

Magritte



ROUTLEDGE RESEARCH IN ART HISTORY

RENÉ MAGRITTE AND THE ART OF THINKING

LISA LIPINSKI



René Magritte and the Art of Thinking

For René Magritte, painting was a form of thinking. Through paintings of ordinary objects rendered with illusionism, Magritte probed the limits of our perception—what we see and cannot see, the nature of representation—as a philosophical system for presenting ideas, and explored perspective as a method of visual argumentation. This book makes the claim that Magritte’s painting is about vision and the act of viewing, of perception itself, and the process of how we see and experience things in the world, including paintings as things.

Lisa Lipinski is Assistant Professor of art history at The George Washington University, USA.

Cover credit: René Magritte, *La bonne aventure* (Fortune Telling), 1938 or 1939. Gouache on paper, 36 × 41.5 cm. Current whereabouts unknown.

Routledge Research in Art History

Routledge Research in Art History is our home for the latest scholarship in the field of art history. The series publishes research monographs and edited collections, covering areas including art history, theory, and visual culture. These high-level books focus on art and artists from around the world and from a multitude of time periods. By making these studies available to the worldwide academic community, the series aims to promote quality art history research.

Pop Art and Popular Music

Jukebox Modernism

Melissa Mednicov

Globalizing East European Art Histories

Past and Present

Edited by Beáta Hock and Anu Allas

Visual Typologies from the Early Modern to the Contemporary

Local Contexts and Global Practices

Edited by Tara Zanardi and Lynda Klich

Cultural Mobility in the Interwar Avant-Garde Art Network

Poland, Belgium and the Netherlands

Michał Wenderski

New Geographies of Abstract Art in Postwar Latin America

Edited Mariola V. Alvarez and Ana M. Franco

The Paragone in Nineteenth-Century Art

Sarah J. Lippert

René Magritte and the Art of Thinking

Lisa Lipinski

For a full list of titles in this series, please visit <https://www.routledge.com/Routledge-Research-in-Art-History/book-series/RRAH>

René Magritte and the Art of Thinking

Lisa Lipinski

First published 2019
by Routledge
52 Vanderbilt Avenue, New York, NY 10017

and by Routledge
2 Park Square, Milton Park, Abingdon, Oxon, Ox14 4RN

Routledge is an imprint of the Taylor & Francis Group, an informa business

© 2019 Taylor & Francis

The right of Lisa Lipinski to be identified as author of this work has been asserted by her in accordance with sections 77 and 78 of the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988.

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reprinted or reproduced or utilised in any form or by any electronic, mechanical, or other means, now known or hereafter invented, including photocopying and recording, or in any information storage or retrieval system, without permission in writing from the publishers.

Trademark notice: Product or corporate names may be trademarks or registered trademarks, and are used only for identification and explanation without intent to infringe.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Lipinski, Lisa, 1961– author.

Title: René Magritte and the art of thinking / Lisa Lipinski.

Description: New York : Routledge, 2019. |

Series: Routledge research in art history | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2018052681 | ISBN 9781138054271 (hardback : alk. paper) |

ISBN 9781315114149 (ebook : alk. paper)

Subjects: LCSH: Magritte, René, 1898–1967—Criticism and interpretation. | Visual perception.

Classification: LCC ND673.M35 L57 2019 | DDC 759.9493—dc23

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2018052681>

ISBN: 978-1-138-05427-1 (hbk)

ISBN: 978-1-315-11414-9 (ebk)

Typeset in Sabon
by codeMantra

To Christopher



Taylor & Francis

Taylor & Francis Group

<http://taylorandfrancis.com>

Contents

<i>List of Plates</i>	ix
<i>List of Figures</i>	xi
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xv
Introduction	1
1 Bringing Thought to Life	9
2 The Use of Speech in Painting	36
3 The Mystery of the Visible	61
4 Inspired Thought	85
5 Conclusion: Ends and Endings	115
<i>Selected Bibliography</i>	127
<i>Index</i>	135



Taylor & Francis

Taylor & Francis Group

<http://taylorandfrancis.com>

Plates

- Plate 1 *La condition humaine (The Human Condition)*, 1933. Oil on canvas, 100 × 81 cm. The National Gallery of Art, Washington, DC. Gift of the Collector's Committee. © 2017 C. Herscovici / Artists Rights Society (ARS), New York
- Plate 2 *La rencontre (The Encounter)*, 1926. Oil on canvas, 139.5 × 99 cm. Kunstsammlung Nordrhein-Westfalen, Düsseldorf. Banque d'Images, ADAGP/Art Resource, NY. © 2017 C. Herscovici / Artists Rights Society (ARS), New York
- Plate 3 *L'Assassin menacé (The Menaced Assassin)*, 1927. Oil on canvas, 152 × 195 cm. The Museum of Modern Art, New York. Kay Sage Tanguy Fund. Banque d'Images, ADAGP/Art Resource, NY © 2017 C. Herscovici / Artists Rights Society (ARS), New York
- Plate 4 *L'Alphabet des révélations (The Alphabet of Revelations)*, 1929. Oil on canvas, 54 × 73 cm. The Menil Collection, Houston. Banque d'Images, ADAGP/Art Resource, NY. © 2017 C. Herscovici / Artists Rights Society (ARS), New York
- Plate 5 *Les fenêtres de l'aube (The Windows of Dawn)*, 1928. Oil on canvas, 73 × 54 cm. Private collection, courtesy Venus, New York. © 2017 C. Herscovici / Artists Rights Society (ARS), New York
- Plate 6 *Le musée d'une nuit (One-Night Museum)*, 1927. Oil on canvas, 50 × 65 cm. Private collection, London. Banque d'Images, ADAGP/Art Resource, NY. © 2017 C. Herscovici / Artists Rights Society (ARS), New York
- Plate 7 *Représentation (Representation)*, 1937. Oil on canvas mounted on panel, 48.5 × 44 cm. Scottish National Gallery of Modern Art, Edinburgh. Banque d'Images, ADAGP/Art Resource, NY. © 2017 C. Herscovici / Artists Rights Society (ARS), New York
- Plate 8 *La moisson (The Harvest)*, 1943. Oil on canvas, 60 × 80 cm. Royal Museums of Fine Arts of Belgium, Brussels. Banque d'Images, ADAGP/Art Resource, NY. © 2017 C. Herscovici / Artists Rights Society (ARS), New York
- Plate 9 *Le mal de mer (Seasickness)*, 1948. Oil on canvas, 54 × 65 cm. Private collection. Banque d'Images, ADAGP/Art Resource, NY. © 2017 C. Herscovici / Artists Rights Society (ARS), New York

x *Plates*

- Plate 10 *Le stropiat (The Cripple)*, 1948. Oil on canvas mounted on panel. 59.5 × 49.5 cm. Musée national d'art moderne, Centre Georges Pompidou, Paris. Banque d'Images, ADAGP/Art Resource, NY. © 2017 C. Herscovici / Artists Rights Society (ARS), New York
- Plate 11 *Le blanc-seing (The Blank Signature)*, 1965. Oil on canvas, 81.3 × 65.1 cm. National Gallery of Art, Washington, DC. Collection of Mr. and Mrs. Paul Mellon. © 2017 C. Herscovici / Artists Rights Society (ARS), New York
- Plate 12 *Les valeurs personnelles (Personal Values)*, 1952. Oil on canvas, 80 × 100 cm. San Francisco Museum of Modern Art. Banque d'Images, ADAGP/Art Resource, NY. © 2017 C. Herscovici / Artists Rights Society (ARS), New York
- Plate 13 *Tentative de l'impossible (Attempting the Impossible)*, 1928. Oil on canvas, 116 × 81 cm. Toyota Municipal Museum of Art, Japan. Banque d'Images, ADAGP/Art Resource, NY. © 2017 C. Herscovici / Artists Rights Society (ARS), New York
- Plate 14 *La bonne aventure (Fortune Telling)*, 1938 or 1939. Gouache on paper, 36 × 41.5 cm. Current whereabouts unknown. Banque d'Images, ADAGP/Art Resource, NY © 2017 C. Herscovici / Artists Rights Society (ARS), New York

Figures

- 1.1 Giorgio de Chirico, *Le chant d'amour (The Song of Love)*, June–July 1914. Oil on canvas, 73 × 59.1 cm. The Museum of Modern Art. Nelson A. Rockefeller Bequest. Digital Image © The Museum of Modern Art/Licensed by SCALA/Art Resource, NY © 2017 C. Herscovici / Artists Rights Society (ARS), New York 12
- 1.2 *La fenêtre (The Window)*, 1925. Oil on canvas, 65 × 50 cm. Private collection. Banque d'Images, ADAGP/Art Resource, NY © 2017 C. Herscovici / Artists Rights Society (ARS), New York 13
- 1.3 *La traversée difficile (The Difficult Crossing)*, 1926. Oil on canvas, 80 × 65 cm. Private collection. Banque d'Images, ADAGP/Art Resource, NY. © 2017 C. Herscovici / Artists Rights Society (ARS), New York 18
- 1.4 *Nocturne*, 1925. Oil on canvas, 65 × 75 cm. The Menil Collection, Houston. Banque d'Images, ADAGP/Art Resource, NY. © 2017 C. Herscovici / Artists Rights Society (ARS), New York 18
- 1.5 *Le message à la terre (Message to Earth)*, 1926. Oil on canvas, 75 × 65 cm. Private collection. Banque d'Images, ADAGP/Art Resource, NY. © 2017 C. Herscovici / Artists Rights Society (ARS), New York 21
- 1.6 *Les muscles célestes (The Muscles of the Sky)*, 1927. Oil on canvas, 54 × 73 cm. Private collection. Banque d'Images, ADAGP/Art Resource, NY. © 2017 C. Herscovici / Artists Rights Society (ARS), New York 22
- 1.7 *L'espion (The Spy)*, 1928. Oil on canvas, 54 × 73 cm. Collection of Irma and Norman Braman, Miami Beach, Florida. Banque d'Images, ADAGP/Art Resource, NY. © 2017 C. Herscovici / Artists Rights Society (ARS), New York 26
- 1.8 *Le faux miroir (The False Mirror)*, 1929. Oil on canvas, 60 × 81.1 cm. The Museum of Modern Art, New York. Banque d'Images, ADAGP/Art Resource, NY. © 2017 C. Herscovici / Artists Rights Society (ARS), New York 28
- 1.9 *Le prince des objets (The Prince of Objects)*, 1927. Oil on canvas with collaged canvas, 50 × 65 cm. Galerie Vedovi, Brussels. Banque d'Images, ADAGP/Art Resource, NY. © 2017 C. Herscovici / Artists Rights Society (ARS), New York 29

xii *Figures*

- 1.10 *Découverte (Discovery)*, 1927. Oil on canvas, 65 × 50 cm. Royal Museums of Fine Arts of Belgium, Brussels. Banque d'Images, ADAGP/Art Resource, NY. © 2017 C. Herscovici / Artists Rights Society (ARS), New York 31
- 1.11 *Les jours gigantesques (The Titanic Days)*, 1928. Oil on canvas, 116 × 81 cm. Kunstsammlung Nordrhein-Westfalen, Düsseldorf. Banque d'Images, ADAGP/Art Resource, NY. © 2017 C. Herscovici / Artists Rights Society (ARS), New York 32
- 2.1 *La clef des songes (The Interpretation of Dreams)*, 1927. Oil on canvas, 38 × 55 cm. Pinakothek der Moderne, Bayerische Staatsgemäldesammlungen, Munich. Banque d'Images, ADAGP/Art Resource, NY. © 2017 C. Herscovici / Artists Rights Society (ARS), New York 36
- 2.2 Untitled drawing, 1927. Collaged paper and watercolor, 50.7 × 65.5 cm. Galerie Brusberg, Berlin. Banque d'Images, ADAGP/Art Resource, NY. © 2017 C. Herscovici / Artists Rights Society (ARS), New York 43
- 2.3 *La lumière magique (Magic Light)*, 1928. Oil on canvas, 54 × 73 cm. Private collection. Banque d'Images, ADAGP/Art Resource, NY. © 2017 C. Herscovici / Artists Rights Society (ARS), New York 44
- 2.4 *L'espoir rapide (Swift Hope)*, 1927. Oil on canvas, 50 × 65 cm. Private collection. Banque d'Images, ADAGP/Art Resource, NY. © 2017 C. Herscovici / Artists Rights Society (ARS), New York 46
- 2.5 *Le masque vide (The Empty Mask)*, 1928. Oil on canvas, 73 × 92 cm. Kunstsammlung Nordrhein-Westfalen, Düsseldorf. Achim Kukulies. Art Resource, NY © 2017 C. Herscovici / Artists Rights Society (ARS), New York 47
- 2.6 *La trahison des images (The Treachery of Images)*, 1929. Oil on canvas, 64.4 × 94 cm. Los Angeles County Museum of Art. Purchased with funds provided by the Mr. and Mrs. William Preston Harrison Collection. Digital Image © 2017 Museum Associates/LACMA. Licensed by Art Resource, NY © 2017 C. Herscovici / Artists Rights Society (ARS), New York 48
- 2.7 "Les mots et les images" ("Words and Images"), in *La Révolution surréaliste*, no. 12, December 1929. Banque d'Images, ADAGP/Art Resource, NY. © 2017 C. Herscovici / Artists Rights Society (ARS), New York 50
- 2.8 *Le paysage fantôme (The Phantom Landscape)*, 1928. Oil on canvas, 73 × 54 cm. Private collection. Banque d'Images, ADAGP/Art Resource, NY. © 2017 C. Herscovici / Artists Rights Society (ARS), New York 51
- 2.9 *L'usage de la parole (The Use of Speech)*, 1928. Oil on canvas, 54 × 73 cm. Private collection. Banque d'Images, ADAGP/Art Resource, NY. © 2017 C. Herscovici / Artists Rights Society (ARS), New York 52
- 2.10 *Les deux mystères (The Two Mysteries)*, 1966. Oil on canvas, 65 × 80 cm. Private collection. Banque d'Images, ADAGP/Art Resource, NY. © 2017 C. Herscovici / Artists Rights Society (ARS), New York 54

- 3.1 *Les six éléments (The Six Elements)*, 1929. Oil on canvas, 73 × 99.8 cm. Philadelphia Museum of Art. The Louise and Walter Arensberg Collection, 1950. Philadelphia Museum of Art/ Art Resource, NY © 2017 C. Herscovici / Artists Rights Society (ARS), New York 64
- 3.2 *Au seuil de la liberté (On the Threshold of Liberty)*, 1930. Oil on canvas, 114 × 146 cm. Museum Boymans-van Beuningen, Rotterdam. Banque d'Images, ADAGP/Art Resource, NY. © 2017 C. Herscovici / Artists Rights Society (ARS), New York 65
- 3.3 *L'évidence éternelle (The Eternally Obvious)*, 1930. Oil on five separately stretched and framed canvases mounted on acrylic sheet, 167.6 × 38.1 × 55.9 cm (installed). The Menil Collection, Houston. Photographer: Adam Baker. Courtesy The Menil Collection, Houston. © 2017 C. Herscovici / Artists Rights Society (ARS), New York 66
- 3.4 Photograph showing the first version of *La Représentation*, held by Irène Hamoir, rue Essegheem, Brussels, 1937 69
- 3.5 *Le saignée (Bloodletting)*, 1939. Gouache on paper, 37 × 43 cm. Museum Boymans-van Beuningen, Rotterdam. Banque d'Images, ADAGP/Art Resource, NY. © 2017 C. Herscovici / Artists Rights Society (ARS), New York 70
- 3.6 *La réponse imprevue (The Unexpected Answer)*, 1933. Oil on canvas, 81 × 54 cm. Royal Museums of Fine Arts of Belgium, Brussels. Banque d'Images, ADAGP/Art Resource, NY. © 2017 C. Herscovici / Artists Rights Society (ARS), New York 75
- 3.7 *La belle captive (The Beautiful Captive)*, 1931. Oil on canvas, 38 × 55 cm. Private collection. Banque d'Images, ADAGP/Art Resource, NY. © 2017 C. Herscovici / Artists Rights Society (ARS), New York 76
- 4.1 *Le séducteur (The Seducer)*, 1950. Oil on canvas, 48.2 × 58.4 cm. Virginia Museum of Fine Arts, Richmond. Gift of Mr. and Mrs. Paul Mellon. Photographer: Katherine Wetzel © Virginia Museum of Fine Arts. © 2017 C. Herscovici / Artists Rights Society (ARS), New York 95
- 4.2 *Les mémoires d'un saint (Memories of a Saint)*, 1960. Oil on canvas, 80 × 99.7 cm. The Menil Collection, Houston. Banque d'Images, ADAGP/Art Resource, NY. © 2017 C. Herscovici / Artists Rights Society (ARS), New York 97
- 4.3 *La cascade (The Waterfall)*, 1961. Oil on canvas, 81 × 100 cm. Private collection. Banque d'Images, ADAGP/Art Resource, NY. © 2017 C. Herscovici / Artists Rights Society (ARS), New York 98
- 4.4 *Lunette d'approche (The Telescope)*, 1963. Oil on canvas, 176.1 × 114.9 cm. The Menil Collection, Houston. Photographer: Paul Hester. Courtesy The Menil Collection, Houston. © 2017 C. Herscovici / Artists Rights Society (ARS), New York 101
- 4.5 *Le paysage de Baucis (Baucis's Landscape)*, 1966. Oil on canvas, 55.6 × 45.7 cm. The Menil Collection, Houston. Photographer: Paul Hester. Courtesy The Menil Collection, Houston. © 2017 C. Herscovici / Artists Rights Society (ARS), New York 102

- 4.6 *La corde sensible (The Heartstring)*, 1960. Oil on canvas, 114 × 146 cm. Private collection, Brussels. Banque d'Images, ADAGP/Art Resource, NY. © 2017 C. Herscovici / Artists Rights Society (ARS), New York 105
- 5.1 Photographer unknown, *Amour (Love)*, Paris, 1928. Gelatin silver print, 10.5 × 7 cm. Banque d'Images, ADAGP/Art Resource, NY. © 2017 C. Herscovici / Artists Rights Society (ARS), New York 117
- 5.2 *Dieu, le huitième jour (God, the Eighth Day)*, 1937. Gelatin silver print, 8.5 × 5.7 cm. Banque d'Images, ADAGP/Art Resource, NY. © 2017 C. Herscovici / Artists Rights Society (ARS), New York 118
- 5.3 *La clairvoyance (Clairvoyance)*, 1936. Oil on canvas, 54 × 65 cm. Private collection. Herscovici/Art Resource, NY. © 2017 C. Herscovici / Artists Rights Society (ARS), New York 119
- 5.4 *La lampe philosophique (The Philosopher's Lamp)*, 1936. Oil on canvas, 46 × 55 cm. Private collection. Banque d'Images, ADAGP/Art Resource, NY. © 2017 C. Herscovici / Artists Rights Society (ARS), New York 119
- 5.5 Marcel Broodthaers, *René Magritte*, 1967. Gelatin silver print, 29.5 × 21 cm. The Art Institute of Chicago. Gift of David C. and Sarajeon Ruttenberg. Banque d'Images, ADAGP/Art Resource, NY. © 2017 C. Herscovici / Artists Rights Society (ARS), New York 123

Diagram

- 1.1 Schematic diagram of Jacques Lacan's theory of the gaze from *The Four Fundamental Concepts of Psychoanalysis. The Seminar of Jacques Lacan, Book XI*, edited by Jacques-Alain Miller, translated by Alan Sheridan. New York: W. W. Norton, 1998. Redrawn by Christopher Klug 27

Acknowledgments

There are many people who have helped me with this project. I'd like to first express my gratitude to Isabella Vitti at Routledge for taking an interest in the project and for working with me to see it through the review process and acceptance for publication; to Anne Umland at the Museum of Modern Art, New York, whose exhibition *Magritte: The Mystery of the Ordinary* inspired me to undertake it; and to Charly Herscovici, for protecting Magritte's oeuvre and advancing knowledge of his work through exhibitions and publications.

I wish to thank Phyllis Rosenzweig for reading early drafts of the book and offering insightful comments and feedback. Jody Graf at Luxembourg and Dayan helped me secure permission to reproduce a work from a private collection. Research support was extended by librarians and staff members at a number of institutions: Archives et Musée de la Littérature Brussels, Belgium; Barbara Diener and Katja Rivera, The Art Institute of Chicago; Shira Eller, George Washington University, Washington, DC; John Tain, Getty Research Institute, Los Angeles, CA; The National Gallery of Art, Washington, DC; Frederick Leen, Royal Museums of Fine Arts of Belgium, Brussels; and the Education Department, San Francisco Museum of Modern Art. In Brussels, Marcel Mariën shared his archive of Magritte materials, his books, and his memories of the Belgian surrealist activities. Maria Gilissen introduced me to the art and films of Marcel Broodthaers.

This book would not have been possible without the support of the Department of Art and Art History at the University of Texas, Austin. Richard Shiff supervised my dissertation on the art of René Magritte. Michael Charlesworth, John Clarke, Ronald W. Greene, and Linda Henderson served on the dissertation committee.

Colleagues and friends I'd like to thank for their help include Lisa Passaglia Bauman, Lisa Blas, Betty Caldwell, Thierry de Duve, Katie Robinson Edwards, Gillian Elliott, Beth Gainer, Cheryl Hartup, Nora Heiman, Selila Honig, Natalia Lonchyna, Susan Macey, Kim O'Connell, Sarah Plumb, Paul Reuther, Mysoon Rizk, and Karen Schneider.

I wish to offer a special appreciation to Alexander Dumbadze, Philip Jacks, and my colleagues in the Art History Program at the Corcoran School of the Arts and Design at George Washington University. To my student Madeline Henkin for drawing my attention to the art history scholarship of Isabelle Graw. The project was supported financially through research grants from the Art History Program and a subvention from the Columbian College of Arts and Sciences, also at George Washington University, which generously allowed for the defrayal of illustration costs.

xvi *Acknowledgments*

A very special thanks goes to Lucy Flint for her wonderful editing of the text. The book would not have the shape and clarity it does without her assistance.

Finally, I would like to thank my parents, especially my mother, who shared my research adventures in Belgium and would have been extremely happy to see this book completed. I dedicate this book to Christopher Klug, for his steadfast love and encouragement.