


Balinese Discourses on Music and Modernization

Village Voices and Urban Views

 Brita Renée Heimarck

CURRENT RESEARCH IN ETHNOMUSICOLOGY

VOLUME 5

Edited by

Jennifer C. Post

Middlebury College

A ROUTLEDGE SERIES

CURRENT RESEARCH IN ETHNOMUSICOLOGY

JENNIFER C. POST, *General Editor*

1. NEWLY COMPOSED FOLK MUSIC OF
YUGOSLAVIA
Ljerka V. Rasmussen

2. OF MERMAIDS AND ROCK SINGERS
*Placing the Self and Constructing the
Nation through Belarusan
Contemporary Music*
Maria Paula Survilla

3. "MARACATU ATÓMICO"
*Tradition, Modernity, and
Postmodernity in the Manguê
Movement of Recife, Brazil*
Philip Galinsky

4. SONGS AND GIFTS AT THE FRONTIER
*Person and Exchange in the Agusan
Monobo Possession Ritual*
José Buenconsejo

BALINESE DISCOURSES ON MUSIC
AND MODERNIZATION
VILLAGE VOICES AND URBAN VIEWS

Brita Renée Heimarck

Routledge
New York & London

Published in 2003 by
Routledge
29 West 35th Street
New York, NY 10001
www.routledge-ny.com

Published in Great Britain by
Routledge
11 New Fetter Lane
London EC4P 4EE
www.routledge.co.uk

Routledge is an imprint of the Taylor & Francis Group.
Printed in the United States of America on acid-free paper.

Copyright © 2003 by Taylor & Francis Books, Inc.

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reprinted or reproduced or utilized in any form or by any electronic, mechanical, or other means, now known or hereafter invented, including photocopying and recording, or in any information storage or retrieval system, without permission in writing from the publisher.

10 9 8 7 6 5 4 3 2

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Heimarck, Brita Renée.

Balinese discourses on music and modernization : village voices and urban views /
Brita Renée Heimarck.

p. cm. — (Current research in ethnomusicology ; v.5)

Includes bibliographical references (p.) and index.

ISBN 0-415-94208-X

1. Music—Indonesia—Bali—History and criticism. 2. Musicians—Indonesia—
Bali—Interviews. 3. Wayang. 4. Sekolah Tinggi Seni Indonesia. I. Title. II. Series.
ML345 .I57B35 2003

780'.9598'6—dc21

2002155169

for Carina

Contents

LIST OF FIGURES	ix
LIST OF TABLES	xi
LIST OF PLATES	xiii
PREFACE	xv
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS	xxiii
INTRODUCTION	3
PART ONE	
MUSICAL DISCOURSES FROM SUKAWATI: THE TRANSITION FROM TRADITIONAL TO MODERN	
CHAPTER ONE	
Historical Accounts of the Shadow Play Tradition in Banjar Babakan, Sukawati	35
CHAPTER TWO	
Bapak I Wayan Loceng: Proverbs, Metaphors, and Musical Techniques	73
CHAPTER THREE	
Interviews with the Young Generation of Shadow Play Performers in Banjar Babakan, Sukawati	95

PART TWO	
MUSICAL DISCOURSES IN THE CONTEXT OF STSI, THE INDONESIAN COLLEGE FOR THE ARTS IN DENPASAR, BALI: STSI AS A MIRROR OF MODERNIZATION BASED ON CONTINUITY AND CHANGE	
CHAPTER FOUR	
The Practices and Principles of STSI: Preservation and Development of Balinese Arts	147
CHAPTER FIVE	
STSI and Scholarship: Balinese Written Discourses on Music and the Shadow Play	185
CHAPTER SIX	
The Political Role of STSI: Indonesian Cultural Diplomacy and Cultural Policy	221
CONCLUSION	237
APPENDIX 1	
Original Indonesian Text of Interviews, Accounts, Dialogues, and Conversations with Scholars and Performers from Sukawati	245
APPENDIX 2	
Key to the Notation and Musical Transcription of “Sulendra”	255
APPENDIX 3	
Original Indonesian Text of Interviews, Accounts, Dialogues, and Conversations with Faculty and Students at STSI as well as Brief Citations of Balinese Written Discourses	273
APPENDIX 4	
The Opening Four Verses of <i>Prakempa: Sebuah Lontar Gambelan Bali</i>	277
NOTES	279
GLOSSARY	329
BIBLIOGRAPHY	343
INDEX	363

List of Figures

1.1	<i>Slendro</i> scale	25
2.1	Beginning of Section II in “Rebong,” <i>sangsib</i> and <i>polos</i> parts	81
2.2	Basic version of “Krepetan,” <i>polos</i> part, without added <i>selah</i>	86
2.3	“Krepetan” with extensive use of <i>selah</i> syncopation	86
2.4	Final theme of “Mesem,” <i>polos</i> part, to the end of the piece	88
3.1	Reasonably slow “Batel” used for traveling scenes	126
3.2	Moderate to fast “Batel” for transitional scenes	126

List of Tables

1.1	Gender Wayang Teachers of Bapak I Wayan Loceng	45
1.2	Loceng's Family Line	45
1.3	Related <i>Keluarga Dalang</i> Families	46
3.1	<i>Gender wayang</i> repertory that could be used in a complete shadow play performance from Sukawati	128
4.1	Divisions of the Ministry of Education and Culture	149
5.1	Balinese Publications on the Shadow Play and Related Art Forms	213

List of Plates

1.1	Loceng giving offerings to the gender for a tooth-filing ceremony	36
1.2	Bapak I Wayan Nartha performing wayang parwa	36
1.3	Map of Bali	38
1.4	I Wayan Wija discussing the literature he uses for shadow plays	39
2.1	Bapak I Wayan Loceng at a gender lesson	72
2.2	I Kadek Setiawan (left) and I Ketut Sukayana (right) in Sukawati	91
3.1	Performance of wayang wong	100
3.2	I Ketut Suidiana and I Wayan Mardika backstage in wayang wong	101
3.3	I Gde Wawan Octaviana practicing gender wayang with Bapak I Wayan Loceng	102
3.4	I Ketut Sukayana performing a knobbed gong in the Sekeha Gong Banjar of Banjar Babakan, Sukawati	103
3.5	I Ketut Partha giving a special performance of the shadow play in English	110
3.6	I Kadek Budi Setiawan and I Wayan Suprapta performing gender wayang for a tooth-filing ceremony in Sukawati	122
4.1	STSI staff documenting a performance of wayang babad	154
4.2	I Nyoman Sedana teaching gender wayang to I Nengah Darsana	160

4.3	I Made Bandem	166
4.4	I Wayan Dibia	166
4.5	I Wayan Rai	166
4.6	Ni Desak Made Suarti Laksmi	167
4.7	I Nyoman Astita	167
4.8	I Wayan Suweca	167

Preface

The ancient method investigated law with the lantern of justice, morality with the lantern of revelation, art with the lantern of tradition. But all these lanterns have magical properties: they transform and disfigure. The modern method examines its territory by the light of day.¹

THUS, JAMES JOYCE'S STEPHEN HERO CONTEMPLATES THE MEANING OF "modern" and attempts to distinguish between ancient and modern processes. He sees the ancient way as one in which life is viewed through the lens of spiritual values and traditional practices, whereas life in modern times presumes to be less biased and more rational. Of course a rational or scientific bias is also a filter of a different kind, despite the fact that those who hold scientific, pragmatic, or enlightenment values often consider themselves to be "objective" or without bias. Can we ever see something "as it really is" without the subtle influences of our perspective?

Joyce refers to the "magical properties" of the ancient way of perceiving life, which have the power to transform but also to disfigure the reality at hand. The concept of magic is rarely associated with a modern, urban environment, but rather tends to refer to a spiritual environment where religious and cultural traditions continue to exert a prominent influence on daily life. Bali, Indonesia is just such a place, often described as one of the few magical places left in this highly developed, heavily industrialized world. The Western desire to see Bali as an untouched paradise has caused many scholars to focus on the traditional culture, rather than document the changes that are occurring in Balinese society. Yet, like the rest of the world, Bali is undergoing processes of modernization in many aspects of life and Balinese scholars and performers are grappling with the meaning that the word "modern" will hold for them.

Understanding the meaning of the term modern can seem to be as ephemeral as the changing light of day. The light hits each area differently and with varied degrees of intensity. The modern movement in Europe occurs quite early when compared to other areas in the developing world, and it tends to entail a conscious break with traditions that came before it. On the other hand, each new movement inevitably, if unwittingly, draws upon previous developments as it embarks on new territory to claim as its own. The current study explores the particular ways in which modernization is becoming manifest in the Balinese musical landscape, including both the village arts context and the more urban college of the arts, STSI.

Through a concentration on Balinese discourses on music, this study examines modernization from different angles and perspectives. It is divided into two main parts, the first dealing with the oral histories, legends, myths, teaching discourses, performance practices, and contemporary ideas of the shadow play musicians from the village of Sukawati, a renowned center for this tradition. This material is based on both oral and written discourses, but draws primarily from discussions I had with these master performers in 1990, 1994, and 1996. In addition, my previous musical studies of the shadow play music (*gender wayang*) between 1985-88 laid the musical groundwork for this study.

Part Two examines discourses that illuminate the principles and practices of the Indonesian College of the Arts (STSI) in the urban culture of Denpasar, Bali. Lengthy dialogues with faculty at the college in 1996 elucidate the underlying premises for institutional study of the arts. This leads to a discussion of the national and local goals for the college curriculum as well as the manifold functions of the arts for local and national purposes. I consider issues such as creativity and new contexts for music, as well as the use of Balinese performances to function diplomatically as examples of Indonesian national culture abroad. In addition to utilizing oral discourses, this section provides an in-depth exploration of Balinese written discourses, from treatises to institutional writings, as they relate to music and the shadow play.

The overarching theme of this study is the role of modernization as it affects the meaning and function of the arts in Bali. Discussing modernization with both village performers trained by rote, and college-trained students and faculty enables a broad view of the changes taking place. These discussions raise important issues concerning the benefits and drawbacks of cultural development. The theories are balanced by an awareness of current practices, all of which serve to highlight key areas in need of close consideration. In particular, this study examines the important and distinct roles of the village and the college in preserving and developing the traditional arts and their place in society.

The extent to which I concentrate on and emphasize local discourses to

explore the issues of modernization in Balinese arts constitutes a new methodology, one that draws upon the discourse theories of Foucault, and recognizes the use of many voices or a “polyphony” of voices as introduced in Bakhtin’s work on literature. This methodology honors the information offered by Balinese master performers and scholars and credits them accordingly. Further, the broad coverage of diverse topics included in this study breaks down the dichotomies typically found in scholarship, including theory versus practice, music versus discourse, and archival versus oral history. These various aspects are equally treated in this discourse-oriented musical ethnography of contemporary life in Bali.

Many aspects of this study have yet to be published: the particular type of oral histories gathered here from Balinese shadow play performers have not been published before, and there are no prior Western publications documenting STSI in Denpasar. Furthermore, scholarship has resisted the concept of modernization in Bali, since many scholars outside of Bali have continued to view it as a traditional culture. Current interest in changes occurring in the arts as well as the role of colleges in manifesting processes of globalization and modernization make this a timely case study.

Bali is a natural choice for this type of investigation since the culture has been challenged and modified by decades of global tourism. Many developing countries have looked to Bali as an example of a place that has managed to maintain its own traditions at the same time that it has adopted changes in the ceremonial, political, and economic contexts for the arts. In short, Bali has embraced Westernization and modernization in various forms while simultaneously preserving the traditional arts and ritual life.

Different voices are heard in this study; they are not blended into the monological voice of one author, although the author is certainly one of the primary voices engaged in and overseeing the discussion. With diverse voices present, they can engage in dialogic discussion and explore various sides of certain issues. The argument that develops is not onefold but manifold, as appropriate to the complexities of contemporary life. Still the author’s chosen theme of the shadow play tradition and influences of modernization hold the voices together as they consider common concerns.

Too often critical theory remains separate from musical ethnography, or it is so far in the background that the theoretical underpinning is never actually explained. By contrast, the introduction to this study explores in detail the theories relevant to this approach, and the work of theorists, musicologists, and ethnomusicologists are applied as necessary.

Since this dissertation was completed in 1998, a number of important and relevant works in the areas pertaining to my research have been published. In terms of Balinese music several works deserve mention. In Michael Tenzer’s recent book, *Gamelan Gong Kebyar: The Art of Twentieth-Century Balinese Music*, he upholds the need for a close analy-

sis of this music in order to distinguish its component parts.² Through analysis different influences and innovations can be detected in the music itself. Tenzer views the twentieth-century Balinese gamelan music of *Gong Kebyar* as modern music that serves as an “emblem of a rapidly changing way of life.”³ By investigating the notes themselves, Tenzer claims a preference for a theoretical, modernistic approach over the contextual, dialogical, or historical. He refers to a strictly musical discourse when he discusses a “discourse of topics and syntax,”⁴ nonetheless, he implicitly honors the work of Balinese teachers and specifically composers in his extensive efforts to understand Balinese contemporary music.

Tenzer’s approach is almost the counter-opposite of my own, but despite his call for “music’s liberation from culture-specific values,”⁵ he actually provides a good deal of historical background that helps to set the social and political context for the genres covered in his investigation. Tenzer’s work is valuable as a study of Balinese gamelan music in its musical complexity.

A very different approach can be found in Michael B. Bakan’s study of *gamelan beleganjur* music, which is written in a candid, personal style that is often humorous.⁶ Closer to McPhee’s *A House in Bali* than his *Music in Bali*, Bakan’s study gives the reader an experience of Balinese musical life through his own musical experiences there. In this way, Bakan draws upon developments in reflexive and dialogical ethnomusicology which acknowledge the researcher as an active participant in fieldwork, not a seemingly objective observer or insignificant “bit player.”⁷ His introductory description of the scholarly process metaphorically associated with the ritual burning of effigies in various cremation ceremonies highlights the role of ethnomusicologists as they attempt to transform experience into a written document. The romance and subsequent disillusionment experienced by researchers as they move from spontaneous experience to careful documentation—with the necessary distance that implies—must be commonly felt by ethnomusicologists on return research trips.

Despite Bakan’s concerns about the unorthodox nature of his approach, it is valid to include the personal insights and experiential accounts of the researcher since they represent material that is highly relevant to the international world of researchers generally reading these texts, not so much in our efforts to understand the “Other,” but in our often hidden efforts to understand ourselves. While I consciously emphasize diverse Balinese voices in my study, I also recognize the valid place for the voice of the Western researcher in this field. Bakan’s study is a useful document of the various contexts for and musical styles of *gamelan beleganjur*, and related political and gender issues. In its exploration of music-learning and musical experience, it represents a newer type of musical ethnography that includes the researcher-performer more explicitly in its scope.

The study closest to my own in terms of musical repertoire and yet vastly different in terms of approach is Lisa Gold's dissertation, "The *Gender Wayang* Repertoire in Theater and Ritual: A Study of Balinese Musical Meaning."⁸ Gold examines musical sound in theatrical and ceremonial performances of the present in contrast to discussions of the past (*zaman dulu*) but she does not deal with modern life or modernization as it influences these traditions. Like myself, Gold concentrates on the *gender wayang* music and the shadow play tradition but she is more focused on the interrelations between the music and the vocal parts of the shadow master. Through a great deal of analysis and frequent reference to various classification systems, Gold documents the music played for ritual occasions such as tooth-filing and cremation ceremonies, and explores the ways in which music gives shape to these contexts. She conducted her fieldwork in three areas of southern Bali: Sukawati (Gianyar), Tunjuk (Tabanan), and Kayu Mas (Denpasar). She clarifies that she does not cover the regional variation of *gender* playing styles, but rather their linked transmission histories. In particular she documents "the choice of *gender* pieces used and the interpretation of the meaning of those pieces."⁹ Clearly, this is a comprehensive and valuable study of shadow play music and theater in southern Bali.

On the topic of traditional music and change, recent studies have documented the various changes occurring in the performance of Chinese music.¹⁰ In the brief but relevant article by Xiu Hailin on the issue of Westernization in China's modern music education system, he writes: "At the beginning of the century, music notation, techniques of playing musical instruments, and the art of vocal music and musical theories of Western music became the main content of music education of Chinese schools... Western music theories and compositions have become 'models' to follow while traditional music only retains a weak position in the school curriculum."¹¹ Many talented musicians began in China and then went abroad for further musical training. Cai Yuanpei aimed to blend "the Western scientific spirit" with Confucian traditions and the old Chinese culture. He also urged artists to learn how to create, not just to imitate, in order to develop a "new oriental art."¹² In Part Two of my study I discuss the introduction of Western music theory and the English language into the STSI curriculum and the various goals of the college including both preservation and development or new creations in the arts. I also consider the influence of Western music on contemporary composers in Bali.

Also in *Musical Performance: An International Journal* Vol. 2, Tsui Yingfai writes, citing Nettl, "that the word 'modern' is used from an insider's standpoint. In the eyes of the Chinese people, the Chinese folk orchestra is a tradition continued from traditional instrumental practices. Westernization (in a general sense) is only a means for modernization rather than a goal."¹³ He concludes,

During the first half of the twentieth century, the Western value system overrode that of the Chinese in many aspects of their culture. Western music was, therefore, regarded as superior in the eyes of Chinese literati. Western harmony became a symbol of modernity and advancement. As a result, the Westernized Chinese folk orchestra was established and Western harmony was adopted in Chinese musical composition. Since the 1950s, the Han-Chinese modal-harmony system was developed for writing Chinese flavored music. However, the system itself is, to a certain extent, a variant of the Western harmony system. The increasing complexity in music in the 80s brings the Chinese folk orchestral compositions closer to Western music than before.¹⁴

It is instructive to compare the Balinese case to that of the Chinese in their different approaches to Western influence. As I document in this study, the Balinese college of the arts has primarily emphasized Balinese traditional or contemporary music and art, and only more recently expanded to include musical traditions from other parts of Indonesia and Asia, and a small degree of Western music theory, which is still applied towards the understanding of Balinese traditions. Clearly the Chinese music institutions, teachers, and performers have adopted far more Western goals and music practices than the Balinese example, which is why I have chosen to concentrate on the broader influences and processes of modernization rather than restrict my investigation to the more limited focus of and one-sided power dimensions implicit in the term Westernization. While certain Western preoccupations are adopted in the college curriculum, including an increase in research, analysis, theory and interpretation, it is important to recognize that the fundamental aim of Balinese artists and intellectuals is not to become Western, but to be modern Balinese.

In the area of music and modernity, Veit Erlmann notes the way in which the nineteenth and twentieth centuries have been construed as “being characteristic of *modern forms of social order and social process*.”¹⁵ Yet, “modernity, even by the least parochial views, cannot be described anymore as European specialty.”¹⁶ Finally, histories written from an all-inclusive single vantage point begin to wane “in direct relation to the crumbling order of imperial domination.”¹⁷

Erlmann investigates the role of music in global culture over the past hundred years. He refers to the “global imagination” as an articulation of interests, languages, styles, and images that influence the making of modern subjectivities beyond the immediate realm of one’s personal experience. This new global reality “engages Westerners and non-Westerners in complex, multiply mirrored ways.”¹⁸

Another area related to modernization but not specifically covered in my study is the influence of new technologies leading to an increase in

mass-marketed popular music. This subject is discussed in several studies including Timothy D. Taylor *Global Pop: World Music, World Markets* (New York: Routledge, 1997), and by Peter Manuel, *Cassette Culture: Popular Music and Technology in North India* (Chicago and London: The University of Chicago Press, 1993), and *Popular Musics of the Non-Western World: An Introductory Survey* (New York and Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1988). By contrast, my study concentrates on the effects of modernization on the ancient and ceremonial shadow play music (*gender wayang*), and on the institutional study of music at the Indonesian College of the Arts in Denpasar.¹⁹

Acknowledgments

I WOULD LIKE TO EXTEND MY DEEPEST GRATITUDE TO ALL OF THE BALINESE musicians, shadow puppeteers, and scholars who shared their ideas, stories, performances, and music with me, and whose voices permeate every part of this book. Beginning with the inestimable value of over three years of *gender wayang* lessons with Bapak I Wayan Loceng, and Bapak I Wayan Nartha's rich introduction to the intricate art of *pedalangan*, my research extended to the work of the brilliant scholars and performers who teach and study at the Indonesian College of the Arts (STSI) in Denpasar. Additional thanks for my work in Banjar Babakan, Sukawati go to Wayan Nondri, Ketut Sukayana, Wayan Suprpta, Wayan Mardika Bhuana, Madé Juando, Kadek Suartaya, and Madé Sudiasih, Wayan Harci and Madé who sadly are no longer with us, Ketut Buda Astra, Wayan Sarga, Ketut Sitin Nyemplo, Kadek Budi Setiawan, Ketut Sudiana, Nyoman Ganjereng, Wayan Warga, Komang Ariawan, Kadek Budi Setiawan, and two diligent and creative performers who have since passed on, Gde Wawan Octaviyana and Ketut Partha. In addition, Loceng's niece, Nyoman was extremely helpful in locating the manuscript of *Babad Timbul, Sukawati*. I am also indebted to Wayan Wija for allowing me to videotape many of his performances and for his willingness to discuss the philosophy and stories contained therein.

Outside of Sukawati, I had valuable discussions and music sessions with I Gusti Ketut Kerta in Pengosekan, and profound dialogues with I Tjokorda Dangan in Sidemen. I Madé Sugiarta in Ubud raised many fascinating subjects, and Ida Bagus (Guski) Suarsana as well as his wife Karen Waddell, a very old friend, contributed valuable perspectives as well. Additional support in Bali was offered by Barbara Mintz, Michelle Chin,

and the many other students of Loceng who are too numerous to name here.

For their very valuable time and insightful perspectives, the faculty, students, and administrative staff at STSI were fundamental to the development of this dissertation, and I am grateful to the following scholars: Madé Bandem, Wayan Dibia, Wayan Rai, Madé Wiratini, Nyoman Astita, Nyoman Sedana, Nyoman Catra, Wayan Suweca, Desak Madé Suarti Laksmi, Swasthi Widjaja Bandem, Kadek Widnyana, Madé Sidia, and the *pedalangan* students, such as Nengah Darsana.

I appreciate the assistance given by staff at the Gedong Kirtya Archive in Singaraja, the Department of Education and Culture in Denpasar, the Department of Literature for Udayana University, and the STSI library and archives. I am especially grateful to STSI and in particular to Madé Bandem for supporting my applications to study at the college from my first visit in 1985, to subsequent research trips in 1988, 1990, 1994, and 1996. Official recognition of my work was essential for visa purposes and helped to pave the way for my ongoing studies of Balinese music. Of course, I am forever indebted to the Fulbright-Hays Program for supporting my initial music studies in Bali.

I have been very fortunate to receive grants and fellowships that enabled me to conduct dissertation fieldwork in Bali on repeated occasions, as well as to complete my Ph.D. studies at Cornell. For this support, I would like to express my gratitude to the Jacob K. Javits Fellowship that supported my doctoral studies at Cornell and covered a majority of my research expenses in Bali. I also received two Research Travel Grants from Cornell University and the Einaudi Center for International Studies, as well as from the Southeast Asia Program at Cornell University. I would also like to thank the entire Cornell University Music Department and the Southeast Asia Program, and in particular, Jane Belonsoff for helping me navigate the unpredictable bureaucratic waters. The outstanding facilities of the Cornell University libraries and the excellent collection at the University of Calgary have also contributed immensely to my work.

To Bapak Loceng, who has worked with me with great devotion to passing on the shadow play repertoire I can only say that, to the extent that I have finally managed to climb this mountain, much of the credit goes to him.

Effusive thanks are due to the patience and hard work of my dissertation advisor at Cornell, Professor Martin Hatch, whose sound advice and broad perspectives led me down roads I would not have otherwise explored. I am also indebted to my entire Ph.D. committee, Stanley J. O'Connor, whose poetic approach to scholarship and concern for a humane education are in keeping with many of the issues raised in this dissertation; Keith Taylor, whose knowledge of theory has clearly influenced

my work; and in particular to Becky Harris-Warrick, whose scrupulous attention led to vast improvements in this study.

Warm thanks are due to Villa I Tatti, the Harvard University Center for Italian Renaissance Studies, for the use of an old monastery in the hills of Florence where the first draft of this dissertation was written; their invigorating and intellectually stimulating company was most appreciated.

I would also like to thank the University of Calgary for enabling me to fulfill this research project through a Starter Grant that provided me with state-of-the-art computer equipment, and the research time needed to complete this work. William Jordan, a composer at the University of Calgary, provided crucial assistance in turning my rough handwritten transcriptions into beautiful printed copies. And in the University of Calgary computer lab, Peter Morgan and Anthony Reimer provided technical assistance essential in the final stages.

Finally, I am deeply grateful to my friends and family for their love and support. I am ever thankful to my parents, Claire and Gregory Heimarck for their extraordinary generosity and kindness and their steadfast belief in me, and to my brilliant sisters, Kaia, Tamara, and Heather for their enduring friendship. My heartfelt gratitude goes to my husband, Ani, whose vital presence, insights, criticism, and loving support have greatly influenced me. And last but far from least, I appreciate the patience and sweetness of my young daughter Carina who has generously adapted to my busy schedule and provided countless moments of inspiration. For this, I dedicate this publication to her.

BALINESE DISCOURSES ON MUSIC AND MODERNIZATION

Introduction

THIS BOOK EXPLORES MUSICAL MODERNIZATION IN BALI AS SEEN THROUGH changes in the shadow play tradition and in the institutional study of music.¹ These two areas are represented by oral and written discourses from Banjar Babakan, Sukawati and the Indonesian College of the Arts (STSI) in Denpasar. Sukawati is the village best known for the shadow play, and their musicians play in the most rapid and complex manner. They are respected for the difficulty of their music and for their virtuoso performance style. STSI is the only institution for higher education in the arts in Bali.

The scope of this study derives from an awareness of historical circumstances, past and present, developed through extensive fieldwork over a period of twelve years, and lengthy discussions with individual musicians and scholars both in Sukawati and at STSI. The time span covered is basically the musical life of the oldest musician with whom I have worked, Bapak I Wayan Loceng, who had been playing *gender wayang* for sixty years when I completed this research in 1996. The time period of 1936-1996 is supplemented by a discussion of several early music treatises that derive from the late nineteenth or early twentieth century, with more recent editions—including copies and translations—produced in the past twenty years.

As I examine changes in Balinese music practices, I will also explore a new approach to ethnomusicology. Over the past two decades, ethnomusicologists and anthropologists have begun to cite more explicitly their interactions with foreign colleagues, and to use dialogue as a theoretical paradigm and as a stimulus for new styles of ethnographic writing. In particular I am referring to a movement in anthropology called “dialogical anthro-

pology.” The discipline of ethnomusicology is still relatively new to the debate on dialogue.² While no one would dispute the importance of local voices in the attempt to understand certain artistic traditions, the perspectives of local practitioners are still most often relayed through the voice of the Western author. Local specialists contribute to the work of Western scholars but are rarely cited at length.

The goal of this book is to allow the voices of Balinese musicians and scholars to be equal partners or at least active participants in an in-depth discussion concerning their culture. To achieve this goal it is necessary to develop a new methodology, one which concentrates on their discourses. This emphasis on local discourses allows Balinese spoken and published views to be heard more clearly and in more depth with regard to the study, performance, and modernization of their music.

BACKGROUND

I went to Bali in 1985 on a Fulbright Scholarship to study the shadow play music, *gender wayang*. I stayed for nearly two years (1985-87), studying with Bapak I Wayan Loceng in Banjar Babakan, Sukawati. At the same time, I was affiliated with the Indonesian College of the Arts (STSI). I returned to Bali in 1988 for six months, at which time I studied *gender wayang* further and developed my understanding of Balinese religion. In my third visit to Bali, in the summer of 1990, I completed research for my M.A. thesis entitled, “*Gender Wayang* as a Microcosm of Balinese Culture” (UCLA, 1991). In my master’s thesis I discussed the ceremonial contexts for *gender wayang* performances, the sacred concepts about music in Bali, cultural aspects of the music lesson, *gender wayang* music as an embodiment of Balinese culture, and I transcribed and analyzed the introductory piece “Sulendra.”

When I returned to Bali in 1994, after a four-year absence, I was startled by developments taking place in the central region of the island. The main road from Denpasar to Ubud was now almost completely lined by art galleries and tourist shops, whereas in 1985 there had been long stretches of wet ricefields. The traffic had increased considerably, as numerous Balinese had bought cars and motorbikes over the previous four years. With the increase in commerce, more commercial trucks clogged the roads and polluted the air with the exhaust from diesel-fueled engines. Ubud had grown from a modest village to a busy town. Countless hotels and bungalows advertised on the main streets of Ubud, and many restaurants had opened along the main roads.

Despite these economic developments, in some ways, the performers in Sukawati seemed largely unchanged. The various structures within Loceng’s family compound had been renovated and expanded over the

years, but they were still enclosed within the same compound walls and he still taught throughout the day on one of his tiled porches. He had more instruments, a new kitchen, a new large television, motorbikes, and a telephone, yet his focus on the shadow play music remained the same. He taught more and performed a bit less, perhaps, than in his youth, but he had made a conscious choice to support himself by teaching *gender wayang* privately at his home and he had succeeded in that.

Due to the technological and economic advances taking place in Bali—the dirt road outside Loceng's house was now paved, water was piped in to the bathroom and kitchen, there was ample electricity, and telephones were much more widely available—combined with Loceng's complaints about changes occurring in the musical practices of the younger generation, I decided to concentrate on modernization in Bali as it affects the *gender wayang* music and the shadow play tradition. In 1994, supported by a pre-dissertation Research Travel Grant from Cornell University and a Jacob Javits Fellowship for doctoral studies, I conducted research on Balinese texts on music, working in the archives in Denpasar, in addition to pursuing music studies in Sukawati.

I returned to Bali in 1996 for a total of five months to conduct the fieldwork for this dissertation. This research was funded by the Jacob Javits Fellowship, as well as a Research Travel Grant from the Mario Einaudi Center for International Studies and the Southeast Asia Program at Cornell University. During this time, in addition to studying music with Loceng and discussing all aspects of the shadow play tradition with him, I interviewed many of the younger shadow play performers from Banjar Babakan as well as key faculty at STSI. These interviews, along with written treatises and Balinese scholarship on music, form the primary basis for this study of Balinese discourses on music.

During my first of two visits to Bali in 1996, I lived in the village of Pengosekan, just South of Ubud, and I observed the women's gamelan there while continuing to study *gender wayang* in Sukawati. After about six weeks I decided to move to Loceng's house in Sukawati in order to see what his family's daily lives entailed: how much television did the young generation watch, how many students did Loceng teach in one day, how modern or traditional were their lifestyles. By living in Loceng's family compound, as part of the family, in a room that I rented for a small fee (normally his son Wayan's room), I was able to discuss the music, shadow play, and other Balinese customs with members of Loceng's nuclear and extended family. Cousins would drop by from the house behind Loceng's or from down the road, and practice *gender* or talk. We all gathered for some kind of evening meal, often buying stir-fried rice and vegetables, a Chinese omelette, and a sweetened mung bean drink (*kacang hijau*) from the night market nearby.³ All of these occasions were opportunities for me to talk casually with var-

ious members of the *keluarga dalang* family. These moments gave me a chance to observe their daily activities and to listen to their perspectives on a wide range of issues.

Because Loceng had so many Japanese students, he would often study Japanese *kanji* characters when his students finally left him for the day. His diligence was everywhere apparent: he rose at 6am, taught all morning and afternoon, he sometimes performed in the evening until quite late, he studied languages if he had any spare time, and he swept the yard many times each day to keep the leaves out of the gravel so that it would look clean and tidy. In addition to over thirty cassette tapes of *gender* lessons I recorded from 1985 onwards, I have dozens of tapes of my dialogues with Loceng on musical and cultural topics. These discussions went on for hours, and sometimes continued into the evening, especially when my departure from Bali became imminent; Loceng was more concerned about answering my questions than about his own schedule.

Having lived and studied for over three years in Bali between 1985 and 1996, I have seen changes occurring in Balinese society and in their practice of the arts. The rate of change increased dramatically between 1990 and 1996, therefore it is an appropriate time to examine the effects of modernization on Balinese society, and in particular, modern influences on *gender wayang* music and the shadow play tradition.

While I have studied *gender wayang* for many years, I have chosen not to base my thesis on a codification (or transcriptions) of the shadow play music in its ritual or performance context, partly because I have discussed certain musical and contextual aspects of *gender wayang* in my Master's thesis, and partly to avoid duplication of another dissertation being written on this tradition (Lisa Gold, UC Berkeley). Both Lisa and I have worked extensively with Bapak Loceng over many years, and she was writing on Balinese shadow play music in its ritual context at the same time that I wrote the current study. Rather than repeat the same information, I purposely explored new territory and raised different issues concerning the shadow play music and performers from Banjar Babakan, Sukawati.⁴ In particular, in Part One, I am concerned with performers' perspectives on modernization and the changes in their musical and cultural traditions. And in Part Two, I discuss the goals and curriculum at STSI as a modern institution for music study.

MUSIC AND MODERNIZATION

The fieldwork period represented in this dissertation, the years between 1985 and 1996, reveals a state of tension in Bali between traditional culture and culture that is rapidly opening up to outside influences. The voices heard in this dissertation come from a wide spectrum of musicians, from

the guardians of traditional practices to innovators of the new, with most people balancing aspects of the old and the new in lifestyles that are simultaneously traditional and modern. In order to explore contemporary Balinese musical life, I have worked closely with musicians and *dalangs* (shadow play puppeteers) from Banjar Babakan, Sukawati, and scholars, teachers, administrators, and students from the Indonesian College of the Arts (STSI) in the city of Denpasar. These two areas provide a useful contrast between the musical thought of a traditional village and that of an urban, modern college. At the same time, their musical ideas and practices interrelate, since many of the Sukawati performers are faculty or students at the college, and other faculty and administrators at STSI also come from Balinese villages renowned for the traditional arts.

Because the shadow play is an ancient art form, and this tradition is particularly long-standing in Banjar Babakan, Sukawati, studies with these performers provide a useful comparison between early performance practices and the changed conditions in contemporary society. Distinguished performers from the older generation give valuable information on the practice of the shadow play fifty to sixty years ago. Their accounts are at once historical, musical, philosophical, and technical and offer their critiques based on decades of experience. Interviews with the younger generation help to clarify current perspectives on the tradition and to confirm developments taking place.

Some of the changes I have observed in the shadow play tradition involve the use of faster tempi, shorter performances, reductions in the use of the literary language, Kawi, and increases in colloquial Balinese, and preferences for humor over philosophical teachings. Loceng has developed *gender wayang* over many years, making the music more complex, extremely fast, and full of virtuoso performance techniques. Nonetheless, the current interest in shorter performances can cause musicians and *dalangs* to delete certain pieces from the active performance repertory.

These changes are connected to certain processes of modernization occurring in the society at large. Long and busy work days and an increased familiarity with shorter programs on television and in tourist performances have influenced the preference for shorter performances that start and end earlier. Fifty years ago, shadow plays started late at night and continued until dawn, but now, modern Balinese prefer to start at an earlier hour and end the same evening in order to sleep at night and prepare for another busy day the following morning. Thus the timing and duration of the shadow play have been altered to accommodate a modern work schedule. One also notices a correlation between the faster pace of life and the faster tempi in particular pieces, as well as the more rapid development from the opening meeting scene to the final battle scene in a shadow play performance, but this is just one of many elements that occur in a process

of modernization. The increased use of Balinese over Kawi is part of a trend towards use of the vernacular in the arts. Since most Balinese do not know Kawi, the use of Balinese reduces the mystery, but increases the comprehensibility of the text. Finally, by adding more humor to performances, artists try to relieve some of the stresses of modern life. Other aspects of the tradition are maintained to varying degrees, including the spiritual dimensions of prayer and *taksu* (divine inspiration) as integral to performance, and a great deal of the musical and literary content.

The well-known ethnomusicologist Bruno Nettl has distinguished three motivating factors for the production of music in non-Western societies. One motivation is the desire to totally preserve traditional culture. Another motivation is complete Westernization, “that is, simple incorporation of a society into the Western cultural system.”⁵ The third motivation for certain non-Western music practices is modernization, which combines aspects from the first two categories. Nettl defines modernization in this context as “the adoption and adaptation of Western technology and other products of Western culture, as needed, simultaneously with an insistence that the core of cultural values will not change greatly and does not match those of the West.”⁶ Nettl distinguishes between Westernization in which “non-Western music has been changed to make it in the minds of everyone concerned a particular kind of Western music,” and modernization, in which “the desire has been to create a new, adapted, modernized version of the original.”⁷ In the latter case, non-Western musicians may feel that in order to maintain their traditions in a more modern society it is in their own interest to incorporate certain “compatible but noncentral elements” from the West. For example, they might simulate Western scales, adopt Western concert settings and forms of patronage, or begin to use musical notation.⁸ Balinese musicians have adapted certain aspects of Western technology, such as microphones and amplification, into artistic performances, while maintaining the traditional value and ritual function of Balinese arts.⁹ Musical modernization in Bali has not meant the adoption of Western culture, but rather the adaptation of Balinese traditions to accommodate certain preferences of modern life, such as faster tempi and more complex musical textures.

Key to the stimulus to modernize, is what it means to be “modern.” Modern, recent, late, apply to that which is near to or characteristic of the present as contrasted with any other time. Modern is applied to those things that exist in the present age, especially in contrast to those of a former age or an age long past; hence the word sometimes has the connotation of up-to-date and, thus, good: modern ideas.¹⁰

This definition is quite consistent with the views expressed by Balinese performers in our discussions, cited in chapter three. With regard to the arts, “modern” is defined in various English dictionaries produced in the West as: “of, pertaining to, or characteristic of contemporary styles of art, literature, music, etc., that reject traditionally accepted or sanctioned forms and emphasize individual experimentation and sensibility.”¹¹ Or more simply: “Of a movement in art and architecture, or the works produced by such a movement: characterized by a departure from or a repudiation of accepted or traditional styles and values.”¹² In the case of Balinese music, modernization does not entail a total repudiation of past traditions but rather an alteration of them to adapt them to modern needs. Compositional and performance practices evince a merging of old and new as part of the transition from tradition to modernity.

Musical practices reflect the trend towards modernization in the type of training students receive, in performance practices, and in regard to new contexts for performance. In temple ceremonies, performers offer their skills freely for the entertainment of the gods; the human audience is a secondary concern. In this context, the shadow master is a medium for the gods’ words of wisdom (and previously the voices of the ancestors), which he relays to the middle world of humans. In many new contexts for the arts which are not tied to sacred ceremonies, such as musical demonstrations, concerts, music festivals, competitions, and tourist performances, the gods are no longer the primary concern. Instead, Balinese jurors (for arts competitions), civilians, and foreign tourists make up the audience and influence the duration, form, and content of the performance.

In musical composition, Balinese composers often begin with a traditional model and then add to or alter it in order to develop a “new” piece or a new version of a traditional art form. A reasonably new shadow play like *wayang babad* uses the traditional shadow play staging, but instead of the Hindu epics, the stories are based on Balinese history and it incorporates new designs for the traditional leather puppets and new music. In the curriculum at STSI, the study of traditional art forms, literature, and languages is increasingly supplemented by the study of non-Balinese Indonesian art forms (especially Javanese, and Sundanese), Western music theory, and the English language. Through these compositional processes and through the institutional curriculum the traditional arts are maintained, while incremental steps lead in new directions.

Modernization influences different aspects of the shadow play tradition, including the transportation used to go to performances, which has progressed from walking, to the use of bicycles, taking the *bemo* (bus), to, finally, the use of cars. A faster means of transportation reduces the amount of time it takes to get to performances and the time needed to return home. Modernization also affects the amount of time performers have to practice

with their ensemble at home without other distractions. These days most of the *dalang* families have televisions and they often read the morning newspaper. Their lifestyle has become more expensive, as families want to buy motorbikes, cars, televisions, telephones, and other modern conveniences. Therefore the older generation performers are working diligently to take care of their households. Wayan Loceng and Wayan Nartha both teach at the Indonesian College of the Arts. In addition, Nartha makes and sells shadow puppets and performs the shadow play, while Loceng teaches private lessons daily at his home in Sukawati and accompanies Nartha's performances. The female *dalang* Wayan Nondri works selling products in the market. Kadek Suartaya is a journalist as well as a faculty member at STSI, and his wife—Nartha's daughter—teaches music and dance at a primary school. Young generation performers are concerned about having careers to support themselves, and therefore they attend school, either STSI in order to get an arts diploma, or a university at which they can major in economics or other subjects.

Both the older and the younger generations still perform regularly, either in the evenings for temple ceremonies, or for local daytime ceremonies at which music is required. But because the amount of time available is more limited than before, each performance is just one part of a busy schedule that includes many other activities related to the mundane aspects of life. Performers in the old days often worked in the ricefields and performed at night. Now they work to develop careers during the day, and continue to perform in the evening.

In order to explore the artistic developments taking place, it was important that I examine the study and practice of music at the Indonesian College of the Arts, the primary institution for higher education in the arts in Bali. Drawing upon lengthy discussions with the college directors, faculty, and students, and an examination of scholarly publications produced by STSI and its faculty, Part Two of this dissertation explores the institutional study of music in Bali. I include the scholarly perceptions of the faculty, and consider the interaction of STSI members with village traditions, their support of new innovations, and their involvement in political functions both in Bali and abroad. As increasing numbers of village performers attend the arts college, it is essential that this aspect of Balinese musical life be considered alongside the village traditions. It is important to understand the goals and practices of STSI in order to comprehend how this type of institutional study may influence the next generation.

Institutional education in the arts is part of a modern phenomenon. In earlier times, artists were trained by masters in the village and they proceeded to perform for village ceremonies. Now young people who want to work in the arts feel obliged to attend the arts high school and subsequently, the arts college in order to obtain an arts degree. They expect this

education to give them a broader understanding of Balinese arts and other art forms, such as non-Balinese Indonesian arts and Western music theory. Further, students expect that an arts diploma will assist them in building their careers as artists, composers, choreographers, or producers, or will lead to work in other capacities such as in the cultural division of government offices.

Another priority of modern life is the importance of research, writing, and scholarship. STSI has cultivated these aspects in its educational system by publishing its own journal and newsletter, and by requiring students to do research in a Balinese village and to write a thesis in order to graduate with an arts degree. Faculty are also strongly encouraged to publish articles and books in order to move up through the ranks of the academic hierarchy, and most do pursue research or compose new pieces. STSI faculty also help to organize and judge the arts festivals and competitions that have developed over the past thirty years.

Finally, modernization has affected the political role of Balinese arts. After Indonesia became an independent republic, the government began to use the traditional arts to represent the richness of the country. Foreign diplomats were greeted by Balinese musicians and dancers under the first President of Indonesia, Sukarno, and it soon became evident that foreigners appreciated the unique qualities of Indonesia's artistic traditions. Consequently, under the second President of Indonesia, Suharto, the diplomatic role of the arts was increased to include artistic tours abroad that functioned as diplomatic "missions." In this way, Balinese artists, as well as other Indonesian artists who have reached a level of renown, have become ambassadors for Indonesian national culture.

Modern life is closely tied to globalization of Indonesian society, which requires Indonesia to interrelate with the international world in terms of economics, technology, and political diplomacy. By emphasizing Indonesia's rich and unique culture, the Indonesian government has aimed to develop an international reputation as one of the known and respected "high art" cultures.

Despite all of these developments, the fact that new art forms and new arts institutions exist does not mean that the public has switched its allegiance from the traditional to the modern. On the contrary, in my experience of the shadow play, Balinese audiences still tend to prefer the old tradition of *wayang parwa*, which draws upon stories from the *Mahabharata*, to newer productions. The shadow play theater and *gender wayang* music have maintained their sacred function and ceremonial importance more than most other Balinese arts; many still consider *gender wayang* to be sacred music and it is highly respected by nearly all Balinese for its complexity and beauty. Furthermore, the shadow play continues to be practiced almost entirely by descendents of *dalangs*. Even the students in the

Pedalangan department at STSI are of *dalang* lineage, despite the fact that each department is theoretically open to anyone who enters the arts college. Most of the old traditions are still in place despite the new, modern contexts for music study and performance.

During my research in Bali in 1996, I worked with Loceng on the *gender wayang* music and tradition. At the same time, I was increasingly occupied with the need to interview different *dalangs* and musicians in Sukawati as well as faculty at STSI. The more I interviewed different people, the more it became clear to me that Loceng did not understand what I was doing. He could not understand why I would not just practice *gender* all day long with him, learn whatever I could from him, and leave it at that. Why talk to the young generation who don't know as much as he does? Why talk to STSI faculty who have degrees from abroad but don't play *gender*? Thus, it became clear to me that Loceng still has a practice-based mentality: he emphasized the need to know the music itself, and to perform in a solid and virtuoso fashion, and did not recognize the need to talk to many different scholars and performers.

Despite Loceng's clear priority on performance, he also questioned changes in the society and commented on musical issues or related customs. Some of the issues I raise about modernization are based on concerns often voiced by Loceng, such as the problem of the younger generation playing too fast and deleting pieces from the *gender wayang* repertoire, or the requirement that students study a broad range of topics at school instead of focusing all of their energies on one subject, such as *gender wayang*, or at least on the practice of the arts. Obviously Loceng prefers the latter method. According to traditional methods evident in Loceng's thinking, it is most important that an artist master the practical aspects of the arts to the highest degree possible. According to this school of thought, it is not really necessary to talk about music, just to do it; to practice the art itself.

Loceng represents an old-style artist, or *guru alam*, who concentrated on one art form, yet many *guru alam* mastered a wide range of Balinese arts. A *guru alam* teacher like Bapak Sija from Bona could teach music, dance, or the shadow play, according to the needs of the student. With modern education and the requirements of modern life, students must specialize in one area of study, namely music, dance, the shadow play, or the visual arts, and then study it from various angles: historical aspects, theory, performance, composition, and research, in addition to their liberal arts education. The focus of music study has shifted from a practical focus, to a study of different aspects related to one art form. Shadow play students will now study the history of the art form, the theories related to it, the musical and theatrical techniques of performance, the scholarship already written on *wayang kulit* (the shadow play), and they will create their own shadow play performance and write a thesis on it. Even though many of

the Pedalangan students *do* know how to dance, extensive dance training is not required of them at STSI.

In many ways, the current young generation, by which I mean performers and students in their late teens and twenties, are combining the old and new methods. They still learn the music and shadow play from the masters in their village, and they may learn dance from a young age as well, but they also go on to study these art forms at school. Alternatively, they might participate in performances but study other subjects in school. Young performers participate in the ceremonies of their family and *banjar*, and they ride motorbikes or cars and occasionally play in rock bands. They pray in the temple when there is a temple ceremony in their village, and they watch melodramas, sitcoms, and romances on television. This generation is merging the traditional and the modern more than any previous generation has been asked to do, and thus their perspectives on this emerging synthesis are crucial to understand the future trajectory of Balinese traditional arts. To what extent will traditional art forms like the shadow play and *gender wayang* music become purely artistic entertainment produced for commercial purposes? To what extent will the religious basis of these traditions be lost in an attempt to create something that is first and foremost humorous and entertaining? My interviews with the young generation aimed at uncovering their perspectives, which have rarely been heard. Their voices gave a more rounded view of current practices in the arts.

Each chapter of this dissertation builds this examination of musical modernization with regard to the following areas: 1) performance practice, 2) the political role of the arts (from courtly patronage to political diplomacy serving the Republic of Indonesia), 3) pedagogical ideas and practices (from a moral education and practice-based orientation to learning in an institutional setting with a global, liberal arts orientation), 4) the gradual development of a broad range of pieces in the *gender wayang* repertoire and later reduction in the active performance repertoire, 5) new priorities for performances (from religious priorities to the secular goals of amusement and entertainment), 6) research and innovations in the arts encouraged by the curriculum at STSI, and 7) new discursive forms and a greater quantity of scholarship on music and the shadow play.

In order to represent a diverse range of opinions by Balinese individuals, it is necessary to use a more polyphonic approach to this study, thus I incorporate the voices of different Balinese performers and scholars. The complex nature of individual lives helps to break down the monolithic character of terms such as “traditional” or “modern.” For example, Loceng taught at the arts college for many years,¹³ but he still emphasized the importance of studying the music in a disciplined manner so as to develop a virtuoso technique for the purpose of performance. Thus, he combined the traditional practice and performance of his art form with the