



GOVERNANCE AND SECURITY IN JERUSALEM

The Jerusalem Old City Initiative

EDITED BY
TOM NAJEM, MICHAEL J. MOLLOY,
MICHAEL BELL AND JOHN BELL

ROUTLEDGE

The Routledge logo, which consists of a stylized white 'R' shape on a black background.

GOVERNANCE AND SECURITY IN JERUSALEM

Governance and Security in Jerusalem is the second in a series of three books which present in detail the work of the Jerusalem Old City Initiative, or JOCI, a major Canadian-led Track Two diplomatic effort, undertaken between 2003 and 2014. The aim of the Initiative was to find sustainable governance solutions for the Old City of Jerusalem, arguably the most sensitive and intractable of the final status issues dividing Palestinians and Israelis.

This book presents a collection of studies commissioned by the Initiative in aid of its work on the special regime. It is split into three parts: Part I provides background papers on governance and security issues; Part II presents Palestinian and Israeli partner perspectives on governance options for a special regime, and Part III delivers partner perspectives on security studies for a special regime. The studies written by the Israeli and Palestinian partners provide important background and historical context for JOCI's work on security and governance. The position papers, presented in their original form, greatly influenced the development of the special regime governance model.

Offering a unique insight on a range of governance and security issues in Jerusalem, this book will be of great significance to the policy-making community and students and scholars with an interest in Middle East politics, the Israeli-Palestinian conflict and the Middle East peace process.

Tom Najem is Project Manager of the Jerusalem Old City Initiative and Professor in the Department of Political Science, University of Windsor, Canada

Michael J. Molloy is Co-Director of the Jerusalem Old City Initiative and Senior Fellow at the University of Ottawa's Graduate School of Public and International Affairs, Canada

Michael Bell is Co-Director of the Jerusalem Old City Initiative, Adjunct Professor at the University of Windsor and Senior Fellow at the Norman Patterson School of International Affairs at Carleton University, Canada

John Bell is Co-Director of the Jerusalem Old City Initiative and Director of the Middle East and Mediterranean Programme at the Toledo International Center for Peace, Spain

UCLA Center for Middle East Development (CMED)

Series Editors

Steven Spiegel, UCLA

Elizabeth Matthews, California State University, San Marcos

The UCLA Center for Middle East Development (CMED) series on Middle East security and cooperation is designed to present a variety of perspectives on a specific topic, such as democracy in the Middle East, dynamics of Israeli-Palestinian relations, Gulf security, and the gender factor in the Middle East. The uniqueness of the series is that the authors write from the viewpoint of a variety of countries so that no matter what the issue, articles appear from many different states, both within and beyond the region. No existing series provides a comparable, multinational collection of authors in each volume. Thus, the series presents a combination of writers from countries who, for political reasons, do not always publish in the same volume. The series features a number of sub-themes under a single heading, covering security, social, political, and economic factors affecting the Middle East.

For a full list of titles in the series: www.routledge.com/middleeaststudies/series/CMED

1. Israeli Peacemaking Since 1967

Behind the Breakthroughs and Failure

Galia Golan

2. Justice and Peace in the Israeli-Palestinian Conflict

Yaacov Bar-Siman-Tov

3. The Political Ideology of Ayatollah Khamenei

Out of the Mouth of the Supreme Leader of Iran

Yvette Hovsepian-Bearce

4. Saudi Arabia and Nuclear Weapons

How do countries think about the bomb?

Norman Cigar

5. Track Two Diplomacy and Jerusalem

The Jerusalem Old City Initiative

Edited by Tom Najem, Michael J. Molloy, Michael Bell and John Bell

6. Reconstructing the Middle East

Political and Economic Policy

Edited by Abdulwahab Alkebsi, Nathan Brown, Charlotta Sparre

7. Governance and Security in Jerusalem

The Jerusalem Old City Initiative

Edited by Tom Najem, Michael J. Molloy, Michael Bell and John Bell

8. Contested Sites in Jerusalem

The Jerusalem Old City Initiative

Edited by Tom Najem, Michael J. Molloy, Michael Bell and John Bell

GOVERNANCE AND SECURITY IN JERUSALEM

The Jerusalem Old City Initiative

*Edited by Tom Najem, Michael J. Molloy,
Michael Bell and John Bell*

First published 2018
by Routledge
2 Park Square, Milton Park, Abingdon, Oxon OX14 4RN

and by Routledge
711 Third Avenue, New York, NY 10017

Routledge is an imprint of the Taylor & Francis Group, an informa business

© 2018 Tom Najem, Michael J. Molloy, Michael Bell and John Bell

The right of Tom Najem, Michael J. Molloy, Michael Bell and John Bell to be identified as the authors of the editorial material, and of the authors for their individual chapters, has been asserted in accordance with sections 77 and 78 of the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988.

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reprinted or reproduced or utilised in any form or by any electronic, mechanical, or other means, now known or hereafter invented, including photocopying and recording, or in any information storage or retrieval system, without permission in writing from the publishers.

Trademark notice: Product or corporate names may be trademarks or registered trademarks, and are used only for identification and explanation without intent to infringe.

British Library Cataloguing-in-Publication Data

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing-in-Publication Data

Names: Najem, Tom, editor. | Molloy, Michael J., editor. |

Bell, Michael (Ambassador), editor. | Bell, John (Diplomat), editor.

Title: Governance and security in Jerusalem : the Jerusalem Old City Initiative / edited by Tom Najem, Michael J. Molloy, Michael Bell and John Bell.

Description: Milton Park, Abingdon, Oxon ; New York, NY : Routledge, 2018. |

Series: UCLA Center for Middle East development (CMED) ; 13 |

Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2017020536 | ISBN 9781138666672 (hbk) |

ISBN 9781138666689 (pbk) | ISBN 9781315619255 (ebk)

Subjects: LCSH: Jerusalem Old City Initiative. | Yerushalayim ha-'atikah

(Jerusalem) | Jerusalem—Politics and government. | Jerusalem—International status. |

National security—Jerusalem.

Classification: LCC DS109.95 .G68 2018 | DDC 320.956.94/42—dc23

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2017020536>

ISBN: 978-1-138-66667-2 (hbk)

ISBN: 978-1-138-66668-9 (pbk)

ISBN: 978-1-315-61925-5 (ebk)

Typeset in Bembo

by Out of House Publishing

In memory of Michael Bell, co-founder of the Jerusalem Old City Initiative – diplomat, scholar, commentator and friend – who dedicated his life to the service of his country and the search for peace in the Middle East.



Taylor & Francis

Taylor & Francis Group

<http://taylorandfrancis.com>

CONTENTS

<i>List of illustrations</i>	<i>ix</i>
<i>List of contributors</i>	<i>xi</i>
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	<i>xviii</i>
Introduction	1
PART I	
Background and Context to Governance and Security	5
1 Socio-economic conditions in the Old City of Jerusalem <i>Joseph B. Glass and Rassem Khamaisi</i>	7
2 Conflict resolution in the Old City, past and future <i>Nazmi al-Jubeh and Daniel Seidemann</i>	73
3 Mapping factors of stabilization and destabilization in the Old City <i>Nazmi al-Jubeh and Daniel Seidemann</i>	89
PART II	
Governance Options for a Special Regime	105
4 Old City governance <i>Hiba Hussein and Al-Mustakbal Foundation</i>	107

viii Contents

5	A plan for governance in a special regime in Jerusalem <i>Gilead Sher with Jonathan Gillis and Naomi Vestfrid</i>	130
6	The legal parameters of the Old City of Jerusalem special regime <i>Gilead Sher with Jonathan Gillis and Amir Kadari</i>	143
7	The legal framework for a special regime: The Old City of Jerusalem <i>Mazen Qupty</i>	180
8	The Jerusalem Old City Initiative: The adjudicatory regime and dispute resolution mechanism <i>Gilead Sher</i>	197
9	Dispute resolution in the Old City <i>Timothy Donais</i>	212
PART III		
Security Studies for a Special Regime		223
10	Jerusalem security principles: The Old City <i>Issa Kassissieh and Nazmi al-Jubeh</i>	225
11	Security arrangements in the Old City of East Jerusalem <i>Yaser Dajani and Jibrin al-Bakri</i>	243
12	Security mechanism in the Holy Basin: A comprehensive analysis of security elements for a possible Old City special regime (OCSR) <i>Pini Meidan-Shani, Moty Cristal, Ariei Amit, Peri Golan and Reuven Berko</i>	250
13	The events surrounding the Mugrabi Gate: 2007 case study <i>Daniel Seidemann</i>	290
14	Jaffa Gate crossing facilities: A spatial study <i>Yehuda Greenfield-Gilat and Karen Lee Bar-Sinai</i>	310
	<i>Index</i>	327

LIST OF ILLUSTRATIONS

Figures

8.1	Flow chart for penal and administrative cases	210
12.1	Flow chart of operations and control room	273
12.2	Flow chart of operations and control room (detailed)	273
14.1	Current access through the Old City gates	314
14.2	Two movement options in the special regime	315
14.3	The proposed security process	316
14.4	Jaffe Gate area and proposed facilities	317
14.5	The proposed vehicle crossing facility	318
14.6	The proposed Jaffa Gate pedestrian entrance terminal	319
14.7	Interior view, Jaffa Gate pedestrian entrance terminal	320
14.8	Jaffa Gate pedestrian entrance facility	321
14.9	Jaffa Gate pedestrian entrance facility operation plan	322
14.10	Entrance and exit pedestrian terminals	323
14.11	Pedestrian exit terminal operation plan	323
14.12	A temporal expansion solution for the crossing facility	325

Tables

1.1	New jobs for Jerusalem	33
8.1	Jurisdiction and adjudication matrix	207
12.1	Annex 1: Muslim, Christian, Jewish events	275

x List of illustrations

Maps

0.1	The Old City	xxii
13.1	The Mugrabi Gate and its environs, pre-1967	291
13.2	The Mugrabi Gate and its environs, post-1967	295
13.3	Planned Mugrabi Gate ramp	302

CONTRIBUTORS

Editors

Tom Najem is Project Manager of the Jerusalem Old City Initiative and Professor of Political Science at the University of Windsor. He is a specialist in the field of international relations and comparative politics of the developing world, with a specialization in the Middle East and North Africa. From 2002 to 2012, Najem served as Department Head of Political Science at the University of Windsor. He has also lived and worked in the Middle East and North Africa and held previous academic appointments in Morocco and at the University of Durham, UK. His latest publications include *Track Two Diplomacy and Jerusalem: The Jerusalem Old City Initiative* (Routledge, 2017), *Syria, Press Framing and the Responsibility to Protect* (Wilfrid Laurier University Press, 2017), *Africa's Most Deadly Conflict: Media Coverage of the Humanitarian Disaster in the Congo and the United Nations Response, 1997–2008* (Wilfrid Laurier University Press, 2012), and *Lebanon: The Politics of a Penetrated Society* (Routledge, 2011).

Michael J. Molloy is Co-Director of the Jerusalem Old City Initiative, Adjunct Professor at the University of Ottawa's Graduate School of Public and International Affairs, President of the Canadian Immigration Historical Society, and an expert on global refugee affairs. He was a senior official in the Canadian Department of Foreign Affairs and International Trade (DFAIT) and Citizenship and Immigration Canada, the Canadian Ambassador to Jordan (1996–2000), and the Canadian Coordinator for the Middle East Peace Process at DFAIT (2000–2003). A founding member of the Multilateral Refugee Working Group (the Middle East Peace Process), he has worked on the Palestinian refugee issue since the early 1990s and acted as Senior Advisor for the Canadian delegation to the Multilateral Refugee Working Group. Molloy was also a member of the Canadian

team sent to select Ugandan Asian expellees in 1972, oversaw implementation of the refugee provisions of the 1976 Canadian Immigration Act, and coordinated the movement of 60,000 Indochinese refugees to Canada in 1979–1980. A career Foreign Service officer, he served in Japan, Lebanon, the USA, Geneva, Jordan (twice), Syria and Kenya. Publications include *Running on Empty: Canada and the Indochinese Refugee Movement 1975–1980* (McGill-Queens 2017).

Michael Bell is Co-Director of the Jerusalem Old City Initiative and served as the Paul Martin Senior Scholar on International Diplomacy at the University of Windsor from 2005 to 2013. Currently, he is an Adjunct Professor at the University of Windsor and Senior Fellow at the Norman Patterson School of International Affairs at Carleton University. He has served in the Middle East for many years, first as Canada's Ambassador to Jordan (1987–1990), then to Egypt (1994–1998), and Israel (1990–1992, 1999–2003), and he was also the Executive Assistant for Middle East Affairs to the Honourable Robert Stanfield (1978–1979), Director of the Middle East Relations Division (1983–1987), Director General for Central and Eastern Europe (1992–94), and Fellow at the Weatherhead Centre for International Affairs at Harvard University (1998–1999). Former Ambassador Bell was also appointed as Chair of the International Reconstruction Fund Facility for Iraq (IRFFI) Donor Committee (2005), and the Senior Scholar of Diplomacy at the Munk Centre for International Studies at the University of Toronto (2003–2005). His comments on Middle East affairs are often sought out by the press, and he is a regular contributor to the *Globe and Mail*.

John Bell is Co-Director of the Jerusalem Old City Initiative, Director of the Middle East and Mediterranean Programme at the Toledo International Center for Peace (Spain), and former Middle East Director with Search for Common Ground, Jerusalem. He was a Canadian and United Nations diplomat, serving as Political Officer at the Canadian Embassy in Cairo (1993–1996), member of Canada's delegation to the Refugee Working Group in the Peace Process (1992–1993), Political Advisor to the Personal Representative of the Secretary-General of the United Nations for southern Lebanon (2000–2001), Advisor to the Canadian Government during the Iraq crisis (2002–2003), and Consultant to the International Crisis Group on Jerusalem. Bell was also a spokesperson for the Canadian Department of Foreign Affairs, and Communications Coordinator for the Signing Conference for the International Treaty to Ban Landmines (1997). He is often asked to comment about the Middle East and has written numerous pieces for magazines and newspapers, worldwide.

Authors

Jibrin al-Bakri is a colonel and served as Governor of Bethlehem. Prior to this, he was Governor for the West Bank city of Nablus. He is an expert in security and policing matters.

Nazmi al-Jubeh is Professor of History and Archaeology at Birzeit University in Jerusalem and Trustee at the Arab Thought Forum. From 1994 to 2010, al-Jubeh was Co-Director of RIWAQ – a Ramallah-based institute that strives to conserve architecture. He is a leading specialist in the archaeology of the Old City of Jerusalem and the wider region, including holy sites, and has been involved in both official and unofficial dialogues with Israelis. He was one of three Palestinian negotiators of the Geneva Accords and Co-Signatory of the agreement. Al-Jubeh was a delegate to the Bilateral Peace Negotiations in Washington (1992–1994), and a member of the Jerusalem Task Force with Orient House. He later went on to direct the Islamic Museum in the Al-Aqsa mosque in Jerusalem, and still serves as a consultant on issues relating to Jerusalem. His publications include *Palestinian Cultural Landscape: Methodology* (Cultural Strategy for Palestine, Amman, Jordan, 2004) and *Ramallah, History and Architecture* (RIWAQ, 2002).

Arieh Amit is a retired Police Major General, consultant to the Israeli National Security Council operating within the framework of the Israeli Prime Minister's Office, and a member of the International Policy Institute for Counterterrorism, Israel. He is the former Commander-in-Chief of the Jerusalem district and has served in various capacities with the Israeli police for over twenty-five years. He has held senior positions in intelligence units, has coordinated security issues with international bodies, and has helped prepare the Israeli police for numerous international confrontations. General Amit has also been involved in the development of solutions to homeland security and growing violence in urban communities.

Karen Lee Bar-Sinai is an architect and designer, as well as Co-Founder and Director at SAYA/Design for Change, where she specializes in *Resolution Planning* – a concept she and Yehuda Greenfield-Gilat coined, referring to the idea that architecture and design can be used in conflict resolution as tools for peace. Her work has been widely presented and used by leading decision makers and state officials.

Reuven Berko is a retired police colonel and an expert on the security issues linked to the Israeli-Palestinian conflict. He was Advisor on Arab Affairs to the Israeli Ministry of Police in Jerusalem.

Moty Cristal is an expert negotiating consultant, and Founder and CEO of NEST Consulting. Cristal and his team at NEST were in charge of all civilian crisis management at the office of then Israeli Prime Minister Ehud Olmert. Cristal was also the Deputy Head of the Negotiation Management Centre at former Israeli Prime Minister Ehud Barak's office and participated in both the Camp David and Taba Summits. Following the Arab-Israeli outbreak of violence in 2000, Cristal was in charge of all preparatory work, scenario planning, and crisis management analysis. He then notably led the negotiation at the Church of the Nativity Crisis in Bethlehem in 2002.

Yaser Dajani is a leading expert on security matters and Managing Director and Head of the Business Intelligence Practice for the Kroll offices in Dubai. From 2007 to 2011, he was the Middle East and North Africa Senior Consultant at a business risk consultancy firm in England and advised a wide range of governments and corporate clients on security and development issues. Prior to this, he was the Palestinian Security Consultant for the Negotiations Affairs Department of the Palestine Liberation Organization (PLO). He served as a Policy Advisor to the Palestinian government with Adam Smith International and was also a Planning Officer in the Palestinian Ministry of Interior, in the West Bank.

Timothy Donais is Chair of the Department of Global Studies at Wilfred Laurier University, Associate Professor at the Balsillie School of International Affairs, and former Assistant Professor of Political Science at the University of Windsor. He is an expert on post-conflict peace building, questions of local ownership, and security sector reform and works closely with the Geneva Centre for the Democratic Control of Armed Forces (DCAF). In 1996, he helped supervise the first round of post-war elections in Bosnia. Donais was also a Canadian Consortium on Human Security Post-Doctoral Fellow (2003–2004) and recipient of the Centre for International Governance Innovation's Collaborative Research Award (2011). He is the author of *Peacebuilding and Local Ownership: Post-Conflict Consensus-Building* (Routledge, 2012), *The Political Economy of Peacebuilding in Post-Dayton Bosnia* (Routledge, 2006), and editor of the volume *Local Ownership and Security Sector Reform* (Lit Verlag, 2008).

Jonathan Gillis is Senior Associate at Gilead Sher, Kadari & Co. Law Offices and Chairman of *Bizchut*, the Israel Human Rights Center for People with Disabilities. Gillis has taught at Tel Aviv University, the Wharton School of the University of Pennsylvania, and Harvard Law School.

Joseph B. Glass is a geographer and Professor at Centennial College, Toronto, and former Adjunct Lecturer at the Hebrew University, Jerusalem. Glass was Honorary Secretary and Executive Committee Member for the Israel Association for Canadian Studies (1998–2003, Jerusalem), the Treasurer at the International Council for Canadian Studies (2003–2007, Ottawa), and Academic Coordinator at the Halbert Centre for Canadian Studies (1998–2004, Hebrew University). His research deals with issues on immigration, settlement, urban development, cultural studies, and historical-geography in the Middle East, Israel, Canada, and the US, and his recent publications include *Sephardi Entrepreneurs in Jerusalem: The Valero Family, 1800–1948* (Gefen, 2007) and *New Zion to Old Zion: American Jewish Immigration and Settlement in Palestine* (Wayne State University Press, 2002).

Peri Golan is a senior security expert whose research focuses on the security aspects of the Israeli-Palestinian conflict. Golan is also a consultant to various Israeli and international governmental agencies and has twenty-eight years' experience in

intelligence and counter-terrorism with the Israel Security Agency (*Shin Bet*), where he held several senior command positions, including Chief of Counterterrorism Division, and Chief of Intelligence and Counter-terrorism Operations for Israel's Southern District.

Yehuda Greenfield-Gilat is an architect and Co-Founder and Director at SAYA/Design for Change. He specializes in the connection between architectural planning, conflict resolution, and political economy, and his work has been widely acknowledged by leading decision makers and state officials.

Hiba Hussein is Managing Partner at the law firm Hussein and Hussein and has over twenty years' experience in corporate law and finance. She is a founding member and Chair of Al-Mustakbal Foundation – an independent, non-profit, and non-partisan think-tank with the aim of addressing serious economic, legal, and regulatory Palestinian issues. She has served as Legal Advisor to the Palestinian Negotiations Team in the Oslo, Stockholm, and the Camp David processes and as Vice Chair of the Palestine Securities Exchange from 1998 until 2005. Hussein also provided strategy advice and legal drafting services to various agencies of the Palestinian Authority.

The Al-Mustakbal Foundation for Strategic and Policy Studies (AMF) is an independent, non-profit and non-partisan organization that addresses pressing economic, legal and regulatory issues facing Palestinian society on the road to statehood. AMF's policy-driven programs help inform the public debate on these issues, and encourage the free and civil exchange of ideas and the exercise of the right to self-expression through other compatible organizations. Al-Mustakbal views these as elements of Palestinian civil society's contribution to concrete and positive state-building.

Amir Kadari is a practising lawyer and Managing Partner of Gilead Sher, Kadari & Co., Jerusalem, where he specializes in commercial, constitutional, and administrative law, and heads the firm's Commercial and Administrative Departments. He was a member of the legal committee of the Association for Civil Rights in Israel for many years and taught at the College of Management's law school. He is Chairman and former President of the *Keshet* Association – a non-profit organization which aims to positively influence Israeli society through children's education.

Issa Kassissieh is the former Deputy Chief of Staff to the Prime Minister of the Palestinian Authority, and was appointed Palestine's Ambassador to the Holy See in 2013. He is a leading expert on Jerusalem and held the positions of Policy Analyst in the Palestine Liberation Organization (PLO)'s Negotiation Affairs Department, Head of the Palestinian team for the multilateral component of the Middle East Peace Process, and Director of the International Relations Department at the Orient House, Jerusalem.

Rassem Khamaisi is Professor of Geography and Environmental Studies at the University of Haifa and a professional urban and regional planner, specializing in Jerusalem. He is Head of the Jewish-Arab Center at the University of Haifa and Director of the Centre for Urban Planning and Studies, and has been Head of the Executive Committee and Planning Staff of the International Peace and Cooperation Center (IPCC), East Jerusalem, since 2000. Khamaisi also participates in many planning teams in Israel, the Palestinian territories, and Jerusalem. He recently authored *Resisting Creeping Urbanization and Gentrification in the Old City of Jerusalem and its Surroundings* (Contemporary Arab Affairs, 2010) and co-authored *Jerusalem Old City: Urban Fabric and Geopolitical Implications* (IPCC, 2009).

Pini Meidan-Shani is a strategic consultant on security and conflict resolution and an expert in counter-terrorism. He served as Foreign Policy Advisor to former Israeli Prime Minister Ehud Barak and was a member of Israel's peace negotiations team during the Oslo peace process. He has twenty-five years' experience with the Israeli Air Force and Israeli Security Services.

Mazen Quity is a legal expert, political commentator, lecturer, activist, and founder of the law firm Quity, Dahleh & Associates, specializing in investment in the Palestinian territories. He is a founding member and Chairperson of the Palestinian Art Court, Jerusalem, as well as the Palestinian Association for Contemporary Art and the *KhalilSakakini* Cultural Centre, Ramallah.

Daniel Seidemann is a lawyer and expert on the legal and political dimensions of Jerusalem, particularly municipal operations, urban planning, and residency. He is Founder of Terrestrial Jerusalem – an NGO that works towards a two-state solution in resolving the issue of Jerusalem – and also founded *Ir Amim* – a non-profit association dedicated to making Jerusalem a more viable and equitable city for Israelis and Palestinians. Seidemann has participated in numerous unofficial talks between Israelis and Palestinians since 1994, and from 2000 to 2001, he served as member of an expert committee authorized by Prime Minister Barak's office to implement the emerging political understandings with the Palestinians. In 2010, he was awarded the title of honorary Member of the Order of the British Empire, in recognition of his work in Jerusalem.

Gilead Sher is the former Head of Bureau and Policy Coordinator of Israel's Prime Minister Ehud Barak. In this capacity, he served as Co-Chief Negotiator at the Camp David Summit and the Taba Talks from 1999 to 2001. A practising lawyer, Gilead is Founder and Senior Partner at the law firm Gilead Sher, Kadari & Co., Jerusalem, where he specializes in commercial law, public and administrative law, and resolving disputes, predominantly through arbitration and mediation. He is Visiting Professor at the Wharton School of the University of Pennsylvania, and Program Head at the Institute for National Security Studies (INSS) at Tel Aviv University, where he also heads the Center for Applied Negotiations (CAN).

Naomi Vestfrid is a lawyer at Gilead Sher, Kadari & Co., Law Firm, where she specializes in constitutional-administrative law, tenders, and communications law. In 2009, she represented the Foreign Press Association for the precedent-setting Supreme Court decision concerning the Association's request to enter the Gaza Strip during Operation Cast Lead.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

When we began to work on the project that became the Jerusalem Old City Initiative back in 2003, we had no idea that we were setting out on a decade-long journey. In the course of that decade, which involved dozens of trips to Jerusalem and the region, and countless meetings, we had the great privilege of working with a large number of talented men and women whose kindness and patience made the work a pleasure.

In the course of this Initiative, we consulted close to 200 individuals and dozens of institutions in Israel, the Palestinian territories, the Arab world, Europe, and the United States and Canada. To all those who gave us their time, ideas and perceptions, we are deeply grateful.

We quickly realized that to tackle such a complex and politically fraught subject as the Old City of Jerusalem, we needed to count on the knowledge, wisdom and political acumen of people who knew much more about the topic than we did. Our success was built on their knowledge, their political judgement, and their willingness to travel along with us on that long journey.

Many of these people were initially cautious about engaging in another track two initiative dealing with possibly the most difficult of the issues dividing Israelis and Palestinians. But, the idea that the key to resolving the problems posed by the Old City might be found by thinking through a special governance regime had its own attraction. We were encouraged to find people from both sides coming to regard the JOCI project as their own.

We would like to acknowledge the enormous contribution made by these people, who we have come to regard as highly valued partners and, in many cases, friends. At the last formal meeting of our regional and international partners, we found that many of the participants were reluctant to see the project end, signaling that it had become as important to many of them as it was to us.

That being said, we do not claim that every element that found its way into our proposal had the unanimous approval of those whose contributions we acknowledge in the pages below. At the end of the day we – the managers of the JOCI Initiative – take responsibility for the choices we have made.

We were extremely fortunate early in the process to encounter Ambassador Arthur Hughes of the Middle East Institute. Art was with us at the critical Istanbul meeting and participated vigorously in both the Security and Governance Working groups, where his deep Middle East experience and his diplomatic skills helped to shape the conclusions of both working groups. Beyond that, the esteem and respect he commands both in Washington and throughout his wide network of contacts enabled him to guide us through the Washington labyrinth and gain access to critical American political figures and influential public servants. Art became the voice of JOCI in Washington, and an essential member of our team.

We were also fortunate that two distinguished and exceptionally knowledgeable Jerusalemites, Nazmi al-Jubeih and Daniel Seidemann, joined the JOCI family early and, despite occasional misgivings about the direction we were taking, contributed to virtually every aspect of the work. Indeed, their contributions, insights and ideas are dotted throughout the three volumes.

Ambassador Daniel Kurtzer and the late Shira Herzog provided wise counsel and at critical moments in the process, injected creative ideas that illuminated the way forward.

Academics Menachem Klein and Salim Tamari provided thoughtful critiques of our ideas as they emerged.

The Jerusalem Old City Initiative's Security Working Group, chaired by Michael Bell, was spearheaded by General John De Chastelain, former RCMP Deputy Commissioner Roy Berlinquette, and Ambassador Art Hughes. JOCI recruited an expert security team of Israelis and Palestinians; notable among these were Pini Meidan-Shani, Moty Cristal and Issa Kassassieh, and several others who, for various reasons, asked not to be identified. The regional teams also included Arie Amit, Jibrin al-Bakri, Reuven Berko, Yasser Dajani, and Peri Golan.

The Jerusalem Old City Initiative's Governance Working Group, chaired by Mike Molloy, was spearheaded by David Cameron, Art Hughes, and Jodi White, with important contributions from Shira Herzog, Tim Donais, and Lara Friedman. Regional team leaders included two distinguished veterans of the Middle East peace process, Gilead Sher and Hiba Husseini, with specialized legal expertise being provided by Mazen Qupty and Jonathan Gillis. We also drew heavily on the expertise of the Jerusalem Institute for Israel Studies including Ruth Lapidot, Ora Aheimer, Israel Kimhi and the Palestinian think tank, *Al Mustakbal* Foundation.

Expertise on the hypersensitive holy sites was provided by Michael Dumper and Marshall Breger, while Trond Bakkevig, convenor of the Council of Religious Institutions of the Holy Land, facilitated a dialogue between the JOCI team and key Muslim, Jewish, and Christian leaders.

At a critical moment in the process, senior Israeli and Palestinian members signaled the need to review the basics of our proposals from a political perspective.

xx Acknowledgements

Thus was born the London Caucus consisting of Gilead Sher, Pini Meidan-Shani, Ambassador Manuel Hassassian, Yasser Dajani and Moty Cristal among others.

A more profound understanding of some of the issues that a special regime would have to deal with was undertaken within three separate projects on archaeology, property, and the economic implications. Lynn Swartz Dodd provided insights into the archaeological issues, Anneke Smit and David Viveash delved into the complex and murky world of private property in the Old City, while economists Ephraim Kleiman and Nadiv Halevi teased out the economic implications of a special regime.

A project of this magnitude required the cooperation and assistance of a wide variety of institutions. This undertaking would not have been possible without the generous financial assistance of the Department of Foreign Affairs and International Trade (DFAIT), the Canadian International Development Agency (CIDA), and the International Development Research Centre (IDRC). We also received assistance at critical junctures from the Centre for International Governance Innovation (CIGI) in Waterloo, the Woodrow Wilson School for Public and International Affairs at Princeton University, Search for Common Ground, and the Toledo International Centre for Peace in Madrid. For the support of all these, we are most grateful.

Rosemary Hollis of Chatham House arranged a particularly useful workshop that helped us to understand the business of creating institutions in areas emerging from conflict. Emma Murphy helped to organize a meeting at Durham University that marked the launch of JOCI as an actual track two exercise.

We wish to express our gratitude to the Canadian embassies in Tel Aviv, Washington and Amman, the Canadian representative office in Ramallah, the Canadian High Commission in London, the permanent missions of Canada to the United Nations in New York and Geneva, and the Canadian permanent mission to the European Community in Brussels. The staff of these various missions were invariably supportive and helpful.

It is important to note that none of our funders, at any time, approached us with views or advice respecting the direction of our work. We alone are responsible for JOCI's content and recommendations. Needless to say, any shortcomings are ours and ours alone.

Early institutional support was provided by the Munk Centre for International Studies at the University of Toronto, which published our initial Discussion Document in their MCIS Briefing Series. We are appreciative of the support of Janice Stein, Marketa Evans, and Sebastian Bouhnick.

The University of Windsor is the institutional home of the Jerusalem Old City Initiative. The University was a major source of funding, accommodation, and administrative support. President Alan Wildeman, Vice President Academic, Neil Gold, and the Dean of the Faculty of Arts and Social Sciences, the late Cecil Houston, recognized both the possibilities and the significance of what JOCI was attempting to do and were unstinting in their constant support. For this we are most grateful.

JOCI is situated in the Department of Political Science, where its faculty members including Abdel Salam Sidahmed and Roy Amore provided us a high level of expertise on religious matters. The JOCI Project Manager's team included a blend of staff members and talented graduate students. They included Rachelle Badour, Derek Barker, James Dunn, Crystal Ennis, Jonathan Nehmetallah, Giovanna Roma, Remy Sirls, and Shayna Zamkanei.

A special note of thanks to all who have assisted in preparing the volumes to publication, most especially to Jo Molloy and Giovanna Roma, both of whom spent countless hours over the years doing the often thankless but essential tasks associated with editing a work of this magnitude. We also appreciate the efforts (and patience) of Joe Whiting, senior acquisitions editor at Routledge, who took a strong interest in this project some time ago, and continued to provide unwavering support through to publication. Finally, a special thanks to Steven Spiegel and Elizabeth Matthews for also seeing value in the project and including it in their excellent UCLA series on Middle East Security and Cooperation.



- Green Line
- Old City Walls
- Via Dolorosa
- Major Sacred Sites
- Historical/Archeological Sites

MAP 0.1 The Old City

INTRODUCTION

This volume is the second in a three-volume series on the decade-long work (2003–2014) produced by the Jerusalem Old City Initiative (JOCI), a major Canadian-led track two exercise, based at the University of Windsor, in Windsor, Ontario. The aim of the Initiative was to find sustainable governance solutions for the Old City area of Jerusalem, arguably the most sensitive and complex issue in the long-standing conflict between Israel and the Palestinians.

The first volume, *Track Two Diplomacy and Jerusalem: The Jerusalem Old City Initiative*, describes the decade-long process, analyses JOCI in the context of current scholarship on track two diplomacy and presents in considerable detail the special regime governance model, JOCI's proposal for resolving the conflict over Jerusalem's Old City. Briefly, the special regime, as it emerged from the JOCI process, focuses on the unique, conflict creating characteristics of the Old City as a *place* rather than the *people* who reside or work in or visit the Old City. According to JOCI, the elements of the special regime should be embedded in an eventual Israeli-Palestinian treaty and would include a governance board consisting of: Israelis, Palestinians and countries designated by them; an empowered chief administrator to manage elements of friction; an international police service and a small number of specialized departments. It would have close links with a consultative committee of religious leaders. Residents of the Old City would exercise their political rights as citizens of Palestine and Israel and would receive social, educational and civic services from those countries.

The third volume, *Contested Sites in Jerusalem: The Jerusalem Old City Initiative*, examines the complex issues that arise from the overlapping claims to the

2 Introduction

Temple Mount/Haram al-Sharif, the role of UNESCO, and the implications of the JOCI special regime for such issues as archaeology, property and the economy.

This volume presents a collection of unpublished studies commissioned by the Initiative in aid of its work on the special regime. The studies written by our Israeli and Palestinian partners served two major purposes. First, they provided important background and historical context for our work on security and governance. Second, and most significantly, the studies presented Israeli and Palestinian perspectives on governance and security matters designed specifically for a special regime model. These position papers, presented here in their original form, greatly influenced the development of the special regime governance model.

The Jerusalem Old City Initiative was a unique track two exercise. As we explained in our first volume – *Track Two Diplomacy and Jerusalem* – the Initiative had built-in flexibility designed to respond to the fluidity of the political and security situation on the ground. This allowed our regional partners to continue to participate in the process even in times when it was politically difficult to do so including, for example, during the 2006 Gaza War.

But JOCI was unique in other ways as well. In standard track two initiatives, the conveners' main goal is to bring the parties together and provide an environment that is conducive to developing a resolution to a conflict. The conveners, however, rarely come to the process with proposals of their own. In JOCI's case, its founders – Michael Bell, Mike Molloy, and John Bell – had already envisioned some sort of a special regime concept by the time JOCI had become a more formalized track two initiative in 2005. Thus, regional partners bought into a track two process designed specifically to develop the special regime governance model. What is particularly important to note here is that in the process which followed and unfolded over a number of years, these regional partners – Israelis and Palestinians – with assistance from international specialists, greatly influenced the development and design of the special regime governance model. One may even go as far as to say that they took ownership of the product. The commissioned papers, and their influence on the Security and Governance Working Groups, were one important way in which regional partners influenced the special regime model.

We hope that by making these papers widely accessible, the public will be given a more complete picture of the evolution of JOCI's special regime concept and the critical role key Palestinian and Israeli participants played in its development.

This volume contains fourteen chapters and is divided into three parts: the first provides background papers on governance and security issues; the second presents Palestinian and Israeli partner perspectives on governance options for a special regime; and the third presents partner perspectives on security studies for a special regime.

Part I includes Chapters 1 through 3, with the first chapter providing a comprehensive overview of the Old City, particularly with respect to socio-economic

conditions. Co-authored by geographers Joseph Glass and Rassem Khamaisi, the study provided a wealth of data that JOCI was able to draw on in the earlier stages of its work. The study begins with a socio-economic analysis of the Old City before tackling other major issues likely to impact a special regime, including property and holy sites. The study also examines the potential impact any special regime model might have on the economic development of the Old City.

Chapters 2 and 3 examine through a historical and also a case study approach the major security challenges faced by the Old City. This includes an analysis of sensitive areas such as the Haram al-Sharif/Temple Mount complex, which pose particularly unique security challenges and are prone to trigger acts of violence. The chapters are co-written by Daniel Seidemann and Nazmi al-Jubeh, two pre-eminent specialists on Jerusalem, and key participants throughout the JOCI process.

Part II of this volume contains the position papers prepared by the main Israeli and Palestinian participants in the JOCI Governance Working Group, which was chaired by Mike Molloy. The studies, which are found in Chapters 4 through 9, look at a range of governance options for a special regime, and offer critical regional input into the development of the special regime model.

Chapter 4 includes the main Palestinian paper on governance, prepared by Hiba Husseini and her team at the Palestinian think tank, *Al-Mustakbal* Foundation. Husseini, who served as Legal Advisor to the Palestinian Negotiations Team in the Oslo, Stockholm, Camp David, and Annapolis processes, was well placed to present authoritative input from the Palestinian side.

Chapter 5 offers the main Israeli position paper on governance, and was prepared by Gilead Sher and his team. Sher served as the co-chief Negotiator at the Camp David Summit and Taba talks in the early 2000s, and was also well placed to present an authoritative Israeli perspective.

The Governance Working Group generated two sub-working groups to focus on legal dimensions and dispute resolution mechanisms; out of these came four additional studies. This included Chapters 5 and 8 by Gilead Sher; Chapter 10 by Mazin Qubty, a noted Arab-Israeli lawyer and specialist on legal dimensions of Jerusalem. Chapter 9, which provided a broader theoretical discussion on dispute resolution, was prepared by the only non-regional contributor in this volume, Dr. Tim Donais of Wilfrid Laurier University, a specialist on post-conflict peace building.

Part III of the volume contains a series of studies and position papers prepared by the main Israeli and Palestinian participants in the JOCI Security Working Group, which was chaired by Michael Bell. The Group was led by John de Chastelain, Roy Berlinquette, and Art Hughes, the three international participants, who authored JOCI's study on the security elements of the special regime, found in our first volume. The Palestinian team, which consisted of members with experience in official negotiations, contributed two position papers, presented in Chapters 10 and 11 of this volume. The Israeli team led by Pini Meidan-Shani, a member of Israel's peace negotiations team during the Oslo peace process, contributed four succinct studies. These have been amalgamated into one large document, which is presented in Chapter 12. A related study by Daniel Seidemann, providing a case study of the

4 Introduction

security dynamics during the Mugrabi Gate disturbances of 2007, is included in Chapter 13.

Part III concludes with a comprehensive study by two Israeli architects, Yehuda Greenfield-Gilat and Karen Lee Bar-Sinai, titled *Jaffa Gate Crossing Facilities: Spatial Study*. Chapter 14 addresses the physical and geographical challenges raised by a special regime model particularly with respect to security at entry and exit points in and out of the Old City. Using the Jaffa Gate as a case study, they developed a unique model, which they argued met the needs of security for a special regime, while maintaining the urban and architectural fabric of the historic Old City.

Before turning to the studies, it is worth re-emphasizing their significance. These original papers by our Israeli and Palestinian partners played a crucial role in informing JOCI's special regime model laid out in our first volume, giving it critical and decisive regional input. We will also once again point out the value of these papers on an individual level. Each offers a unique insight on a range of governance and security issues, which we feel contribute to the wider literature on Jerusalem.

PART I

Background and Context to Governance and Security



Taylor & Francis

Taylor & Francis Group

<http://taylorandfrancis.com>

1

SOCIO-ECONOMIC CONDITIONS IN THE OLD CITY OF JERUSALEM

Joseph B. Glass and Rassem Khamaisi

Section 1: Introduction

The Old City of Jerusalem is a walled area of 0.9 square kilometers (900 dunams). The present-day walls were constructed between 1537 and 1541 during the reign of Ottoman Sultan Suleiman I the Magnificent, on the foundations of earlier city walls. The walls have seven functioning gates (Jaffa on the west; New, Damascus and Herod's on the north; Lion's on the east; and Dung and Zion on the south) that allow pedestrians and vehicles to enter the city. The gates have different names in Arabic, Hebrew and other languages reflecting various historical and religious traditions.

Within the Old City, there is a high concentration of religious sites reflecting the importance of the city to Judaism, Christianity and Islam, as well as historical sites that reveal the changes in cultures and regimes that have controlled the city over five millennia. The city is home to both the relics of the past and a vibrant population of close to 35,000, while being a magnet for worshippers, pilgrims and tourists. In 2000 over 2 million tourists visited the Old City. At times there are massive influxes of worshippers, with tens of thousands gathering at the Church of the Holy Sepulchre for Easter and at the Western Wall during certain Jewish holidays. It has been estimated that between 300,000 and 400,000 Muslims have gathered to pray on the Haram al-Sharif on the last Friday of the Muslim holy month of Ramadan.¹

In 2000 there were 109 religious institutions – nineteen synagogues, twenty-five mosques and sixty-five churches – within the Old City.² In addition to the religious institutions, there are a number of educational and cultural institutions (schools, yeshivot, seminaries, museums, etc.).

The Old City had a vibrant economic life. Traditionally strongly oriented towards the tourism/pilgrimage industry, today it also provides services to its inhabitants as

well as to the inhabitants of other parts of Jerusalem and its environs. Municipal records for non-residential use properties enumerated 2,427 properties, 80 percent of which are stores and boutiques. A small amount of goods are produced at 195 workshops and six industrial establishments within the Old City.³

The Old City is an extremely complicated geographic area that includes a large and heterogeneous population, numerous religious sites and institutions, scores of stores and very limited open space. A number of studies have described certain aspects of the population, housing, infrastructure and economy. In the following pages, the data from these studies and numerous other sources are analyzed and summarized. The result is a synthesis that details the complexities of the population, its living spaces, social issues and economic activities to allow for a more in-depth understanding of the highly contested area of the Old City.

Demographic characteristics

The population of the Old City has grown rapidly. Censuses conducted in 1983 and 1995 enumerated 25,478 and 32,331 residents respectively. In 2002, an estimated 34,689 persons resided within the Old City. These population estimates do not necessarily reflect the actual situation since they result from adjusting the population count taken from the census with information from the Israeli Ministry of Interior registries. A reliable picture would require an accurate reporting of births, deaths and changes of address. However, the threat of identity card confiscation for certain Arabs in Jerusalem, the limited Ministry of Interior registration services available to the Arab sector and illegal population movements are just a few of the many factors that have resulted in the inaccurate reporting of information.

Information on the division of the population relates to statistical areas and religious denominations. The statistical areas, known as “sub-quarters” in the Israeli Central Bureau of Statistics census, closely duplicate the traditional quarters of the Old City – Christian, Armenian, Jewish and Muslim; however, they do not necessarily reflect the exact boundaries of homogeneous population groups. There are significant differences in the size, population and densities of the four quarters.

In 2002 it was estimated that 72 percent of the Old City’s population was Muslim; 17 percent Christian of various denominations; and 11 percent, Jewish. Since 1983 the population composition has changed with the Muslim and Jewish populations increasing in absolute number and proportion, and the Christian population decreasing absolutely and proportionately. The growth of the Muslim and Jewish populations, as elaborated below, is the result of positive migration flows and natural increase. With the Christian population, there has been a steady negative migration and limited natural increase.⁴

The spatial distribution of religious groups in the Old City has also been changing. The number of Muslims in the Christian Quarter increased from 609 in 1983 to 1,025 in 1995. During the same time period, the number of Jews living in the Muslim and Christian Quarters grew by 400, reaching 380 in the Muslim Quarter and 107 in the Christian Quarter. By 2002, there were an estimated 1,000

Jews living in the Muslim and Christian Quarters. In 1995, 480 Muslims and 17 Christians lived in the Jewish Quarter, mostly on the edges of the Quarter in apartments that were designated for expropriation after 1967 as part of the plan for the Jewish Quarter but which were never taken from their owners.⁵

The population groups may be further divided into sub-groups, which express ethnicity, origin and identity beyond simply religion.

Within the Muslim population there is a significant number with roots in Hebron. During the British Mandate period, Jerusalem's service sector, enhanced by the needs of the British military, attracted rural migrants particularly from the Hebron region. There was a lull in this migration between 1948 and 1967 but it was renewed after 1967 and due to its less expensive housing, the Old City was the primary destination. Often these migrants lived concentrated in large numbers in limited spaces, thus creating very high population densities. The migration of the Hebronites was turned into a political issue when certain Israeli sources claimed that an estimated 80 percent of the Arab residents of Jerusalem had migrated from Hebron and that they constituted a threat to the spatial integrity and social identity of Palestinian Jerusalemites.⁶

There are also African Muslims who originate from Chad, Sudan, Senegal, Nigeria and other African countries. Their ancestors came to Jerusalem as pilgrims and remained in housing on Bab al-Majlis Street. The area is referred to as the "African Quarter" by those who live there or, less sensitively by outsiders, as the quarter of the "blacks" or "slaves." The population of the African Quarter is estimated at 350.⁷

There are an estimated 1,000 Gypsies living in Jerusalem, mainly in the Old City, Ras al-Amud and Silwan. The Gypsies of Palestine call themselves *Dom*, which means "man" in their native Domari language. In Arabic they are called *Nawari*, derived from the word for fire; they may have been called this because many of them worked as blacksmiths in the past. The *Dom* in the Old City are concentrated in the Bab Hutta neighborhood.⁸

The Christian population is subdivided into a number of denominations that often also refer to their ethnic origin. These groups include: Greek Orthodox, Melkite (Greek Catholic), Armenian Orthodox, Armenian Catholic, Syrian Catholic, Roman Catholic, Copt, Ethiopian, Assyrian (Chaldean), Maronite, Russian Orthodox, Lutheran and Anglican. Most of the lay communities are ethnically Arab (83 percent of 14,400 Christians in Jerusalem in 2002 were Arab) and have been rooted in Jerusalem for hundreds of years. A noteworthy exception is the Armenian community which arrived in large numbers following World War I. Certain denominations are only represented by their clergy (priests, monks and nuns) who have come from around the world and who often hold foreign citizenship. The Catholic clergy includes various orders such as the Franciscans, the Sisters of the Rosary, the Salesian Sisters, the Sisters of St. Elizabeth from Poland, the White Fathers, the Sisters of Zion and the Benedictines.⁹

When the Jewish Quarter was first repopulated by Jews after 1967, 60 percent were religious and 40 percent were secular. Since then, the proportions have

changed dramatically: 70 percent are Haredim (ultra-Orthodox), 25 percent are religious-nationalist and only 5 percent are secular. The original renovation plans proposed populating the Quarter with 60 percent non-religious residents with various religious institutions scattered among them. Although the populating committees acted on the premise that the majority of residents would be intellectuals, artists and distinguished secular personalities, political influence from the National Religious Party put a stop to this trend. The lack of secular infrastructure in the physical planning of the Quarter added to this process.¹⁰ No information has been ascertained on the ethnic division between Ashkenazi and Sephardi origins, although it would appear that the majority of Jews are Ashkenazi. Additionally, between fifty and 100 Karaites¹¹ live in the Old City.

An important factor in Old City population growth is its natural increase which is defined by high birth rates and low mortality rates. While no specific data is available for the Old City, citywide data confirms this trend. For the Jewish population, the birth rate in 2002 was 24.7 per thousand. In the Old City, this rate should be higher due to the large ultra-Orthodox component. An ultra-Orthodox woman in Jerusalem can be expected to bear 7.5 children or more in her lifetime as compared to 3.8 children for the whole female Jewish population of Jerusalem. The Jerusalem Arab population has a higher birth rate of 31.8 per thousand. The birth rate for the Muslim population of the Old City is probably higher since there is quite often a correlation between high birth rates and low-income populations.¹²

The mortality rate in Jerusalem has been on the decline. Over the years, there has been a moderate decline in the rate for the Jewish population; for the Arab population the drop has been sharp and rapid to the extent that the rate for this population group is now lower than for the Jewish population. The Arab mortality rates are lower because the Arab population is younger, has a lower percent of elderly and has significantly improved access to health services.

Within the Old City, there are a number of clinics that provide services to Old City residents and others: the UNRWA Jerusalem Health Centre, the Greek Orthodox Clinic "Benedictos," the Armenian Health Services Centre, the Greek Catholic Society Infant Welfare Centre & Dental Clinic (St. Mark's Road), the Sisters of St. Elisabeth (Dom Polski), the Sisters of the Calvary (Aqbat El Batikh) and the Austrian-Arab Community Clinic.¹³ In addition, Old City residents who possess Israeli identification cards have access to clinics and hospitals in West Jerusalem.

There still is a gap in the level of health services, which is reflected in a higher infant mortality rate in the Arab sector than in the Jewish sector. Nevertheless, this gap has narrowed as seen in the significant drop in the Arab sector's infant mortality rate over the last three decades; it currently stands at 7.3 infants per thousand. The Arab infant mortality rate in the Old City probably does not differ from the citywide Arab rates. One clinic in the Old City specializes in infant and child care. Located in the Muslim Quarter, the Spafford Children's Center is a private, non-sectarian outreach program. Annually, youngsters and families from the Old City and other parts of Jerusalem make more than 30,000 visits to its Infant Welfare Center, Outpatient Clinic, Social Welfare Department, Special Education Program,

Pharmacy and Cultural Center. This clinic has been important not only in providing medical services to the young but also for educating their mothers and families.¹⁴

Migration

In general, among the Arab population, there is a process of migration into the Old City by weaker elements of the population and an emigration of the stronger ones. Due to the sensitivity of Jerusalem residency for Arabs, some population movement is not recorded. The statistics on migration are drawn from changes in address registration; accordingly, for all quarters, there was a net emigration for the six-year period of 1997–2002. For the Christian and Armenian Quarters, the movement was insignificant with both experiencing very small net migration losses. For the Jewish Quarter, there was a continuous outward migration, resulting in a net loss of 342 people over six years. This is often attributed to the inconveniences of residing in this quarter (a lack of high schools, supermarkets and other amenities, and limited accessibility by car) and its “orthodoxization.”¹⁵

The statistical data for the Muslim Quarter points to a continuous outflow of people, with a loss of nearly 2,500 residents between 1997 and 2002. However, researchers have also reported a population increase in the quarter due to unregistered in-migration and high natural growth rates. Since 1995, following the Israeli policy of confiscating identification cards from Arab citizens who no longer reside in the city, Jerusalem has witnessed an influx of identification card holders returning to live in the city so as not to lose their cards. The original and rightful residents of Jerusalem who lived and worked in the outskirts or nearby areas of Jerusalem continue to be under threat of losing their identification cards and their rights in the city.¹⁶ This sudden population increase has resulted in housing shortages for the lower income groups who cannot afford the high rents and taxes of more affluent areas in East Jerusalem. The difficulties and obstacles Palestinians face in obtaining building permits within the municipal boundaries aggravate the aforementioned housing shortage. Consequently, thousands of Jerusalem identification card holders have sought shelter in the Old City where they could stay with relatives, rent cheaply or even live as squatters in empty or abandoned historic buildings and monuments. There are no accurate statistics for the number of people who have moved back to live in the Old City. Israeli policy appears to have resulted in an increase, rather than a decrease, in the Palestinian population of Jerusalem. This has intensified demand for accommodation and basic services, and resulted in unplanned vertical and horizontal expansions and additions to existing buildings without technical guidance or supervision. This trend is affecting the physical shape and condition of the buildings and, in many cases, inflicting irreparable damage to Old City buildings of historic and cultural value.¹⁷

In the African Muslim community there is a tendency to remain in the Old City, for “few of the Quarter’s residents want to leave the area for suburban homes; there is a pull to stay close to the holy sites, they say, despite the fading draw of religious

life.”¹⁸ This may also be explained by problems of economic and social mobility. The African Muslim population is relatively poor and faces intolerance from some elements of the Arab population. It would appear that they prefer to remain within their existing social network.

There is a general trend of Christian emigration from Israel and Palestine. A Catholic Near East Welfare Association report explained that “this steady stream of Palestinian Christian emigrants has raised fears that, in the future, the Christian presence in the Holy Land will be reduced to caretakers of empty churches, museums and institutions.” Although the statistics are limited, community leaders and members have verified this increase in Palestinian Christian emigration.¹⁹ The reasons for emigration include: a lack of secure, decent and affordable housing, which especially affects young people wishing to marry and start families; economic hardship; political uncertainty; limited opportunities for an educated population; an identity crisis wherein Christians are having difficulty defining their future in a bipolar society composed of the opposing religious fundamentalisms of Judaism and Islam; changing societal norms; and the question of social freedom for Christians in a rigid and often restrictive society with an increasingly conservative Muslim majority.²⁰

At the same time, the non-Arab Christian population has grown considerably along with unprecedented numbers of legal and illegal non-Jewish residents and immigrants residing in Jerusalem, but not necessarily in the Old City.

Despite the decrease in the number of people residing in the Jewish Quarter, there is an increasing migration of Jews into the Old City. Jews connected to ideological movements and organizations for the “Judaicization” of the Old City have taken up residence in the Muslim and Christian Quarters, including people affiliated with the Ateret Cohanim group. This group’s website provides insight into its ideology and some recent developments:

For over 20 years this imposing edifice [Yeshivat Ateret Cohanim] has been the heart and core of our movement to return to all parts of the Old City. Over 120 single students as well as over 65 married Kollel scholars study here [...] In the face of violence and strife, the committed Orthodox youth in Israel have redoubled their dedication to Torah and Zion. During the last three years of the intifada, our Yeshiva has grown tremendously and our Kollel has more than doubled in size! We are literally scrambling for solutions to the overcrowded conditions in both the dormitories and the main study hall.²¹

Another group is “Living in Jerusalem,” one of whose objectives is to “reinstatement Jews into homes that belonged to Jews before they were forced out of the Old City in 1948.” Group members mean to “retake” segments of Jerusalem that have Arab majorities, such as the Christian and Muslim Quarters, and connect them to the Jewish Quarter. Ultimately, they hope to reinforce Israel’s hold on the Old City by encircling it with thriving Jewish communities in parts of East Jerusalem. Much

of their activity involves properties acquired and developed by the Miami-based philanthropist Dr. Irving Moskowitz.²²

The development of the “security barrier” around Jerusalem has triggered a population movement. Thousands of Palestinians who once lived in East Jerusalem and resided outside the complex of walls and barriers being built to the north, south and east of the city have moved back within the municipal boundaries. Unofficial estimates assert that every week some 300 Palestinians with Israeli identity cards are returning to Jerusalem’s municipal area, driven by the fear of losing their social and economic benefits. Israel Kimchi is a member of the Jerusalem Institute for Israel Studies’ task force examining the civilian and urban consequences of the walls and fences around Jerusalem on the Jewish and Arab communities both in and around the capital. He explains, “it is the most acute upheaval in the region since 1967, and affects the lives of hundreds and thousands of people.” The task force has found that some 60,000–90,000 Palestinians, who live outside Jerusalem’s municipal borders and outside the separation wall, carry Israeli identity cards, thus making them eligible for permanent residency in Israel. This population movement will undoubtedly make the housing shortage in East Jerusalem more acute and will lead to a rise in real estate prices. It is quite probable that many will settle in the Old City because of the lower housing costs there.²³

Age structure

Due to the higher birth and fertility rates in Jerusalem, the city has a young population. The median age of the population was 23 in 2002; 25 for Jews and others, and 20 for Arabs. The population of Jerusalem is younger than the national average of 28. In fact, 35 percent of Jerusalem’s population is below the age of 15 (31 percent for Jews and others, and 42 percent for Arabs) as compared to the national average of 28 percent. This has huge ramifications for the city’s economic and social issues.

In 2002, the age distribution of certain groups of the Old City’s population differed from that of Jerusalem’s population. With the exception of the 0–4 age group, the Muslim Quarter’s age distribution pattern closely paralleled that of Jerusalem’s Arab population. The Christian Quarter had a relatively older population with percentages for age groups above the age of 24 greater than the city average. This describes a population that had lower birthrates and included older clergy residing in religious institutions. The Armenian Quarter also had lower birthrates and a comparatively older population. The Jewish Quarter had a proportionately higher youth population than did the Jewish population in Jerusalem.

Noteworthy was the high percentage of the population between the ages of 0–4 in the Muslim and Jewish Quarters with figures over 18 percent in 2002. This was well above the citywide average of 12.7 percent and the denominational averages of 11.1 percent for Jews and 16.0 percent for Arabs. For the 5–14 age group, the Muslim and Jewish Quarters fell within the same parameters as their respective citywide denominations.

In 2002, the 15–24 age group comprised 23.1 percent of the Jewish Quarter's population, significantly higher than the average for the city's Jewish population, which was 18.5 percent. In 2000, this group made up 27.3 percent of the Jewish Quarter's population. These figures reflected the large number of students residing in Jewish Quarter yeshivot. The drop in the absolute number of this age group from 622 in 2000 to 542 in 2002 was due to the decreased registration of foreign and local students. In 2002 only 4.9 percent of the Jewish Quarter's population were over the age of 64 as compared to 8.2 for the general Jewish population, reflecting a lack of housing facilities for the elderly in the quarter.²⁴

Population density, housing conditions and infrastructure

The Old City has a population density of 38,500 per km² as compared to 5,400 per km² for the city as a whole. These figures are significantly lower than the densely populated sections of Cairo (109,000 people per km² in 1996) or Mumbai (111,428 per km² in the Marine Lines Ward in 1991) and are more similar to New York City's Manhattan Borough (32,157 per km² in 1998) and Paris's 11^e Arrondissement (40,829 people per km² in 1999). The difference between the Old City and New York or Paris is its lack of vertical development; in the Old City, buildings do not exceed five floors in height.²⁵

The high population density is a product of the limited amount of open space within the Old City walls. The largest open space is found on the 144 dunam Haram al-Sharif/Temple Mount, which contains green spaces and open areas that are often used by the local Muslim population. The archaeological park to the south of the Haram al-Sharif/Temple Mount also includes open areas. There are undeveloped areas in the southwest and the northeast (Burj Laqlaq) corners of the city, but attempts at development have been blocked by the Jerusalem municipality. According to an Armenian source, an attempt to clean rubbish out of the four dunam open space south of the Armenian Gardens was also thwarted by the municipality. A few open plazas exist within the Old City; of note are the plaza in the heart of the Jewish Quarter, "HaKikar HaYeshana" (the old square) in the Batei Machase area, and in the Antimos Market in the Christian Quarter. Two areas are utilized as parking lots: El-Ghazali Square just inside Lion's Gate and an area at the southern edge of the Jewish Quarter. If the open spaces are discounted in the calculation of the density, it rises to some 50,000–60,000 people per km².

The population density calculation does not include guests who stay in the hotels, hospices, hostels and other accommodation within the Old City. There are approximately twenty-five of these establishments (privately and institutionally owned); they have a combined total of over 2,000 beds. These temporary residents add to the pressures placed on the Old City's infrastructure.

Population density is not uniform throughout the Old City. The Jewish and Armenian Quarters have the lowest densities – 19.2 and 19.3 people per dunam respectively. The Christian Quarter has a density of 27.5 people per dunam, while the Muslim Quarter has 53.4 people per dunam. When the Muslim Quarter is