

VISUAL CULTURE IN EARLY MODERNITY

ROUTLEDGE

Federico Barocci

Inspiration and Innovation in Early Modern Italy



EDITED BY

*Judith W. Mann,
Saint Louis Art Museum*

An **Ashgate** Book

Federico Barocci

Reviewers of a recent exhibition termed Federico Barocci (ca. 1533–1612), ‘the greatest artist you’ve never heard of’. One of the first original iconographers of the Counter Reformation, Barocci was a remarkably inventive religious painter and draftsman, and the first Italian artist to incorporate extensive color into his drawings. The purpose of this volume is to offer new insights into Barocci’s work and to accord this artist, the dates of whose career fall between the traditional Renaissance and Baroque periods, the critical attention he deserves. Employing a range of methodologies, the essays include new ideas on Barocci’s masterpiece, the *Entombment of Christ*; fresh thinking about his use of color in his drawings and innovative design methods; insights into his approach to the nude; revelations on a key early patron; a consideration of the reasons behind some of his most original iconography; an analysis of his unusual approach to the marketing of his pictures; an exploration of some little-known aspects of his early production, such as his reliance on Italian majolica and contemporary sculpture in developing his compositions; and an examination of a key Barocci document, the post mortem inventory of his studio. A translated transcription of the inventory is included as an appendix.

Judith W. Mann is Curator of European Art to 1800 at the Saint Louis Art Museum, USA.

Visual Culture in Early Modernity
Series Editor: Kelley Di Dio, University of Vermont

A forum for the critical inquiry of the visual arts in the early modern world, *Visual Culture in Early Modernity* promotes new models of inquiry and new narratives of early modern art and its history. The range of topics covered in this series includes, but is not limited to, painting, sculpture and architecture as well as material objects, such as domestic furnishings, religious and/or ritual accessories, costume, scientific/medical apparatus, erotica, ephemera and printed matter.

Sebastiano del Piombo and the World of Spanish Rome

Piers Baker-Bates

Early Modern Merchants as Collectors

Edited by Christina M. Anderson

Visual Culture and Mathematics in the Early Modern Period

Edited by Ingrid Alexander-Skipnes

Knowledge and Discernment in the Early Modern Arts

Edited by Sven Dupré, Christine Göttler

Renaissance Porticoes and Painted Pergolas

Nature and Culture in Early Modern Italy

Natsumi Nonaka

Federico Barocci

Inspiration and Innovation in Early Modern Italy

Edited by Judith W. Mann

The Realism of Piero della Francesca

Joost Keizer

Thresholds, Boundaries and Liminality in Netherlandish Art (1385–1550)

Lynn F. Jacobs

Images of Sex and Desire in Renaissance Art and Culture

Edited by Angeliki Pollali and Berthold Hub

<https://www.routledge.com/Visual-Culture-in-Early-Modernity/book-series/ASHSER2107>

Federico Barocci

Inspiration and Innovation
in Early Modern Italy

Edited by Judith W. Mann

First published 2018
by Routledge
2 Park Square, Milton Park, Abingdon, Oxon OX14 4RN

and by Routledge
711 Third Avenue, New York, NY 10017

Routledge is an imprint of the Taylor & Francis Group, an informa business

© 2018 The Saint Louis Art Museum

The right of The Saint Louis Art Museum to be identified as the author of the editorial material, and of the authors for their individual chapters, has been asserted in accordance with sections 77 and 78 of the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988.

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reprinted or reproduced or utilised in any form or by any electronic, mechanical, or other means, now known or hereafter invented, including photocopying and recording, or in any information storage or retrieval system, without permission in writing from the publishers.

Trademark notice: Product or corporate names may be trademarks or registered trademarks, and are used only for identification and explanation without intent to infringe.

British Library Cataloguing-in-Publication Data

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

A catalog record for this book has been requested

ISBN: 978-1-4724-4960-3 (hbk)

ISBN: 978-1-315-11084-4 (ebk)

Typeset in Sabon
by codeMantra

Contents

<i>List of illustrations</i>	vii
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	xvi
<i>Note to readers</i>	xviii
1 Introduction	1
New insights into Federico Barocci's Senigallia <i>Entombment</i> and suggestions on his late workshop practice	
BABETTE BOHN AND JUDITH W. MANN	
2 From altar to hearth	19
Barocci and the Brancaloni of Piobbico	
CAROL PLAZZOTTA	
3 Just what is it that makes Barocci's painting so different, so appealing?	33
CLAUDIO PIZZORUSSO	
4 Barocci and the legacy of the artistic tradition of his homeland	46
ALESSANDRA GIANNOTTI	
5 Federico Barocci and the corpus of High Renaissance art	63
STUART LINGO	
6 "Though this be madness, yet there is method in it"	
Barocci's design process	89
BABETTE BOHN	
7 Drawing the Virgin	112
Barocci's doctrine of Mary	
JUDITH W. MANN	
8 "God knows when he'll finish"	138
Barocci and the art market	
RICHARD E. SPEAR	

vi	<i>Contents</i>	
9	The tip of the iceberg	154
	Barocci's postmortem inventory and the survival of Renaissance drawings	
	DAVID EKSERDJIAN	
	Appendix I	174
	Barocci's "Studio"	
	<i>Bibliography</i>	179
	<i>Index</i>	189

Illustrations

Figures

Note: Unless otherwise specified, all works are by Federico Barocci.

- | | | |
|-----|---|----|
| 1.1 | <i>Institution of the Eucharist</i> , 1603–1609, oil on canvas, 290 × 177 cm, Aldobrandini Chapel, Santa Maria sopra Minerva, Rome | 5 |
| 1.2 | <i>Lamentation</i> , 1600–12, oil on canvas, 410 × 288 cm, Biblioteca Comunale dell'Archiginnasio, Bologna, inv. P 673 | 6 |
| 1.3 | <i>Assumption of the Virgin</i> , ca. 1603–12, oil on canvas, 259 × 190 cm, Galleria Nazionale delle Marche, Urbino, inv. 1990 D 83 | 8 |
| 1.4 | <i>Cartoncino per il chiaroscuro</i> , black chalk and oil on oiled paper, incised and laid down, made up at the bottom and on the left, 47.7 × 35.6 cm, J. Paul Getty Museum, Los Angeles, inv. 85.GG.26 | 10 |
| 1.5 | Barocci workshop, <i>Reduced cartoon</i> , black chalk and charcoal with white chalk, squared in black chalk, on several sheets of brown prepared paper glued together, laid down on linen, 113 × 90.4 cm, Rijksmuseum, Amsterdam, inv. RP-T-1977-137 | 11 |
| 1.6 | Federico Barocci and Assistant, <i>Copy of the Entombment in reduced format</i> , oil on canvas, 89.7 × 57.8 cm, Private collection | 11 |
| 1.7 | Barocci workshop, <i>Copy of the Entombment</i> , oil on canvas, 122 × 92 cm, Galleria Nazionale delle Marche, Urbino, inv. 1990 DE 187 | 13 |
| 2.1 | Cornelis Cort, <i>The Madonna of the Cat</i> , 1577, engraving, state ii, 33.4 × 24.5 cm, The British Museum, London, inv. V.8.159 | 20 |
| 2.2 | Exterior view, Palazzo Brancaleoni, Piobbico | 21 |
| 2.3 | Felice Damiani da Gubbio, <i>Portrait of Count Brancaleoni, Laura Cappello, and Nine of Their Children</i> , 1574, fresco, Camera Romana, Palazzo Brancaleoni, Piobbico | 22 |
| 2.4 | Federico Brandani, <i>Equestrian Portrait of Count Antonio Brancaleoni</i> , 1575, stucco, Sala del Leon d'Oro, Palazzo Brancaleoni, Piobbico | 23 |
| 2.5 | Sala del Leon d'Oro, Palazzo Brancaleoni, Piobbico | 24 |
| 2.6 | Felice Damiani da Gubbio, <i>Count Antonio Brancaleoni and other Male Members of the Family Hunting</i> , 1574, fresco, Camera Romana, Palazzo Brancaleoni, Piobbico | 25 |
| 2.7 | Antonio Capellan, after Federico Barocci, <i>Rest on the Return from Egypt</i> , 1772, etching and engraving, 31.4 × 25.4 cm, The British Museum, London, inv. 1856,0510.221 | 27 |

viii *Illustrations*

- 2.8 Giorgio Picchi, after Federico Barocci, *Rest on the Return from Egypt*, 1585, Count's Private Chapel, Palazzo Brancaleni, Piobbico 27
- 2.9 Coat of Arms of Brancaleni Family, Sala del Leon d'Oro, Palazzo Brancaleni, Piobbico with *La Madonna del Gatto (The Madonna of the Cat)*, detail, ca. 1575–76, oil on canvas, 112.7 × 92.7 cm, The National Gallery, London, inv. NG29 30
- 3.1 *Saint Cecilia with Saints Mary Magdalen, John the Evangelist, Paul, and Catherine*, ca. 1556, pen and brown ink with brown wash heightened with white over black and some red chalk, laid down, 31.8 × 23 cm, Staatsgalerie Stuttgart/Graphische Sammlung, inv. 1338 35
- 3.2 *Study of a female torso after the antique and a leg for Saint John in the Madonna of Saint Simon*, ca. 1567, red and black chalk, 20.8 × 18.3 cm, Gabinetto Disegni e Stampe degli Uffizi, Florence, inv. 11521 F 35
- 3.3 Francesco Menzocchi, *Study for a Deposition*, recto, brown ink and black chalk, 17.8 × 24 cm, Private collection 36
- 3.4 Francesco Menzocchi, *Study for a Deposition*, verso, brown ink and black chalk, 17.8 × 24 cm, Private collection 37
- 3.5 Battista Franco, *Angels*, 1544–46, fresco, Cathedral, Urbino 38
- 3.6 Michelangelo, *Ignudo*, reversed, Sistine Chapel, Vatican 38
- 3.7 Battista Franco, *Copy after Michelangelo's 'Il Giorno,'* ca. 1536, brown ink and black chalk, 26.5 × 34.2 cm, Musée du Louvre, Département des Arts Graphiques, Paris, inv. 751 recto 39
- 3.8 Battista Franco, *Study for Fighters*, brown ink and black chalk, 17.8 × 15.5 cm, Musée du Louvre, Département des Arts Graphiques, Paris, inv. 4969 40
- 3.9 *Study for Saint John, Nicodemus, and Christ*, pen and brown ink with brown wash and one stroke of black chalk, 27.3 × 16.1 cm, Gabinetto disegni e stampe degli Uffizi, Florence, inv. 1417 E. recto 41
- 3.10 Battista Franco, *Study for a Figure*, reversed, ca. 1550, pen and ink, 13.6 cm × 15.5 cm, Private collection 42
- 4.1 *Madonna della Gatta*, ca. 1595–1600, oil on canvas, 233 × 179 cm, Galleria degli Uffizi, Florence, inv. 5375 47
- 4.2 *Last Supper*, 1590–99, oil on canvas, 299 × 322 cm, Chapel of the Santissimo Sacramento, Cathedral, Urbino 48
- 4.3 Federico Brandani, *Adoration of the Shepherds*, detail 1545–50, stucco, Oratory of San Giuseppe, Urbino 49
- 4.4 Federico Brandani, *Adoration of the Shepherds*, detail, 1545–50, stucco, Oratory of San Giuseppe, Urbino 49
- 4.5 Antonio Begarelli, *Christ in the House of Mary and Martha*, detail, 1544, terracotta, San Domenico, Modena 50
- 4.6 Nicola da Urbino workshop, *Cup with the Judgment of Paris*, 1530, tin-glazed earthenware, Museo Internazionale delle Ceramiche, Faenza 52
- 4.7 Attributed to Francesco Xanto Avelli da Rovigo, *Plate with the Roman She-Wolf and Romulus and Remus*, 1533(?), tin-glazed lustred earthenware, dia: 26.6 cm, depth: 4 cm, The British Museum London 52
- 4.8 Taddeo Zuccaro, *Capture of Christ*, ca. 1556, fresco, Cappella Mattei, Santa Maria della Consolazione, Rome 53
- 4.9 *Moses and the Serpent*, 1563, fresco, Museo Etrusco, Musei Vaticani, Rome 54

- 4.10 Gherardo Cibo, *Saint Jerome*, 1570s, pen and brown ink, brown wash, blue tempera heightened with white, 13.6 × 13.6 cm, Biblioteca Comunale, Jesi, Album C recto 56
- 4.11 Gherardo Cibo, *Landscape with River and a Man*, 1570s, brown pen and wash, 23.7 × 34.3 cm, Biblioteca Passionei, Fossombrone, inv. Disegni, vol. 4, c. 45 57
- 4.12 *Mountain Landscape with River*, 1565, pen and brown ink, brown and gray wash with white heightening on blue paper, 27.4 × 40.8 cm, Hamburger Kunsthalle inv. 21056 57
- 4.13 Gherardo Cibo, *Landscape with Saint Mary Magdalen*, 1590s, black pen and brown wash, 28.3 × 41.5 cm, Biblioteca Comunale, Jesi, Album A 58
- 5.1 *Rest on the Return from Egypt*, 1570–73, oil on canvas, 133 × 110 cm, Musei Vaticani 65
- 5.2 *Immaculate Conception*, ca. 1574–75, oil (and gouache?) on canvas, 222 × 150 cm, Galleria Nazionale delle Marche, Urbino, inv. 1990 D 86 68
- 5.3 *Compositional study for the Madonna della Misericordia*, recto, pen and brown ink with brown wash heightened with white, squared in black chalk, on blue-green paper, 27.3 × 18.8 cm, Gabinetto Disegni e Stampe degli Uffizi, Florence, inv. 11446 F 69
- 5.4 *Compositional study*, pen and brown ink with brown wash heightened with white, 20.5 × 15 cm, Musée du Louvre, Paris, inv. 2855 70
- 5.5 Raphael, *Madonna di Foligno*, 1512, oil on panel transferred to canvas, 320 × 194 cm, Pinacoteca Vaticana, Rome 71
- 5.6 *Madonna of the Rosary*, 1589–93, oil on canvas, 290 × 196 cm, Pinacoteca Diocesana, Senigallia 71
- 5.7 *Studies for the Virgin Mary*, recto, black and red chalk heightened with white, 38 × 25.4 cm, Gabinetto Disegni e Stampe degli Uffizi, Florence, inv. 11339 F 73
- 5.8 *Studies for the Virgin Mary and drapery*, 1566–67, black and white chalk on blue paper, laid down, 28.1 × 42.7 cm, Kupferstichkabinett, Staatliche Museen zu Berlin, inv. KdZ 27466 (4176) 74
- 5.9 *Nude studies for the Virgin Mary; drawings for the Virgin's head*, recto, black chalk and charcoal with some incision and stump heightened with white on blue paper, 26.3 × 34.9 cm, Gabinetto Disegni e Stampe degli Uffizi, Florence, inv. 11293 F 74
- 5.10 *Nude study for the Virgin*, recto, black, red, and white chalk on blue paper, 39 × 27.8 cm, Gabinetto disegni e stampe degli Uffizi, Florence, inv. 11284 F 76
- 5.11 Michelangelo, *Doni Tondo*, 1507, oil on panel, dia: 120 cm, Gabinetto Disegni e Stampe degli Uffizi, Florence, inv. 1890: no. 1456 76
- 5.12 Raphael, *Entombment*, 1507, oil on panel, 184 × 176 cm, Borghese Gallery, inv. 369 77
- 5.13 *Compositional study*, black and red chalk with pen and brown ink(?), laid down, 18.8 × 13.9 cm, Collection of Steven and Jean Goldman, Chicago 77
- 5.14 *Study of two female heads*, ca. 1574–75, black and red chalk, 25.8 × 24.8 cm, Gabinetto disegni e stampe degli Uffizi, Florence, inv. 11307 F. recto 78

x *Illustrations*

- 5.15 *Study for the head of Gabriel*, black chalk and charcoal with red, yellow, and peach pastel heightened with white, 35.9 × 25.4 cm, Gabinetto disegni e stampe degli Uffizi, Florence, inv. 11391 F 79
- 5.16 *Cartoncino for the Last Supper*, black chalk with gray, black, ochre, and white body color, squared in black chalk, 106.5 × 109.7 cm, Gabinetto Disegni e Stampe degli Uffizi, Florence, inv. 819 E 79
- 5.17 *Compositional studies*, recto, pen and brown ink with dark brown wash, 28.1 × 21 cm, National Galleries of Scotland, Edinburgh, inv. 725 80
- 5.18 *Nude study for the man on a ladder*, 1568–69, black and white chalk with incision and stump, squared in black chalk, on blue paper, 39.5 × 24 cm, Kupferstichkabinett, Staatliche Museen zu Berlin, inv. KdZ 20462 (3747) 81
- 5.19 *Studies for Saint Bernardino*, recto, black and white chalk with charcoal and stump, squared in black chalk, on blue paper, 42.5 × 28.1 cm, Gabinetto Disegni e Stampe degli Uffizi, Florence, inv. 11383 F 81
- 5.20 *Compositional studies*, verso, pen and brown ink with light brown wash over black chalk, 28.1 × 21 cm, National Galleries of Scotland, Edinburgh, inv. 725 83
- 5.21 *Study for the Virgin Mary*, recto, pen and black ink with gray wash over black chalk, squared with black chalk, 27.6 × 16.2 cm, Gabinetto Disegni e Stampe degli Uffizi, Florence, inv. 11550 F 83
- 5.22 *Madonna del Popolo*, 1575–79, oil on panel, 359 × 252 cm, Galleria degli Uffizi, Florence, inv. 1890 no. 751 85
- 5.23 Daniele da Volterra, *Presentation of the Virgin Mary in the Temple*, 1550–53, Della Rovere Chapel, Trinità dei Monti, Rome, Italy 85
- 6.1 *Study for Christ's torso*, black and white chalk on blue paper, laid down, 42.6 × 27 cm, Kupferstichkabinett, Staatliche Museen zu Berlin, inv. KdZ 20466 (4196) 90
- 6.2 *Study for the head of the woman supporting the Virgin*, red, black, and white chalk with peach pastel on blue-gray paper, laid down, 31.7 × 28.2 cm, Musée des Beaux-Arts et d'Archéologie, Besançon, inv. D. 1516 91
- 6.3 *Cartoon fragment for the head of the woman supporting the Virgin*, charcoal, black and white chalk with traces of red chalk and incision, 30 × 24.2 cm, Albertina, Vienna, inv. 2287 91
- 6.4 *Studies for Saint Joseph*, recto, black chalk and charcoal heightened with white, partially squared in black chalk, on blue-green paper, 40 × 28.3 cm, Gabinetto Disegni e Stampe degli Uffizi, Florence, inv. 11622 F 92
- 6.5 *Head of Anchises*, black, red, and white chalk with peach and yellow pastel and incision on blue paper, laid down, 37.8 × 25.9 cm, The Royal Collection, Windsor Castle, inv. 5233 93
- 6.6 *Aeneas Fleeing Troy*, 1598, oil on canvas, 179 × 253 cm, Galleria Borghese, Rome, inv. 68 94
- 6.7 *Studies of Christ's legs and feet*, black and white chalk with traces of red chalk and stump on blue paper, 32.2 × 43.3 cm, Kupferstichkabinett, Staatliche Museen zu Berlin, inv. KdZ 20221 (4279) 96
- 6.8 *Studies for the Virgin and hands of Nicodemus, Saint John, and the tomb cleaner*, black and white chalk with red and pink pastel on blue

- paper, 47 × 41 cm [irregular], Kupferstichkabinett, Staatliche Museen zu Berlin, inv. KdZ 20361 (4267) 97
- 6.9 *Study for the Christ Child*, black, red, and white chalk with peach pastel on blue paper, made up on all four corners, laid down, 16 × 22.1 cm, The Royal Collection, Windsor Castle, inv. 5223 99
- 6.10 *Nativity*, 1597, oil on canvas, 134 × 105 cm, Museo Nacional del Prado, Madrid, inv. P00018 99
- 6.11 *Study for the head of Saint Zaccharias*, black, red, and white chalk with peach and ocher pastel on blue-green paper, laid down, 34.8 × 23.5 cm, Albertina, Vienna, inv. 556 100
- 6.12 *Oil study for the head of Saint Joseph*, black, red, peach, and white oil paint (over traces of black chalk) on paper, laid down on canvas, 39.5 × 31.3 cm, Private collection 101
- 6.13 *Oil study for the head of Saint Joseph*, black, white, red, and ocher oil paint over black and red chalk (and peach pastel?) on paper, laid down on canvas, 37 × 26.3 cm, Hester Diamond, New York 101
- 6.14 *Head study for Nicodemus*, black, red, and white chalk and red and ocher pastel with stump on gray paper, 38 × 26.3 cm, National Gallery of Art, Washington, DC, Woodner Collection 1991, inv. 1991.182.16 102
- 6.15 *Head study for Nicodemus*, oil on paper, laid down on canvas, 38.7 × 27.3 cm, The Metropolitan Museum of Art, New York, Harry G. Sperling Fund, 1976, inv. 1976.87.1 103
- 6.16 *Head study for Saint John the Evangelist*, oil on paper lined with linen, 42.2 × 31.9 cm, National Gallery of Art, Washington, DC, Ailsa Mellon Bruce Fund 1979, inv. 1979.11.1 104
- 6.17 *Head study for Saint John the Evangelist*, oil over traces of black chalk on paper, laid down on canvas, 39.4 × 29.9 cm, Private collection 104
- 6.18 *Head study for Mary Magdalen*, oil on paper, laid down on canvas, 58 × 43 cm, Musée Bonnat-Helleu, Bayonne, inv. RF 1997.3 105
- 7.1 Titian, *Crucifixion with the Virgin Mary, Saint Dominic, and Saint John*, 1558, oil on canvas, 375 × 197 cm, Church of San Domenico, Ancona 113
- 7.2 *Nude studies for the Virgin Mary*, recto, black and white chalk with stump on blue paper, 40.3 × 24.9 cm, Kupferstichkabinett, Staatliche Museen zu Berlin, inv. KdZ 27465 (4173) 114
- 7.3 *Nude study for the Virgin Mary and seated male nude*, recto, black chalk heightened with white, incised, on blue paper, 40 × 27.4 cm, National Gallery of Art, Washington, DC, Ailsa Mellon Bruce Fund, inv. 1983.17.1a 116
- 7.4 Mariotto Albertinelli, *Visitation*, 1503, oil on panel, 232 × 146 cm, Galleria degli Uffizi, Florence 117
- 7.5 Tintoretto, *Visitation*, ca. 1588, oil on canvas, 158 × 237 cm, Scuola Grande di San Rocco, Venice 118
- 7.6 Tintoretto, *Visitation*, ca. 1549, oil on canvas, 240 × 146 cm, Pinacoteca Nazionale, Bologna 119
- 7.7 *Compositional study*, recto, pen and brown ink with brown wash, 27 × 17.6 cm, Statens Museum for Kunst, Copenhagen, inv. KKS7404-5 119

xii *Illustrations*

- 7.8 *Compositional studies*, verso, pen and brown ink with brown wash, 32.6 × 22 cm, Fondation Custodia, Collection Frits Lugt, Paris, inv. 5483 120
- 7.9 *Compositional studies*, recto, pen and brown ink with brown wash over traces of black chalk, 22 × 32.6 cm, Fondation Custodia, Collection Frits Lugt, Paris, inv. 5483 121
- 7.10 *Compositional studies*, recto, rotated, pen and brown ink with brown wash over traces of black chalk, 22 × 32.6 cm, Fondation Custodia, Collection Frits Lugt, Paris, inv. 5483 121
- 7.11 *Compositional studies of the Virgin and Saint Elizabeth*, recto, pen and brown ink with brown wash, 28.4 × 20.4 cm, Nationalmuseum, Stockholm, inv. NM 412/1863 122
- 7.12 *Compositional studies of the Virgin and Saint Elizabeth*, verso, pen and brown ink with brown wash, 28.4 × 20.4 cm, Nationalmuseum, Stockholm, inv. NM 413/1863 123
- 7.13 *Nude study for Saint Joseph*, charcoal and red chalk and stump heightened with white, on blue paper, 27.2 × 20 cm, Gabinetto Disegni e Stampe degli Uffizi, Florence, inv. 11505 F 126
- 7.14 Giovanni Battista Cungi, *Annunciation*, 1547, oil on canvas, 262 × 176 cm, Museo Civico, Borgo Sansepolcro 128
- 7.15 Lorenzo Lotto, *Annunciation*, ca. 1534–35, oil on canvas, 166 × 144 cm, Pinacoteca Civica, Recanati 129
- 7.16 Sandro Botticelli, *Madonna del Magnificat*, ca. 1483, oil on panel, dia: 118 cm, Galleria degli Uffizi, Florence, inv. 1890: no. 169 130
- 7.17 Alvise Vivarini, *The Resurrection*, 1497–98, tempera on panel, 145 × 76 cm, San Giovanni in Bragora, Venice 132
- 8.1 Giuseppe Cesari, called Il Cavaliere d'Arpino, *Trinity with Saints*, 1639, 380 × 210 cm, Santa Lucia in Selci, Rome 140
- 8.2 Felice Pellegrini, after Federico Barocci, *The Entombment of Christ*, 1593, 380 × 210 cm, Santa Maria Nuova, Perugia 141
- 8.3 *Calling of Saint Andrew*, 1580–83, oil on canvas, 315 × 235 cm, Escorial, Madrid 142
- 8.4 Antonio Viviani, *Miracles of the Eucharist*, 1592–99, fresco, Cathedral, Urbino 144
- 8.5 Guido Reni, *Assumption of the Virgin*, 1616–17, oil on canvas, 442 × 287 cm, Sant'Ambrogio, Genoa 145
- 8.6 View into Aldobrandini Chapel, Santa Maria sopra Minerva 146
- 8.7 *Christ Expiring on the Cross*, 1600–1604, oil on canvas, 374 × 246 cm, Museo Nacional del Prado, Madrid (Figure 18) 147
- 8.8 Michelangelo Merisi da Caravaggio, *The Death of the Virgin*, 1601–1606, 369 × 245 cm, Musée du Louvre Paris, inv. 54 147
- 8.9 Orazio Gentileschi, *The Circumcision of Christ*, ca. 1605–1607, 390 × 252 cm, Pinacoteca Comunale on deposit from the Church of the Gesù, Ancona 148
- 8.10 *Circumcision*, 1590, oil on canvas, 374 × 252 cm, Musée du Louvre, Paris, M.I. 315 148

- 9.1 *Riverbank with trees*, recto, brown and black wash with white, green, mauve, and yellow gouache(?) over some black chalk, 39.5 × 25 cm, The British Museum, London, inv. Pp,3.202 157
- 9.2 Enea Vico, *The Academy of Baccio Bandinelli*, ca. 1544, engraving, state i/ii, 30.6 × 43.8 cm, The Metropolitan Museum of Art, New York, inv. 17.50.16–135 162
- 9.3 *Martyrdom of Saint Vitalis*, 1580–83, oil on canvas, 392 × 269 cm, Pinacoteca Nazionale di Brera, Milan, inv. 401 166
- 9.4 *Cartoon for the Last Supper*, charcoal, heightened with white and incised, 230 × 315.5 cm, Gabinetto Disegni e Stampe degli Uffizi, Florence, inv. 91458 167
- 9.5 *Cartoon for the Circumcision*, charcoal heightened with white and incised, 23.2 × 26.3 cm, Gabinetto Disegni e Stampe degli Uffizi, Florence, inv. no. 91459 N.A 168
- 9.6 *Cartoon for Aeneas Fleeing Troy*, charcoal and white chalk, incised, on 25 sheets, joined together, 148 × 190 cm, Musée du Louvre, Département des Arts Graphiques, Paris, inv. 35774 169

Color Plates

- 1 *Entombment of Christ*, 1579–82, oil on canvas, 295 × 187 cm, Chiesa della Croce, Senigallia.
- 2 *Deposition*, 1568–69, oil on canvas, 412 × 232 cm, Chapel of San Bernardino, Cathedral of San Lorenzo, Perugia.
- 3 *Crucifixion with the Virgin and Saint John the Evangelist*, 1566–67, oil on canvas, 288 × 161 cm, Galleria Nazionale delle Marche, Urbino, inv. 1990 D85.
- 4 Barocci and Assistant(s), *Crucifixion with Mourners and Saint Sebastian*, 1596, oil on canvas, 500 × 318.5 cm, Senarega Chapel, San Lorenzo Cathedral, Genoa.
- 5 Workshop of Barocci, *Crucifixion*, ca. 1597–1604, oil on canvas, 360 × 297 cm, Oratorio della Morte, Urbino.
- 6 *La Madonna del Gatto (The Madonna of the Cat)*, ca. 1575–76, oil on canvas, 112.7 × 92.7 cm, The National Gallery, London. Bequeathed by Revd Holwell Carr, 1831, inv. NG29.
- 7 *Rest on the Return from Egypt*, 1575–76, distemper and oil on canvas, 190 × 125 cm, Church of Santo Stefano, Piobbico.
- 8 *Saint Cecilia with Saints Mary Magdalen, Saint John the Evangelist, Paul, and Catherine*, ca. 1556, oil on canvas, 200 × 145 cm, Cathedral, Urbino.
- 9 *Anatomical Study*, Gabinetto Disegni e Stampe degli Uffizi, Florence, inv. 11569 F. recto.
- 10 *Copy after Michelangelo's Last Judgment*, black chalk on cream paper, 37.3 × 24.3 cm, Biblioteca e Museo Civico, Urbana, Collezione Ubaldini, inv. II. 158.445 recto.
- 11 *Studies for female figures preparing to help the Virgin who has fainted, study for the Deposition (Perugia)*, black and white chalk on blue paper, 42.9 × 28.5 cm, Musée Condé Chantilly inv. DE-161.

- 12 *Landscape Study*, black chalk with brown wash heightened with white, 42.3 × 27.7 cm, Gabinetto Disegni e Stampe degli Uffizi, Florence, inv. 418 P recto.
- 13 *Landscape with Trees and a House*, black chalk and brown wash heightened with white, laid down, 32.2 × 28.3 cm, Albertina, Vienna, inv. 396.
- 14 *Calling of Saint Andrew*, 1580–83, oil on canvas, 315 × 235 cm, Musées Royaux des Beaux-Arts, Brussels, inv. 254.
- 15 *Studies of a man's head and of his hands*, black and red chalk, highlighted with white on blue-gray paper, 28 × 41.3 cm, The Metropolitan Museum of Art, Rogers Fund, inv. 50.143.
- 16 *Preliminary compositional study for the Institution of the Eucharist*, black chalk, pen, and brown ink with brown wash heightened with white, partially squared (faint) in black chalk on paper washed brown, laid down on old mount, 48 × 34.3 cm, The Trustees of the Chatsworth Settlement, Chatsworth House, Derbyshire, inv. 361.
- 17 *Cartoncino per il chiaroscuro*, black chalk, pen and brown ink with ocher-brown wash heightened with white, arched top drawn in brown ink at top, some incisions, lightly squared in black chalk in one small area, on ocher-brown paper, laid down, 58 × 33 cm, Gabinetto Disegni e Stampe degli Uffizi, Florence, inv. 9348 S. 822 E.
- 18 *Il Perdono*, 1571–76, oil on canvas, 427 × 236 cm, Church of San Francesco, Urbino.
- 19 *Entombment Study of Praying Hands (Mary Magdalen)*, black and white chalk with red and pink pastel on faded blue paper, 12.6 × 17.8 cm, Kupferstichkabinett, Staatliche Museen zu Berlin, KdZ 20354 (4245).
- 20 *Annunciation*, 1582–84, oil on canvas, 248 × 170 cm, Pinacoteca Vaticana, Rome, inv. 40376.
- 21 *Studies for the Virgin's hands*, charcoal with red and pink pastel heightened with white on blue paper, 27.4 × 39.4 cm, Kupferstichkabinett, Staatliche Museen zu Berlin, inv. KdZ 20453 (4190).
- 22 *Head of the Virgin Mary*, black, white, and red chalk with pink and orange-peach pastel on blue paper, made up in all four corners, laid down, 29.9 × 23 cm, The Royal Collection, Windsor Castle, inv. 5231.
- 23 *Visitation*, 1583–86, oil on canvas, 300 × 205 cm, Church of Santa Maria in Vallicella (Chiesa Nuova), Rome.
- 24 *Compositional study for the Crucifixion*, pen and ink and black and red chalk with brown wash heightened with white, 37.2 × 23.1 cm, Gabinetto Disegni e Stampe degli Uffizi, Florence, inv. 11416 F.
- 25 *Madonna of Saint John*, ca. 1565, oil on canvas, 151 × 115 cm, Galleria Nazionale delle Marche, Urbino, inv. 1990 D 88.
- 26 *Primo Pensiero for the Visitation*, pen, ink and wash on yellowed paper, 11.5 × 16.5 cm, Rijksprentenkabinett, Rijksmuseum, Amsterdam, inv. 1964–790.

- 27 *Presentation of the Virgin in the Temple*, 1593–1603, oil on canvas, 383 × 247 cm, Church of Santa Maria in Vallicella (Chiesa Nuova), Rome.
- 28 *Nativity*, 1597–99, oil on canvas, 134 × 106 cm, Pinacoteca Ambrosiana, Milan.
- 29 *Christ Appearing to the Virgin Mary and Mary Magdalen* (formerly titled *Christ Taking Leave of His Mother*), ca. 1604–12, oil on canvas, 219 × 191 cm, Musée Condé, Chantilly, inv. PE 57.
- 30 *Study for Christ and Mary Magdalen*, black chalk with white heightening, incised, 40.5 × 28 cm, Gabinetto Disegni e Stampe degli Uffizi, Florence, inv. 11269 F. recto.

Acknowledgements

The biggest thanks and debt of gratitude for this book must go to Babette Bohn, whose initial efforts were critical in getting this project off the ground. She was the one to initiate the proposal process and guide it along to fruition, and we are all in her debt for her energy, high standards, and excellent scholarship.

This volume is the happy culmination of a gathering of friends and colleagues in St. Louis in January of 2013 to talk about Federico Barocci. It was planned together with Babette and Carol Plazzotta, my teammates on the exhibition and my sage advisors on the symposium. I also must extend appreciation to Virginia Napoleone, the McKrinkle Fellow at the National Gallery, London, who was also part of our team. The symposium was a huge success, and to that I owe thanks not just to Babette and Carol, but to the other speakers (and now authors) as well. I should also extend my gratitude to Suzanne Folds McCullagh who wasn't able to participate in the volume, but who offered her insights into Barocci's process with us at the conference. Finally, I should thank Claire Barry, who joined us for the panel discussion at the end of the last session, where she shared her deep understanding of the process and materials of Old Master technique.

Appreciation is also due to several people who supported the symposium in various ways, including George Wachter, Christopher Apostle, and Jason Herrick from Sotheby's who hosted a lovely dinner. Enormous thanks are also due to Mark Weil and Joan Hall who opened their home and generously welcomed our group. I also want to thank BMO Private Bank, Sotheby's, and the Missouri Arts Council, a state agency, who provided support for the exhibition and symposium.

As with any such event, it only happened through the hard work and kind spirits of many wonderful staff people at the Saint Louis Art Museum and Washington University in St. Louis. The symposium took place when the Museum was undergoing a major expansion and renovation project. The Barocci exhibition had the dubious distinction of being the last exhibition to be mounted in the former Special Exhibition Galleries in our venerable Cass Gilbert building. It proved a good thing given the sympathetic proportions and architectural detail that served the pictures quite well. The timing meant, however, that we had no auditorium. We were fortunate to have generously collegial friends at Washington University in St. Louis who allowed us the use of their facilities. For that, we are very appreciative, especially to Carmon Colangelo, Dean of the Sam Fox School of Design & Visual Arts. I must also thank Elizabeth Childs, Etta and Mark Steinberg Professor of Art History, Department of Art History and Archaeology, School of Arts and Sciences, who makes any collaborative effort memorable and rewarding.

Hosting an off-site event added to the workload for a number of SLAM employees, most notably the research assistant who was the backbone of the effort,

Chris Naffziger. I am not sure he understood what he was in for when he started working on the Barocci exhibition back in 2008, dedicated as he was to museum work and to the study of sixteenth-century Italian art. Restaurant reservations, van schedules, and the inevitable last-minute schedule changes were probably not on his radar. He met the challenges cheerfully and resourcefully, to the benefit of all.

A number of our staff members were very involved and enormously helpful, including Sabrena Nelson, our former Head of Adult Programs, who shouldered a lot of the work, along with cherished colleagues Narni Cahill and Bill Appleton (Bill and Narni have both moved on). Jeanne Rosen, a former assistant in the curatorial division who now works in the Director's Office, was also part of the dedicated team who insured the success of the symposium through her incredibly kind spirit and warm heart. I must also thank the many hours of time that Linda Thomas, our former Assistant Director of Collections and Exhibitions, and our former Exhibitions assistant Molly Perse put into the planning, logistics, and moral support for the conference.

The production of the book has brought several challenges, not the least of which was the change in publisher and the revised contract. A number of Museum colleagues were generous with their time and expertise in helping me to navigate sometimes complicated territory. For that, I wish to thank Jeanette Fausz and Carolyn Schmidt in particular for their patience and understanding. Jason Busch, who is no longer at the Museum, was a great champion of the project and I want to thank him for his help. Kristen Watts and Mariah Keller were lovely and helpful colleagues, and I am very appreciative to them for their support during the brief time they were here. Bryan Young and Clare Vasquez continue to raise the bar for being efficient and delightful library colleagues, and they are owed a debt of gratitude as well. None of this would have happened without the support and encouragement of Brent Benjamin, now The Barbara B. Taylor Director of the Saint Louis Art Museum, both for his commitment to hold the symposium and for his backing of this volume.

The last push to get the manuscript in order and ready to send off has relied on the talents, generous spirit, and general good will of Rachel Swiston and Andrea Miller. I can't thank them enough for all of their hard work, and for being such delightful human beings. Another huge thank you is owed to Jessica Slawski who worked to secure our photographs. Zoey Hasselbring, alas no longer among our curatorial division staff members, contributed in myriad ways, if not directly to the manuscript itself, to my life and work at the Museum during the years of preparing the manuscript. Lastly, I want to thank Lisa Ayla Çakmak who makes being a boss one of the best jobs ever and who pitched in to help save me from at least some of the typescript errors that I either created or failed to notice!

I want to offer heartfelt thanks to Erika Gaffney and her colleagues at Ashgate who first helped get the project underway. It was a great pleasure to work with her and the book bears her stamp even if she wasn't able to be part of its completion.

On a personal note, I want to thank my family who help me keep my balance and who nurture my soul. Our family has expanded since the project began. Oscar Paul (who was born the day the Barocci exhibition opened) has been joined by Eleanor Judith, both the utterly adorable offspring of my daughter Madeleine and her husband Aram. They delight us all, including their wonderful uncle Bill. Most of all, I want to thank my husband, David Konig, whose erudition and keen intellect are only surpassed by his good heart and boundless love.

Note to readers

This volume is intended to accompany the catalogue for the 2012–2013 Barocci exhibition, Judith W. Mann and Babette Bohn with Carol Plazzotta, *Federico Barocci: Renaissance Master of Color and Line*. Exh. cat., St. Louis: Saint Louis Art Museum, with Yale University Press, 2012. Unless otherwise specified, all catalogue entries cited in this essay reference that catalogue. Furthermore, decisions concerning the illustration of some of Barocci's work in the current publication were based on what was readily available to readers in that volume. Works that are illustrated in the exhibition catalogue are noted with the catalogue or figure number in parenthesis.

1 Introduction

New insights into Federico Barocci's Senigallia *Entombment* and suggestions on his late workshop practice

Babette Bohn and Judith W. Mann

Barocci and the recent exhibition

This book of essays is devoted to Federico Barocci (ca. 1533–1612), the greatest Italian artist of his generation and a remarkably inventive religious painter and draftsman. Patronized throughout his lifetime by the duke of his native Urbino, Barocci became known as a distinguished religious painter, producing important works for churches in Urbino and the surrounding region as well as in Rome and other Italian cities. One of the first original iconographers of the Catholic Reformation, Barocci developed compelling and influential imagery for traditional religious narratives, such as the Annunciation, and complicated religious themes such as the Immaculate Conception. He was also the first Italian artist to incorporate extensive color into his drawings, employing pastel and oil paint in his beautiful preparatory studies for paintings.

In spite of his innovations, apart from a few fine modern publications,¹ he has not received the critical attention or popular recognition that he deserves, for several reasons. Barocci spent most of his life in Urbino, far from major art centers, and the dates of his career fall between the traditional Renaissance and Baroque periods. His surviving oeuvre as a painter is relatively small (about 70 pictures), and most of his extant paintings are in Italy, many of them in remote locations in the Marches. Furthermore, for mid-twentieth-century scholars who were beginning to investigate the dynamic baroque styles of his successors, the sweetness of Barocci's aesthetic was less appealing than the exuberant styles of such artists as Caravaggio and Guercino. For modern audiences for whom Caravaggio is now a household word, it may come as a shock to learn that Barocci was often more appreciated by his contemporaries, as evidenced by his considerably higher prices, which averaged more than two and a half times Caravaggio's typical compensation.²

In January 2013, the Saint Louis Art Museum invited a group of scholars to participate in a symposium in conjunction with *Federico Barocci: Renaissance Master*, an exhibition that opened in St. Louis (Oct. 21, 2012–Jan. 20, 2013) and subsequently traveled to the National Gallery London (Feb. 27, 2013–May 19, 2013) for its second and final venue.³ The project was initially conceived as a monographic exhibition to highlight the beauty and power of Barocci's paintings. Due both to loan limitations and to the recognition that Barocci was a prolific

draftsman who experimented with new media, invented novel preparatory instruments, and produced more preliminary studies for his paintings than any other Italian Renaissance artist, the exhibition was reformulated to focus on his fascinating preparatory process.⁴ In consequence, most of the 109 drawings and eight oil sketches of heads shown at the two venues were selected to illustrate the artist's preparation of individual paintings, primarily focusing on the 23 chosen for display. The symposium, designed to complement the exhibition, was part of the Saint Louis Art Museum's commitment to providing varied opportunities for scholars and the general public to learn about this under-appreciated master. The symposium papers dealt with topics about the artist that were not addressed in the show itself and expanded on some of the questions raised by the exhibition, leading us to the conclusion that we should publish them in another volume. Moreover, since the exhibition itself had inspired new insights into Barocci, we welcomed the opportunity to develop and refine our earlier discoveries, as recorded in the catalogue, in an updated publication. The *Entombment of Christ* (Color Plate 1) was one painting that occasioned much discussion and debate during the course of the exhibition. Our reconsideration of that work in this essay illustrates how scholarship based on insights gleaned from an exhibition but completed after it closes can yield new understanding.

The *Entombment* as the culmination of Barocci's early career

Barocci's *Entombment of Christ*, an altarpiece completed in 1582 for the Chiesa della Croce in the seaside town of Senigallia, encapsulates many of his most important accomplishments as a designer of religious paintings. By the late 1560s, Barocci had blossomed into the most naturalistic painter of his generation, an achievement predicated upon the artist's increasing reliance on drawing from life. Barocci had also honed his skills as a designer of dramatically effective compositions and emotionally diversified figures, as is first evident in the *Deposition* altarpiece of 1568–69 for the Cathedral of San Lorenzo in Perugia (Color Plate 2), arguably his first masterpiece.⁵ The numerous preparatory studies, focusing in particular on the emotional faces and dramatically posed extremities, anticipate many aspects of the later *Entombment*. The same may be said of the *Deposition*'s masterful composition, which breaks up the expressive individual figures into smaller, balanced groups and unifies everyone into a larger, X-shaped design. As in all of Barocci's mature compositions, none of the subgroups within this overall arrangement could be eliminated without compromising the sense of harmony in the picture. Christ's extended right arm, still nailed to the Cross, is paralleled by the extended left arm of Saint Bernardino below and by the backward tilt of the adjacent young soldier on a ladder; the circular group of gesticulating women in the foreground offsets the verticality of the male figures above them; and so it goes. Such integrated designs were devised as the result of a lengthy preparatory process that included many compositional studies, including no less than ten early compositional sketches for the *Deposition*, probably only a fraction of the number the artist originally created. The *Deposition* is the first of Barocci's altarpieces to have been designed in 50 or more extant preliminary drawings, a truly staggering number when compared to the production of other Renaissance artists, testament to his lengthy design process that culminates, in many respects, in his *Entombment*.⁶

Commissioned by the Confraternity of the Santissimo Sacramento e della Croce for its church in Senigallia, the *Entombment of Christ* was one of the artist's most famous paintings—so admired by other artists, in fact, that enthusiastic copyists seriously damaged the work early in its history, necessitating Barocci's restoration of the picture in 1607–1608. The *Entombment* was the centerpiece of the exhibition in St. Louis, where it occupied an entire gallery, together with selected preparatory studies and other related works. The decision to highlight this painting stemmed from several motivations. To begin with, it is one of the most breathtakingly beautiful paintings the artist ever created, a symphony of richly varied colors and emotionally expressive figures, grouped gracefully and rhythmically around the pale body of the dead Christ and set into an evocative landscape. The work capped Barocci's early career and marked his emergence as one of the premier painters of sixteenth-century Italy. Stylistically and iconographically, the picture both demonstrates Barocci's links to earlier Raphaellesque traditions and illustrates his originality, a synthesis of the old and the new that is at the heart of his artistry.⁷ Moreover, the 50 surviving preparatory studies associated with the painting represent the most diverse and innovative group related to any of Barocci's works. The exhibition included 13 of them, as well as three other works connected with the altarpiece. Since the goal of the exhibition was to examine how Barocci used drawings in the preparation of his finished works, it made sense to focus on a picture for which he developed new and varied instruments for devising and refining his composition.

The repainting of the *Entombment* as an indicator of Barocci's late workshop practices

The alleged repainting of the *Entombment* in Barocci's studio in 1607–1608 adds to the interesting character of this picture.⁸ Several visitors to the exhibition observed that it bore little resemblance to Barocci's other paintings done after 1600, a perplexing circumstance if indeed it was substantially reworked in Barocci's studio, as scholars have generally believed. Moreover, a close examination of the painting by conservators, including the use of infrared reflectography, yielded little evidence of extensive repainting.⁹ We think it is worth revisiting the early accounts that describe the circumstances of its repainting to consider possible explanations. The earliest and one of the most important is Giovanni Pietro Bellori's biography, written 60 years after the artist's death, based on information he received from Pompilio Bruni (1605–68), a maker of mathematical instruments who was the student of a pupil of Barocci's brother Simone. Bellori wrote that the picture's surface was damaged through irresponsible tracing. He noted that the painting was so popular that it was constantly copied and that one overzealous copyist had “practically destroyed it all.”¹⁰ The verb Bellori used to describe the copyist's action, “*lucidare*,” has occasioned some discussion. Pillsbury translated it as “polish,” whereas Turner used “trace” instead, suggesting that Bellori may have been referring to a common practice for tracing that involved using oil-saturated (and therefore translucent) paper held against the surface of the picture.¹¹ Problems with the oil or its improper application may have resulted in surface damage, or the copyist may have applied too much pressure in transferring the outlines of the figures to his paper. The damage had evidently already occurred by 1587, since notes from a confraternity meeting in that year reveal that the painting had been injured and that a proposal was made to limit

access to the altar, suggesting that overly attentive visitors may have also endangered the altarpiece.¹² The confraternity wrote Barocci in 1588, asking him to repaint the damaged picture, although he didn't agree to do so until 1606.¹³ Further problems were documented in other confraternity records that describe the infestation of the church by mice, the re-backing of the painting to repair damage (presumably the mice had gnawed the canvas), and additional injury caused by their urination.¹⁴ Thus, there is little doubt that the painting sustained some damage, as is confirmed by Barocci's own observation in his letter to the confraternity on June 2, 1607, when he noted, "I've seen the picture that they sent to me and to tell the truth, it was very poorly maintained and mistreated."¹⁵

The most conspicuous damage discernible today is the wear in the brocade pattern on Mary Magdalen's drapery. In a copy painted by Felice Pellegrini in 1593 (Figure 8.2), a pineapple design on Mary's robe is quite legible, although it is no longer decipherable in Barocci's altarpiece. The date on Pellegrini's picture indicates that this design was still intact in 1593 and therefore could not have been part of the damage that had appeared by 1587.¹⁶

The amount of actual harm that had occurred by 1587 is difficult to determine today. The 150-*scudi* fee, half of the 300 *scudi* he received for the original commission, has been interpreted as proof that Barocci did considerable work on the altarpiece. Given the high prices that Barocci negotiated for some of his late works (800 *scudi* for the *Last Supper*, 1590–99 and 1,483 for the *Institution of the Eucharist*, 1603–1607); however, 150 *scudi* no longer constituted a high fee, and one might plausibly conclude that the artist repainted only some portion of the altarpiece but not the entire surface. The absence of obviously repainted sections may initially seem to confirm this conclusion. On the other hand, one might expect some discontinuity of surface had the reworking been limited in scope; and the visual coherence of the picture conflicts with such a conclusion. Two explanations seem possible. One is that Barocci repainted a significant portion of the picture and was willing, in this special case, to rework much of the surface for comparatively little money. A second explanation is that he worked hard to disguise the areas of repaint, however limited they were.

Fifty years ago, Harald Olsen argued that the Senigallia altarpiece was substantially repainted in 1607–1608 by Barocci himself, based on what Olsen perceived as a close relationship between the *Entombment* and the *Institution of the Eucharist* (Figure 1.1), "especially in the treatment of light and color."¹⁷ Seeing the picture in the London presentation of the exhibition where the *Institution* was also displayed, however, confirmed our sense that the *Entombment* has much more in common with Barocci's earlier paintings (for example, *Il Perdono*, 1571–76 and the *Rest on the Return from Egypt*, 1570–73) than with the altarpieces from the first decade of the seventeenth century. The luminous palette used in the *Entombment* does not recur in any pictures painted after the early 1590s. Furthermore, color concentrations in the late pictures are more localized, and unlike the early pictures, they display few sequences of three and four pastel tones within a confined area. The later works employ dark backgrounds and nocturnal settings, differentiating them even more from the *Entombment*. Therefore, although we agree with Olsen that only one hand is evident in the *Entombment*, that picture does not mesh with the artist's late style. If Barocci did substantially repaint a portion or even most of the Senigallia altarpiece, might there be another explanation as to why there is so little evidence of his later manner?



Figure 1.1 *Institution of the Eucharist*, 1603–1609, oil on canvas, 290 × 177 cm, Aldobrandini Chapel, Santa Maria sopra Minerva, Rome (Cat. 18).

Photo: Fondo Edifici di Culto, amministrato dal Ministero dell'Interno – Dipartimento per le Libertà civili e l'Immigrazione – Direzione Centrale per l'Amministrazione del Fondo Edifici di Culto.

Barocci's paintings during his late career were not of uniform quality. On the one hand, he continued to produce works of poetic grace and rich color, such as the *Institution of the Eucharist*. Yet, on the other, he made paintings that have been relegated to a second-class status, based on evidence of execution by studio assistants. An often-cited example is *Christ Appearing to the Virgin and to Mary Magdalen* (traditionally known as *Christ Taking Leave of his Mother*, Musée Condé, Chantilly, ca. 1604–12, Color Plate 29) that includes passages such as the hard contour of Mary Magdalen's face that are dissimilar to Barocci's characteristic style.¹⁸ A more obvious case is the *Lamentation* (Biblioteca Comunale dell'Archiginnasio, Bologna, 1600–12, Figure 1.2), left unfinished at the artist's

6 *Babette Bohn and Judith W. Mann*

death, in which major parts of the composition were executed by studio assistants. The kneeling Mary Magdalen, the woman attending the Virgin Mary, and Saint Michael all display heavily worked contours and physiognomies that recall the faces of the Madonna in workshop productions such as the *Madonna di Santa Lucia*.¹⁹ Sensitive studies for the body of Christ, the pose of Saint Michael, and some of Christ's attendants testify to Barocci's involvement in the picture's design, but its uneven quality, discrepancies in scale, and unresolved composition make clear that he was not the sole executant on the painting.²⁰ The *Institution* and the *Lamentation* thus represent two ends of Barocci's spectrum during these last years, suggesting some considerable differences among his pictures in the amount and type of involvement by studio assistants.



Figure 1.2 Lamentation, 1600–12, oil on canvas, 410 × 288 cm, Biblioteca Comunale dell'Archiginnasio, Bologna, inv. P 673 (Figure 21).

Photo: Collezioni Comunali d'Arte, Bologna, Italy.