriptively Balthasar observes that the task of making the historical existence of Christ the norm of every individual existence is the work of the Holy Spirit.”

The second point is a reflection on the seven gifts of the Holy Spirit. While these gifts were part of the standard fare of pre-Vatican II Pneumatology,

39. Rowland, Benedict XVI, 111.
after the Council they seem largely to have disappeared from the menu. Yet these gifts are not just important, but crucial for living a life in the Spirit, which includes theologizing in the Spirit. Any attempt to theologize without the gifts of wisdom, knowledge, and understanding will not get very far.\textsuperscript{40} This is because, as St. Francis de Sales tells us in his \textit{Treatise on the Love of God}, these gifts are the very means by which we love God. While it is true that knowledge inspires love, the gifts of the Holy Spirit remind us also that love inspires knowledge. I will let St. Francis have the final say.

Now, [these gifts] are not only inseparable from charity, but, all things well considered, and speaking precisely, they are the principal virtues, properties, and qualities of charity. For:

\textit{Wisdom} is in fact no other thing than the love which relishes, tastes, and experiences how sweet and delicious God is;

\textit{Understanding} is nothing else than love attentive to consider and penetrate the beauty of the truths of faith, to know thereby God in himself, and then descending from this to consider him in creatures;

\textit{Science or knowledge}, on the other hand, is but the same love, keeping us attentive to the knowledge of ourselves and creatures, to make us re-ascend to a more perfect knowledge of the service which we owe God;

\textit{Counsel} is also love, insomuch as it makes us careful, attentive, and wise in choosing the means proper to serve God holily;

\textit{Fortitude} is love encouraging and animating the heart, to execute that which counsel has determined should be done;

\textit{Piety} is the love which sweetens labor, and makes us, with good heart, with pleasure, and with a filial affection, employ ourselves in works which please God our Father;

And to conclude, \textit{Fear} is nothing but love insomuch as it makes us fly and avoid what is displeasing to the divine Majesty.\textsuperscript{41}

\textsuperscript{40} The classic theological expositions of the gifts are to be found in St. Bonaventure's \textit{Collations on the Seven Gifts of the Holy Spirit}; Aquinas, \textit{Summa Theologica}, I–II, q. 68; Denis the Carthusian, \textit{Gifts of the Holy Spirit}.

\textsuperscript{41} Francis de Sales, \textit{Treatise on the Love of God}, book 11, chap. 15; emphasis added.
BIBLIOGRAPHY


