Identity and Locality in Early European Music, 1028–1740

Edited by Jason Stoessel
Contents

List of Illustrations vii
List of Tables ix
List of Music Examples xi
Notes on Contributors xiii
Preface xvii
Acknowledgements xix
List of Abbreviations xxi

Editor’s Introduction 1

PART I  IDENTITY AND PRACTICE
IN AQUITANIAN AND IBERIAN PLAINCHANT

1  Adémâr de Chabannes at the Nexus of Tradition and Innovation 13
   James Grier

2  Seeking Early Practice for the Exultet in Iberia 27
   Kathleen E. Nelson

3  Regional and Royal: Aspects of Practice in Three Portuguese Prints
   of the Lamentations of Jeremiah (1543–95) 37
   Jane Morlet Hardie

4  Plainsong in Eastern Spain and the tono valenciano 55
   Greta J. Olson

PART II  LATE MEDIEVAL AESTHETICS,
TRADITIONS AND PRACTICES

5  Some Early References to Aristotle’s Politics in Parisian Writings
   about Music 83
   Catherine Jeffreys

6  Music and Moral Philosophy in Early Fifteenth-Century Padua 107
   Jason Stoessel
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Author</th>
<th>Pages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Late-Medieval Sacred Songs: Tradition, Memory and History</td>
<td>Reinhard Strohm</td>
<td>129</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2006 Gordon Athol Anderson Memorial Lecture</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Pervasive Imitation in Senfl’s <em>Ave Maria ... Virgo Serena</em>:</td>
<td>Miranda Stanyon</td>
<td>151</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Borrowing from Josquin in Sixteenth-Century Augsburg</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Alessandro Scarlatti and the Roman Copies of his Neapolitan</td>
<td>Rosalind Halton</td>
<td>173</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Compositions: A Source Study of the Serenata <em>Venere, Adone et Amore</em> (1696)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>‘After Six Weeks’: Music for the Churching Ceremonies of</td>
<td>Janice B. Stockigt</td>
<td>191</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Maria Josepha, Electoral Princess of Saxony and Queen of Poland</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Bibliography 211
* Index 237
List of Illustrations

7.1 *Puer natus in Bethlehem* from a Gradual of St George’s (c. 1340)  
Reproduced with permission of the Czech National Library, Prague 130

7.2 *Gesangbuch von Michael Weisse* 136

7.3 *Liederbuch der Anna von Köln* 140

7.4 Friedrich Zollner’s Nativity Miniature 143

9.1 Recitative ‘Della mia genetrice’, from *Venere, Adone et Amore*,  
US-BEm 1352. By permission of Jean Gray Hargrove Music  
Library, University of California, Berkeley 180

9.2 Recitative ‘Della mia genetrice’, from *Venere, Adone et Amore*,  
GB-Och 992. By permission of Jean Gray Hargrove Music  
Library, University of California, Berkeley 181

10.1 Louis de Silvestre (1675–1760), *Queen Maria Josepha, Wife of King August III of Poland, as Saxon Electoral Princess*. D-Dl,  
Kupferstich-Kabinett C 6691–Ca 202, Inv. No. 143 052.  
Reproduced with permission of Sächsische Landesbibliothek –  
Staats- und Universitätsbibliothek, Dresden / Deutsche Fotothek.  
Photo: Rudolph Kramer 192

10.2 Raymond de le Plat (c. 1664–1742), *Schlosskapelle 1719*. D-Dl,  
Kupferstich-Kabinett C 6691–Ca 202, Inv. No. 143 052.  
Reproduced with permission of Sächsische Landesbibliothek –  
Staats- und Universitätsbibliothek, Dresden / Deutsche Fotothek.  
Photo: Rudolph Kramer 199

10.3 Louis de Silvestre (1675–1760), *Maria Josepha, Wife of King August III of Poland* [as Queen of Poland]. D-Dl,  
Inv. No. 182537. Reproduced with permission of Sächsische  
Landesbibliothek – Staats- und Universitätsbibliothek,  
Dresden / Deutsche Fotothek. Photographer unknown 202

permission of Sächsische Landesbibliothek – Staats- und  
Universitätsbibliothek, Dresden / Deutsche Fotothek.  
Photographer unknown 204
## List of Tables

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>6.1</td>
<td>Tonal and rhythmic characteristics of pieces connected to early fifteenth-century Padua</td>
<td>119</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.1</td>
<td>Recitative, ‘Della mia genitrice’, 1696 sources: the errors tracked</td>
<td>184</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.2</td>
<td>Aria, Venere, ‘Non v’è maggior vendetta’: errors compared</td>
<td>185</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.1</td>
<td>Children born to Maria Josepha and Friedrich August II: 1720–40</td>
<td>193</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.2</td>
<td>Churcching ceremonies held following births to Maria Josepha</td>
<td>195</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.3</td>
<td>Musicians sent to Hubertusburg from Dresden for the Churcching of Maria Josepha and Thanksgiving, 1 November 1739</td>
<td>205</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
List of Music Examples

1.1 Adémar’s Introit trope *Christi discipulus*, first two elements  
1.2 Adémar’s Offertory verse *Designatus a domino*

2.1 Opening of the Exultet, E-Mh Aemil 18, fol. 123v  
2.2 Preface segment, E-Mh Aemil 18, fol. 124v

3.1 Notes in the Lamentations in each Portuguese print (1543–95)  
3.2 *Hierusalem, hierusalem*, Lectio I, Feria V in all three Portuguese prints (1543–95)

4.1 *Obsecro Domine, memento* in sixteenth-century Spanish Levant and Italian sources  
4.2 *Refulsit sol* in sixteenth-century Spanish Levant and Italian sources  
4.3 *Exaudisti Domine* in sixteenth-century Spanish Levant and Italian sources

6.1 Text and translation of Ciconia’s *O Padua sidus preclarum*  
6.2 Johannes Ciconia, *O felix templum*, BB. 70–132

7.1 *Resonet in laudibus* (Moosburg Gradual D-Mu 156)  
7.2 Tenor *Patris sapientia*  
7.3 Bach, St John Passion, *Christus, der uns selig macht*

8.1 Josquin, *Ave Maria*, bb. 1–10. Adapted with kind permission of John O’Donnell (unpublished edition)  
<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>9.1</td>
<td>Recitative, Venere, ‘Della mia genetrique’, bb. 1–8; 19–33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.2</td>
<td>Aria, Venere, ‘Non v’è maggior vendetta’, GB-Och 992 version</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.3</td>
<td>Aria, Adone, ‘A dispetto del cordoglio’, Introduction, bb. 1–18</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Notes on Contributors

**James Grier** is Professor of Music History at the University of Western Ontario in London, Canada. He is the author of *The Critical Editing of Music* (1996) and *The Musical World of a Medieval Monk: Adémar de Chabannes in Eleventh-Century Aquitaine* (2006), both with Cambridge University Press, and several studies of music and liturgy in medieval Aquitaine. His critical edition of music written in Adémar’s hand is forthcoming from Corpus Christianorum Continuatio Mediaevalis, where it will form part of Adémar’s *Collected Works*.

**Rosalind Halton** has edited and directed many performances of works by Alessandro Scarlatti, including a three-CD release of previously unrecorded cantatas and the Serenata *Venere, Adone e Amore* (ABC Classics, 2007). The author of a doctoral thesis (Oxford) on the music of Haydn, she is also a harpsichordist with wide experience throughout Europe, and has released award-winning discs of French harpsichord music. Her published work includes online editions for Cantata Editions.com and the Web Library of Seventeenth-Century Music, and a forthcoming edition of *Venere, Adone et Amore* for A-R Editions. She is Music Postgraduate Convenor at the University of Newcastle.

**Jane Morlet Hardie** is an Honorary Associate at the Centre for Medieval Studies at the University of Sydney. She holds a PhD in Musicology from the University of Michigan, and was a Fulbright Senior Scholar at Harvard University in 2000. Author of several books and many articles on Spanish Renaissance Sacred Polyphony and Liturgical Chant, and Iberian manuscript and early printed sources, Hardie’s work focuses on issues of regional and local practice, and her many publications relate to liturgical geography and the definition of local practices. She is currently engaged on a study of a group of Spanish manuscripts at Sydney University.

**Catherine Jeffreys** is an Honorary Research Associate in the School of Historical Studies, Monash University, where she previously worked as a Research Associate for an ARC Discovery project focusing on thirteenth-century music theory in Paris. She has specialized in twelfth-century plainchant, having completed her PhD thesis on the music of Hildegard of Bingen at the University of Melbourne. She has published several studies on Hildegard and her milieu and is one of the editors of a new edition and translation of Grocheio’s *Ars musica* (Medieval Institute Publications, 2009). She is currently working with the Grocheio editors at Monash on a translation of the *Tractatus de tonis* by Guy of Saint-Denis.
Kathleen E. Nelson is a Senior Lecturer in Musicology at the Sydney Conservatorium of Music, the University of Sydney. Her main research focus is on medieval chant sources of the Iberian Peninsula, with a particular interest in early Iberian sources using Aquitanian notation. Kathleen is also investigating liturgical manuscripts owned by the University of Sydney. Recently published articles have included a study of the Exultet in books of Toledo, and manuscript studies concerning sources located in Spain and Australia.

Greta Olson is Professor at the Music Department of Chinese University of Hong Kong. Her articles and reviews, focusing on seventeenth-century Spanish liturgical music, have been published in *Music and Letters*, *Notes*, *Early Music*, *Music in Art* and *Fontes Artis Musicae*, along with various publications in Spain and South America. She has also published a two-volume edition of the Masses of Juan Bautista Comes in *Recent Researches in the Music of the Baroque Era*. She is at work on a study of the musical chapel of the Real Colegio-Seminario de Corpus Christi (Valencia) during the seventeenth century.

Miranda Stanyon is Tutor in Musicology and English Literature at Queen’s College, University of Melbourne. In 2006, she completed her Musicology Honours Dissertation on Ludwig Senfl with John Griffiths at the University of Melbourne. After a period of study at the Albert-Ludwigs Universität, Freiburg, she returned to the University of Melbourne in 2008 to complete an Honours Literature Dissertation on ‘Die Gewalt der Musik’ in three nineteenth-century German novellas.

Janice B. Stockigt is a Fellow of the Australian Academy of Humanities, Associate Professor and Principal Fellow of the Faculty of Music at the University of Melbourne, where she has held Postdoctoral and Queen Elizabeth II Fellowships from the Australian Research Council. Her book *Jan Dismas Zelenka (1679–1745): A Bohemian Musician at the Court of Dresden* (Oxford University Press, 2000), was awarded the *Derek Allen Prize* (2001) by the British Academy and the inaugural Woodward Medal in the area of Humanities (University of Melbourne). Developments within the Dresden court orchestra during the first half of the eighteenth century provide the topic of her contribution to a forthcoming book, *The Changing Artistic Priorities of German Hofkapellen 1715–1760*.

Jason Stoessel is a Lecturer in the Discipline of Music, School of Arts, at the University of New England, Armidale. He completed his PhD examining the sources and notation of the *ars subtilior* in 2003. His current research includes a cultural study of the music of the medieval Veneto, with a focus on Padua, and the relationships between music and astrology in the late middle ages. He has published on the notational process of Jacob de Senleches, Philipoctus de Caserta, Matheus de Sancto Johannes and Johannes Ciconia, and regularly reviews recent publications on medieval music.
Reinhard Strohm, Professor of Music at the University of Oxford since 1996 (Heather Professor of Music until 2007) and presently Visiting Professor at Vienna University, has published extensively on late medieval music, Italian opera, eighteenth-century music and music historiography, authoring no less than seven books, including *Music in Medieval Bruges* (Oxford University Press, 1985), *The Rise of European Music* (Cambridge University Press, 1993), *Dramma per musica: Italian Opera seria of the Eighteenth Century* (Yale, 1997) and *The Eighteenth-Century Diaspora of Italian Music and Musicians* (Brepols, 2001). Previously, he collaborated on the *Richard-Wagner-Gesamtausgabe* at Munich and has held positions at King’s College (London) and Yale University. He completed his PhD in 1971 at the Technische Universität Berlin with Carl Dahlhaus on the ‘Italienische Opernarien des frühen Settecento (1720–1730)’. He is a Fellow of the British Academy.
Preface

The initial motivation for this volume arose from keynotes and sessions on topics in early music presented at the 29th National Conference of the Musicological Society of Australia, University of New England, Armidale, 27 September to 1 October 2006. These (and an impressive array of papers on topics outside the realm of early music) were presented under the auspices of the conference themes based around investigations of identity and locality/regionality in past and present music. A limited number of papers were selected and authors were asked to contribute chapter-length essays examining the issues and findings outlined in their papers in greater depth and extent. An earlier version of Grier’s contribution was presented as an invited keynote at the same conference. Strohm’s chapter is based on the text of his 2006 Gordon Athol Anderson Memorial Lecture that had been timed to coincide with the same conference. I am grateful to Professor Strohm for agreeing to the publication of his essay in this collection and to the University of New England for seeing the good sense of this proposition as it adds considerable weight to many of the themes recurring through this volume. Seven chapters authored by Australian researchers illustrate the vitality and the ongoing dialogue of early music studies in Australia with the international scholarly community.

Jason Stoessel
Armidale
1 March 2009
I warmly thank all the contributors for enthusiastically embracing this project, for rising to the challenge of preparing chapter-length essays from shorter conference papers, and for indulging a demanding editor often requesting or imposing changes and revisions. I would like especially to thank Heidi Bishop, Senior Commissioning Editor at Ashgate Publishing, for her enthusiastic response to the original proposal and for her considerable patience and generosity in granting several extensions to an editor whose time was frequently not his own. I am also most grateful to the two anonymous reviewers for recognizing the merit of this collection and for the useful remarks contained in their reports to Ashgate that have assisted in the preparation and editing of this collection. I also thank Andrew Alter, Convenor of Music, and Kerry Dunne, in her previous capacity as Acting Head of the School of Arts, at the University of New England, for their continuous and enthusiastic support for this project, and understanding when it came to amount of time and resources demanded in editing this volume. I am also grateful to Mary Buck for advice on matters philosophical, and to Stephen Thorneycroft and Stephen Tafra for their advice and expertise in revising several musical examples. I am most indebted to Catherine Jeffreys for her professional expertise in the indexing of this volume. My sincerest thanks to Barbara Pretty, Senior Humanities Editor, Ashgate Publishing, for guiding this collection through its final editorial stages. Last and far from least, I warmly thank my magister and mentor Rex Eakins for proposing and co-convening the conference at which this the initial form of this body of scholarly endeavour was collectively witnessed.
List of Abbreviations

Publications

AM  Antiphonale monasticum pro diurnis horis (Tournai, 1934).
ARSI Boh Archivium Romanum Societatis Iesu, Fondo Vecchia Compagnia, Provinciae Bohemiae.
BR 1568 Brevarium Romanum (Rome, 1568) (facsimile edition: Manilio Sodi and Achille Maria Triacca (eds), Breviarium romanum: editio princeps (1568), Monumenta liturgica Concilii Tridentini [Rome, 1999]).
Diarium Dresden, Dompfarramt, Diarium of the Dresden Jesuits (2 vols, 1710–38); Excerpts published by Wolfgang Reich and Siegfried Seifert as ‘Exzerpte aus dem Diarium Missionis S.J. Dresdae’ in Günter Gattermann and Wolfgang Reich (eds), Zelenka-Studien II, Deutsche Musik im Osten, 12 (Sankt Augustin, 1997), pp. 315–75.
HMML Hill Museum and Manuscript Library.
HstCal Königl. Polnischer und Churfürstl. Sächsischer Hof- und Staats-Calender (Leipzig, 1728–, except 1730 and 1734); recent foliation is shown in square brackets.
JAMS Journal of the American Musicological Society.
Lisbon 1543 João Fernandes Ferroso, Pasionario da Semana Santa (Lisbon, 1543).
Leiria 1575 Manuel Cardoso, Passionarium iuxta Capellae Regiae Lusitaniae consuetudinem. Accentùs rationem integre observans (Leiria, 1575).
Lisbon 1595 Fratre Stephano, Liber Passionum et eorum quae a Dominica in Palmis, usque as Vesperas Sabbathi sancti inclusive, cantari solent (Lisbon, 1595).
LU Liber usualis missae et officii (Tournai, 1953).
Ven 1597 Antiphonarium sacrosancte Romane ecclesie (Venice, 1579).

**General Abbreviations**

b., bb. bar, bars  
B., BB. breve, breves (*tempus, tempora*)  
CF *cantus firmus*  

**Library Abbreviations**

CZ-Pak Prague castle, Metropolitan Chapter  
D-B Berlin, Staatsbibliothek  
D-Dl Dresden, Sächsische Landesbibliothek – Staats- und Universitätsbibliothek  
D-Dla Dresden, Sächsisches Hauptstaatsarchiv  
E-VAcP Valencia, Real Colegio: Seminario de Corpus Christi, Archivo Musical del Patriarca  
F-Pn Paris, Bibliothèque Nationale de France  
OHMA Oberhofmarschallamtes (of D-Dla)  
P-Ln Lisbon, Biblioteca Nacional de Portugal

Manuscript sigla are based upon the conventions established by the *Répertoire international des sources musicales* (RISM) project and appear at the beginning of the Bibliography at the end of this volume.

**Pitch Designation**

Octave specific pitches are designated according the pitch names of the Guidonian Gamma-ut or Hand, that is *Graves* Γ to *G*, *acutes* a to g and *superacutes* a’ to f’ in italic type except Γ. Uppercase Roman letters A to G indicate non-octave specific pitch names.
Editor’s Introduction

References to musical performances in clearly identifiable places or locales occur infrequently in surviving documents from the premodern era (I use the last convenient term here to encapsulate the more common periodizing terms the middle ages and the Renaissance). One account is that detailing the arrival of the newly elected Holy Roman Emperor, Rupert of Bavaria, at Padua 18 November 1401. Galeazzo Gatari’s account in the *Cronica carrarese* begins:

… lo ‘nperadore … arrivò in la citade de Padoa a di XVIII de mexe de novenbre MºccccºIº, e intrò per la porta da Ognisany; dove ly era misser Stivano da Carara, vescovo de Padoa, con tuta soa chierexia et le reliquie sante, cantando: *Benedictus qui venit in nomine Dominy*, e su la porta dimo[n]to da cavallo lo ‘nperadore, dove el vescovo li presentò una richisima e grande crocie d’oro, e a quella inzinoiato divotisimamente baçio, e possa si levò in piedy drito …

Although this account conflates events of 18 November with those occurring the following day, this description is interesting for a number of reasons. Firstly, music takes pride of place in Gatari’s account: it precedes all other formalities staged by Padua’s officials for the arriving Emperor, including his ritual welcome by the ecclesiastical head of the Paduan congregation, Stefano da Carrara. Secondly, this account witnesses the intersection of place (including architecture in the form of surrounding fourteenth-century Carrara walls and the old All Saints gate) and music in the one ceremonial space. All takes place in the shadow of the city walls, the effective physical limits of Padua. Within lies the physical city of Padua. The sung *Benedictus* (assuming that it is plainsong) is not particularly local in the sense that the same text and, in many cases, same music was used in the Holy Office

---

throughout Western Christendom: its text and music are universal, rather than particular, even if they happened to contain minor localizations of pronunciation or melodic ornament. But the act of singing the Benedictus localizes if we accept the view that musical performance is a social practice and that, following Michel de Certeau, social practice spatializes or, following Henri Lefebvre, social practice produces social space. Those clerics singing the Benedictus participate in establishing the limits and indeed content of the social space that coincides in this instance with the physical place of walled Padua. They contribute to the identification of the Holy Roman Emperor as Christendom’s temporal protector and agent of salvation, repeating the sung words accompanying Christ’s final entry into Jerusalem (Matthew 21:9), enacting a ritual metaphor in which the city of Padua stands for the biblical city of Jerusalem through the gates of which the Emperor proceeds in the name of the holy church. Theologically not far removed from the image of the historical Jerusalem is the paradisal city of the Book of Revelations. By recalling Christian imagery (both historical and eschatological), collective memory contributes to a sense of identity, identity that is in turn delimited by the physical space of the city walls and social space of the citizens welcoming Rupert to their city.

The previous example serves to preface the symbiotic relationship between identity and locality and music’s role in this symbiosis. The essays in this collection continue to examine identity and locality in early European music across a spectrum of repertoires. But identity and locality, as illustrated by their repeated treatment in the human sciences (especially philosophy, anthropology, sociology, social geography and cultural studies) and music research (mostly popular or traditional music studies), escape simple definitions. Yet it would be remiss not to review some of these definitions in light of the contributions herein.

Few today would accept the abstraction of society residing in Émile Durkheim’s pioneering proposition that the individual is the product of his or her society.

---


4 Most scholars of fifteenth-century music will recall the triadic relationship of Guillaume Dufay’s motet *Nuper rosarum flores* with the architecture of Florence’s Santa Maria del Fiori and symbol of Solomon’s temple most recently considered in Marvin Trachtenberg, ‘Architecture and Music Reunited: A New Reading of Dufay’s “Nuper Rosarum Flores” and the Cathedral of Florence’, *Renaissance Quarterly*, 54/3 (2001), pp. 740–77.

Unlike the premodern conception and practice of identity as a logic of sameness, the modern(ist) concept of identity is centred on the characteristic formation of personal identity or the individual by social structures. Yet, the modernist concept of identity became increasingly problematic for the study of premodern, postmodern and non-Western societies. As a result, the last half of the twentieth century saw a shift away from the modernist view that the subject (the individual) was the product of his or her society and culture to the view that the individual assumed an active role in producing his or her identity through social discourses or practices.

A prominent voice in this conceptual shift is that of Michel Foucault. Discourses as a means of production are historicized in Foucault’s formulation, the diachronic linearity of historical narrative (knowledge of the subject) is replaced by the synchronic study of systems of knowledge and technologies of power. Stuart Hall stresses that this approach does not constitute an abolition of the subject, akin to the Barthian death of the author, but a decentring or repositioning of the subject within the scope of discursive practices. But the sense of otherness and the process of alterity is crucial for identity formation in that the ‘other’ is always present as a concept even when apparent resemblances are perceived. Exclusion is inherent in social discourses of the other, as most commonly illustrated in recent scholarship on the discourses of Western Orientalism and exoticism. Hall writes:

Precisely because identities are constructed within, not outside, discourses, we need to understand them as produced in specific historical and institutional sites within specific discursive formations and practices, by specific enunciative strategies. Moreover, they emerge within the play of specific modalities of power, and thus are more the product of the marking of difference and exclusion, than they are the sign of an identical, naturally-constituted unity – an identity in its traditional meaning (that is, an all-inclusive sameness, seamless, without internal differentiation).

Difference and exclusion reside in constructions of alterity, a process that often distances the other from the social subject by means of geographical and social distance. This process marks the so-called ‘politics of location’ that Hall identifies as one of two central problems stemming from the ‘irreducibility’ of the concept of

---

identity. The politics of location, the strategies employed by a subject individually or socially in negotiating his or her identity, constitute individuals and collectives locating themselves in relation to a particular place in contradistinction to other locales and other individuals or social groups separated by geographical or social distance.

Up to this point I have used the terms place and locality (and locale) relatively freely. A more precise epistemological overview of the terms, however, is warranted. The relationship between place and locality is frequently synonymous in common usage, although locality admits a sense of an easily identifiable location or physical place. Throughout the human sciences, there is considerable slippage and disagreement in meaning between the term place and the related term space. Even in the seminal philosophical thought on physical and metaphysical space and place by ancient Greek philosophers Plato and Aristotle respectively, both terms admit shades of meaning in their common usage. Plato’s definition of χώρα or space in his Timaeus, as the geometric receptacle in which qualities and therefore a body come to be, posed a crucial problem for his successor Aristotle. For motion to occur in Plato, an object must effectively cease existing and then become again in another place. Importantly, there is no requirement that identity (as sameness) is preserved as a thing moves from place to place in Plato’s universe.

Responding in part to Plato’s theory of space, Aristotle concludes that the (proper) place (topos) of a thing is that which contains the thing (Physics IV, 4; see also Categories 4). Aristotle’s intangible place contains or surrounds a thing, it is not a property of the thing, neither its substance, essence or form. Place is static within an immobile universe. If a thing moves or changes position in Aristotle’s immobile and finite universe, it changes place. It is displaced. Unlike Plato’s space, there is no risk of a loss of identity due to locomotion in Aristotle’s place. Places may bear spatial relationships with one another, though logically there may be no coincidence between all places potentially occupied by a thing. Yet, as Benjamin Morison surmises, spatial relationships are secondary to Aristotle’s concern for addressing ‘… the underlying assumptions in our practice of saying where things are by saying what they are in; he shows that this practice implies the existence of proper places …’ (Morison’s emphasis). By locating something somewhere through the locative preposition ‘in’, by situating something in response to the interrogative ‘where’, a speaker effectively signals its proper place linguistically and metaphysically.

---

11 Ibid., p. 2.
14 This summary relies in part on Morison, On Location, Chapters 4 and 5.
15 Ibid., p. 73.
This brief summary of the Aristotelian concept of place (which is indebted to Morison’s insightful commentary) is necessary in light of the continued influence of the Stagirite’s philosophy of place from the thirteenth century onwards. Despite some earlier revisions by medieval scholastics in order to reconcile Aristotle’s philosophy with the necessity of a place for Christian heaven in the ultimate celestial sphere,16 Aristotle’s place clearly remains the object of philosophical thought until we arrive at René Descartes’s reformulation of place as position and space (as dimensions, namely length, width and breadth) as extensions of a body, not in reality, but as conceived in the mind (Principles of Philosophy, Part II, 10–15). No longer is Cartesian place a category, but the geometric extension of a body. Immanuel Kant rehabilitates place to the status of a category, but one no longer connected to the physical thing itself or its extension. Instead place resides in subjective experience, part of a priori mental concepts which determine our conception but have no direct bearing on things in themselves.17 To put it simply, place is henceforth a ‘mental thing’.18

Place’s shift from linguistic corollary to mental correlation signals the paradox of place: it is an intangible concept closely tied to the perception of a tangible reality. That place and space can be considered as something existing only in an individual’s mind, constraining perception and regulating an individual’s conception of his or her so-called reality, does not represent too difficult a proposition for historians of the premodern and early modern societies. Imagined place (both locative and architectural) features prominently in the traditions of the medieval ars memorativa as described by Mary Carruthers in her Book of Memory and The Craft of Thought.19 Ernst R. Curtius identifies the persistent cultivation of the poetic locus amoenus (‘the pleasant place’ of Guillaume de Lorris) from Latin antiquity in the literature of Latin and vernacular middle ages.20 The locus amoenus of the romances and poetry in the tradition of the Roman de la Rose is a walled garden, a bounded place functioning within a narrative and metaphorical space exercising social commentary and convention. This socialization of landscape through motifs of imagined space harks at what Simon Schama refers to as a ‘landscape tradition … the product of shared culture … built from a rich deposit of myths, memories and obsessions’,21 a tradition that exists well into the modern era. Schama, like continental philosophers and sociologists of the second half of the

---

16 See, for example, Pierre Duhem, Medieval Cosmology: Theories of Infinity, Place, Time, Void, and the Plurality of Worlds, trans. Roger Ariew (Chicago, IL, 1985), pp. 139–291.
18 Also see Lefebvre, The Production of Space, pp. 2–3.