



OPENING DOORS: ORCHESTRAS, OPERA COMPANIES AND COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT

Emily Dollman



ROUTLEDGE



Opening Doors: Orchestras, Opera Companies and Community Engagement

What is the role of classical music in the 21st century? How will classical musicians maintain their relevance and purpose?

This book follows the working activities of professional orchestral musicians and opera singers as they move off stage into schools, community centres, prisons, libraries, and corporations, engaging with their communities in new, rich ways through education and community engagement programmes. Key examples of collaborative partnerships between orchestras, opera companies, schools and music services in the delivery of music education are investigated, with a focus on the UK's Music Hub system. The impact of these partnerships is examined, both in terms of how they inspire and foster the next generation of musicians as well as the extent to which they broaden access to quality music education. Detailed case studies are provided on the impact of classical music education programmes on social cohesion, health and wellbeing, and the education outcomes for students from low socio-economic communities. The implications for the future training of classical musicians are analysed, as are the new career paths for orchestral musicians and composers straddling performance and education.

Opening Doors: Orchestras, Opera Companies and Community Engagement investigates the ways in which the classical music industry is reinventing its sense of purpose, never a more important or urgent pursuit than in the present decade.

Emily Dollman is the Head of Music Education and Pedagogy at the Elder Conservatorium of Music, University of Adelaide, and founding Artistic Director of the Open Music Academy. Emily's background combines extensive experience as an international professional violinist with a long-standing commitment to music education and instrumental pedagogy.



Taylor & Francis

Taylor & Francis Group

<http://taylorandfrancis.com>

Opening Doors: Orchestras, Opera Companies and Community Engagement

Emily Dollman

First published 2023
by Routledge
4 Park Square, Milton Park, Abingdon, Oxon OX14 4RN

and by Routledge
605 Third Avenue, New York, NY 10158

Routledge is an imprint of the Taylor & Francis Group, an informa business

© 2023 Emily Dollman

The right of Emily Dollman to be identified as author of this work has been asserted in accordance with sections 77 and 78 of the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988.

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reprinted or reproduced or utilised in any form or by any electronic, mechanical, or other means, now known or hereafter invented, including photocopying and recording, or in any information storage or retrieval system, without permission in writing from the publishers.

Trademark notice: Product or corporate names may be trademarks or registered trademarks, and are used only for identification and explanation without intent to infringe.

British Library Cataloguing-in-Publication Data

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

ISBN: 978-1-032-05645-6 (hbk)

ISBN: 978-1-032-05646-3 (pbk)

ISBN: 978-1-003-19851-2 (ebk)

DOI: 10.4324/9781003198512

Typeset in Sabon
by Deanta Global Publishing Services, Chennai, India

This book is dedicated to my children, Joshua and Isabelle. It is for the coming generation that we need to preserve, strengthen, and renew our creative culture.

With thanks to the performers, composers, teachers, students, and arts administrators who each play such a valuable role in the ecosystem featured in this book: it has been a privilege to share your stories here.

With deep thanks also to all my family for their support, in particular to my parents for their lifelong encouragement and for the countless hours of driving me to music lessons and rehearsals as a child. Thank you for opening the doors to music for me.



Taylor & Francis

Taylor & Francis Group

<http://taylorandfrancis.com>

Contents

Introduction	1
1 Musicians Offstage: An Overview of the Aims and Activities of Orchestral and Opera Education and Community Engagement Programmes	18
2 Origins and Development: Understanding the Early History of Orchestral and Opera Education and Community Engagement Programmes	30
3 Working Together: Models of Partnership Delivery of Music Education	56
4 Leading the Way: Case Studies of Orchestral and Opera Education and Community Engagement Programmes	67
5 Orchestras Building Communities: The El Sistema Model and Its Global Influence	104
6 Creative Music Making: The New Role of Animateurs and Teaching Artists	115
7 New Roles, New Skills: Implications for the Tertiary Training of Classical Musicians	133
8 Virtual Music Making: Classical Music Engagement Utilising Digital and Online Technology	150

9	Music, Health, and Wellbeing: Benefits for Both Musicians and Participants	165
10	A Second Pillar, or Working on the Fringe? A Summary of the Current Situation and Examination of Future Developments	173
	Conclusion	184
	<i>Index</i>	189

Introduction

This book is a study of the activities, aims, and vision of education and engagement programmes operated by symphony orchestras and opera companies. Over the past four decades, there has been a steady revolution in the day-to-day activities of orchestral musicians and opera companies across the globe. Today, we find orchestral and opera musicians working “off stage” in venues as disparate as schools, hospitals, prisons, nursing homes, conservatoriums, shopping centres, museums, art galleries, public libraries, and even train stations and car parks. You will now find an education or community engagement department centrally placed in all major orchestras and opera companies across the world. In some of the world’s leading classical organisations, the managing director began their career path in the education department, bringing the perspective they gained through community and education work directly to the engine room of decision-making. In this book, we gain a firsthand perspective into this career trajectory from industry leaders including Kathryn McDowell, CBE, the managing director of the London Symphony Orchestra and Stephen Langridge, the artistic director of Glyndebourne Opera.

Education and community engagement programming has evolved to be a crucial counterpoint to main stage performance programming for orchestras and opera companies. These programmes have a range of extremely important aims and outcomes: to maintain and improve the status of music education in schools; to consolidate the relevance of classical music in 21st-century society; to develop the musicians, composers, and audiences of the future; to increase access to the proven health and wellbeing benefits of music; and to improve social equity in low socio-economic communities.

The title of this book, *Opening Doors*, refers to what I feel is the most essential goal of these programmes: to open the doors to music for the widest possible spectrum of society. By breaking through barriers, some real and some only existing in perception, the programmes allow more people to establish a personal connection with classical music. It is in this personal connection that the value of the music is felt, and it is also the key to the future of the industry – a future that requires great efforts across the industry to protect.

2 *Introduction*

At the time of writing, the classical music industry is facing one of its most severe tests. As the COVID-19 pandemic rippled across the world in 2020, concert houses across the world switched off the stage lights and closed the doors. Musicians' income streams abruptly ceased and the jet-setting life of conductors and soloists suddenly became untenable. While the pandemic experience has varied in different countries there has been a common global story of previously stable arts organisations confronting the threat of bankruptcy and of live performances silenced overnight. The vulnerability of arts organisations is being keenly felt, with the arts at risk within a society suffering from financial pressure. Therefore, the urgency for musicians to engage with their audiences and to ignite community support has never been so strong. Musicians need to advocate for the value of their art form: with national budgets in crisis, governments must be convinced of the importance of music to society in a bid to consolidate and sustain funding. The twin arguments of the innate importance of the musical art form and its many proven extra-musical benefits across health and community must be made clear.

Yet, alongside this crisis, there is an alternate storyline of hope, strength, and vitality. This lies partly in the fact that as a live shared cultural experience was taken away from us, we valued what we had lost more than ever before. Even as communities were forced into isolation, through music they found ways to reconnect. Connection through lockdown music-making across Italian apartment balconies, through shared tributes in song for health workers, through online projects bringing strangers together into a choir from their couches. People forced into indoor idleness found that learning a musical instrument brought an emotional outlet as well as a physical and intellectual occupation, bringing catharsis through an anxious time.

Hope also lies in the energy, creativity, and grit of the musicians and management staff of music organisations. Throughout this period of upheaval, there has been a strong and concerted effort by the music industry to continue to connect with communities, to reach out and open the door to music. Behind the concert stage, there has been a rethink of the role of symphony orchestras, opera companies, and choirs. Questions have been asked as to how, and why, musicians connect with communities. The question of the value and community relevance of music organisations has been the topic of boardroom meetings, of conference proceedings, and journal articles. This questioning, of course, did not commence in 2020; classical music has long been engaged in a battle against preconceptions that it is outdated, elitist, and irrelevant. While some may feel that performances should and can speak for themselves, others believe it is the work of education and community engagement departments that will maintain the social relevance of the art form. It is this work that we will explore in this book – its aims, activities, historical development, and future directions.

Despite the clear importance of these programmes and the lofty goals placed upon their outcomes, there is at present a lack of studies undertaken

on this field of work. It is my goal to address this imbalance here by highlighting the work undertaken, its goals, its historical development, and future areas of growth. This is the first book to cover international best practice in the education and community engagement activities of orchestras and opera companies, and it is my primary aim to shine a light on the hugely important, yet often overlooked, work that lies beyond main stage concert performances. *Opening Doors* examines the various areas of activity of orchestral and opera education and community engagement programmes: education for school-aged students; programmes with a health and wellbeing focus; creative-based programmes; digital engagement programmes; programmes inspired by El Sistema with a social equity mission at heart; and programmes to help young emerging musicians to make the transition to the profession. We follow the working activities of professional orchestral musicians and opera singers as they move off stage, engaging with their communities in new, rich ways. We examine key examples of collaborative partnership in the delivery of music education between orchestras, opera companies, schools, and instrumental education services, with a focus on the UK's Music Hub system. We look at music programmes aiming to help young offenders to get back on track; at programmes aiming to rectify the gender and race imbalance in the classical music industry; and at programmes linking with health services to combat long COVID. We look at orchestras setting up schools, at opera companies working in prisons, at programmes working with dementia patients.

The links between orchestral and opera education and community engagement programmes and social equity and regeneration programmes are examined. Music education programmes led by classical musicians have led directly to substantial health and societal benefits in low socio-economic communities. The leading influence here is Venezuela's pioneering El Sistema, known worldwide as the music programme that replaced guns with violins. The extraordinary impact of El Sistema has been felt around the world. Several global orchestral education programmes inspired by the Sistema model are investigated and analysed in this book, and possibilities for future development are considered.

We look at the implications for the tertiary training of musicians in conservatoriums and degree programmes. The working life of an orchestral musician or an opera singer in the 21st century requires an increasingly diverse skillset. This new skillset comprises expertise in education, public speaking, improvisation skills, presentation, and workshop leading – in addition to attaining technical and artistic excellence on their instrument.

We also examine the larger picture of issues commonly faced in the field of music education across the world. A common picture is of uncertain funding for school music departments, of the patchy provision of music education experts in schools; of instrumental tuition predominantly available to children of high socio-economic families. Music is being crowded out of the curriculum in schools across the globe, with principals focusing

4 *Introduction*

their sights on science, technology, engineering, and mathematics (STEM), literacy, and coding in their quest to train the future workforce. Tertiary general teaching degrees often allocate a pitifully low number of hours to music as they train the next generation of teachers – leading to a workforce that feels nervous when confronted with a quaver or a middle C. “Classical” music, in particular, faces issues in schools. This is, of course, related to the larger issues surrounding this genre. It should be noted at this point that even the use of the term “classical” is itself problematic, with criticisms of the term as ambiguous and overly broad – that it does not reflect the true diversity of music performed by orchestras, opera companies, choirs, and smaller instrumental ensembles. The term itself, of course, naturally directs our thoughts towards music from the Classical period, and the great composers of that era, rather than being a term that encompasses the immense diversity of music performed by “classical” organisations. However, at the time of writing, an alternate term has not yet emerged with sufficient clarity – “art” music has its own connotations of elitism, “composed” music is also ambiguous. For the purposes of this book then, “classical music” will be used to refer to the industry in which symphony orchestras and opera companies operate.

In the face of these challenges and gaps in music education, the role of orchestras and opera companies in reaching out to and connecting with all levels of the music ecosystem takes on a new level of urgency. We look at specific programmes connecting orchestral and opera education programmes with school-aged students – including flagship programmes where an orchestra is a key partner with the school management. These programmes inspire children who are already learning an instrument or singing to further develop their skills by connecting with professional musicians and engaging in stimulating activities. The programmes also enable students with limited previous experience of music to engage in participatory music making and creative activities. Investment in this grassroots level of music making has significant benefits for the entire music ecosystem; these programmes are impacting on the development of future performers, composers, audience members, and arts administrators. The programmes are also key to helping to achieve greater equity in access to music education, with many programmes specifically focusing on under-represented sectors and helping to level the “playing field.”

The proliferation of education and community engagement programmes by symphony orchestras and opera companies is intertwined with adaptations in the delivery system of music education. The UK’s Music Hub system is a leader internationally in terms of a structured partnership system delivering impactful, sequential music education to children through their developing years. The intentions, operating systems, and outcomes of the hub partnership model of music education are investigated here, with examples of best practice identified. These partnerships see professional musicians working alongside instrumental Music Services, schools, arts organisations,

and youth music ensembles with truly outstanding and impactful results. The possible application of similar models of music education partnership delivery in other international education systems is also considered.

All children are born creative. This simple statement is the heart of the message from the late, treasured, Sir Ken Robinson, a statement that resonates with the millions who have watched Robinson's TED Talk or bought his books. While few would argue with this statement, the education system is still often one that does not foster – indeed it actively stifles – the natural creativity of children. Music education offers a rich and natural area of activity in which children's creativity can truly be developed within the school system. From the 1960s onwards, composer-teachers such as Sir Peter Maxwell Davies, R. Murray Schafer, John Paynter, and George Self brought fresh thinking to the question of how children can connect with music in the school curriculum. They rightly noted that we do not restrict children from painting until they have learnt the techniques of chiaroscuro and perspective; nor then should we restrict children from improvising and composing until they have learnt the rules of four-part harmony. From this standpoint, creativity took place front and centre in the school music curriculum through the late 20th century. Due to hesitancy in the delivery of the creative content, many schools looked to an external creative workshop leader for assistance. This new role of a music workshop leader is chiefly known as an *animateur* in the United Kingdom, and a *teaching artist* in the United States. Here, a new career pathway for composers and creatively minded practising musicians developed: that of igniting and giving voice to children's musical creativity as they play with the musical building blocks of pitch, rhythm, texture, sound, and silence. We look at the creative music workshop format, and how this can help to find a direct connection to the heart of some of the most challenging of modern compositions.

I should note that it was not possible to include the full field of endeavour of education and community engagement across the world's professional musical bodies. Key case studies of orchestras and opera companies have been selected, with an eye to creating a varied picture of the field and of highlighting interesting approaches to the work. It was not possible to include an examination of the outreach work of choirs, chamber orchestras, or chamber music groups in this study for reasons of space and focus, although I am, of course, aware of the excellent work that groups in these areas are achieving. This is an area that may, and should, be covered in future research in this field.

In the same spirit of full disclosure, there is a personal aspect to my research. I am a professional violinist, music educator, and university academic working in both Australia and the United Kingdom. Through my career, I have developed a personal understanding and insight into the links between music education and orchestral and opera education programmes. As an Australian, currently working for the University of Adelaide, I am keen to highlight the extraordinary work being done by the Adelaide Symphony

6 Introduction

Orchestra in reaching across the vast distances of regional and remote South Australia. Before moving to Adelaide, I worked in London as an orchestral musician and violin teacher for a Music Service, and it was here that my interest in orchestral education programmes was ignited. My London violin students engaged in a pilot scheme with the London Symphony Orchestra for their “Take A Bow” string education programme. I witnessed firsthand the inspiration that such a programme can provide to students at a pivotal stage of learning and development. This experience led to my PhD studies on the topic of Australian and British Orchestral Education programmes, which I researched between 2010 and 2015. I was fascinated then, and remain so today, by the similarities and connections between the wave of activity that had taken root in the United Kingdom in the 1980s, and which has since arrived in Australia. For *Opening Doors*, I have broadened the focus to include case studies from a wider range of countries, including Europe and the United States; I also broadened the focus to include opera companies alongside symphony orchestras.

The material presented here is the result of three key stages of research, each of which contributed to an overall understanding of the topic. Firstly, key relevant existing materials in the form of books, reports, theses, lecture transcripts, promotional materials, and journal articles were collated and analysed. This literature provided an overview and understanding of the development and current practice in orchestral and opera programmes. To establish the context for this period of development, the relevant literature on related topics such as music pedagogy, government policy, childhood development, El Sistema, music therapy, and tertiary music training was also consulted.

An analysis of this literature provided the basis for the second stage of the research process, in which new primary source material was generated in the form of detailed first-person interviews with leaders in the field internationally. These interviewees were carefully selected to provide maximum insight into best practice in the field of orchestral and opera education and community engagement today. Participants in the project included education managers past and present, who provided details of the day-to-day activities of their programmes, their goals, and their challenges. Managing directors and artistic directors were interviewed in order to gain insight into their role in guiding and directing the outreach activities at their organisations; they were also key to providing a clear picture of the positioning of outreach work within the overall strategic operation of their companies. Leading music educators and advocates were interviewed in order to help ascertain the impact of orchestral and opera education activities on the broader music education sphere. Musicians taking part in the programmes were interviewed to gain an understanding from their perspective of the impact of this work. I thank each and every one of the generous and inspirational interviewees: giving their work and their intentions a more prominent platform is foremost in my mind throughout the following chapters. During

lengthy interviews they have shared their insight into their aims, goals, and challenges, their workplace practice and the philosophies underlying their work. Their generosity in sharing this insight, especially considering the extra challenges they were collectively facing due to COVID-19, was humbling and inspiring in equal measure.

The final stage of research involved further research on points of interest arising from the interview process. Early in the interview process, the decision was made to analyse the new primary source material through a qualitative, rather than a quantitative, method. It was apparent that it would not be beneficial to translate the information contained in the interview transcripts into statistical, numerical data. However, the information gained through the interviews underpins my work as a whole, with the interviews analysed for points of consensus in order to identify current industry-wide patterns.

The upheaval of the pandemic has significantly accelerated the rate of change in the industry. The stakes have never been higher for protecting and strengthening the future of the organisations that lie at the heart of the art form. Yet, through the interviews that inform this book, there has been a note of hopeful energy running alongside the expected stress and strain. There has been a feeling that this is a crucible of change for the industry, a possibly necessary period of rebirth, which will lead to orchestras and opera companies moving into the future with fresh purpose and relevance.

While these interviews provided the most immediate and clear insight into the field, examination of key sources have helped to cast light on a variety of areas. The following literature review gives an overview of the most relevant and informative sources consulted throughout the research.

Literature Review

The literature review for this study reveals a lack of academic research into orchestral and opera education programming, out of proportion with the importance of such work. This project aims to address this issue, being the first book to cover this area in detail. However, there are selected theses, journal articles, and books that are relevant to the study in either providing a social and educational context for education programmes, or in providing insight into the development stages of the orchestral and opera education field.

By far the most valuable resource available on the topic is Julia Winterson's doctoral thesis completed at the University of York, titled *The Community Education Work of Orchestras and Opera Companies: Principles, Practice and Problems*.¹ This study, completed in 1998, gives a comprehensive overview of the development of the British field of orchestral and opera education work to that date, as well as a frank and provocative examination of the issues hindering the field from achieving its maximum impact. Winterson's thesis also includes an illuminating set of interview transcripts

8 Introduction

with leading figures working in the field of British orchestral education at that date, including Gillian Moore, Richard McNicol, and Nigel Osborne. It is interesting to now ask, over two decades later, to what degree the issues highlighted by Winterson have now been overcome. Winterson was particularly concerned by the lack of attention being paid to evaluation by education managers. Winterson also noted the pressing need for tertiary training to mirror the evolving changes in professional orchestral activity: developments in these areas are discussed in this study in Chapters 7 and 10.

Winterson's article on the London Sinfonietta's groundbreaking, composer-driven, "workshop" model provides thoughtful insight into the development of a key British education department.² Insight into the early development of this programme was also provided by David Ruffer six years earlier in the same journal, in his article "The London Sinfonietta Education Programme: An Analysis of an Interface between the Professional Artist and Music in Education."³ These articles, together with Winterson's interview with Gillian Moore, the first education manager of London Sinfonietta, help to establish an understanding of the aims and activities of this early, pivotal education programme, groundbreaking in many ways.

The main piece of academic writing on the topic of Australian orchestral education programmes is the 2002 honours dissertation by Emma Cochran through the University of Adelaide, titled *The Role of Symphony Orchestra Programs. Case Study: Adelaide Symphony Orchestra and Sydney Symphony Orchestra*.⁴ While Cochran makes several insightful points, the short length of the dissertation curtails her ability to go into detail, and the study is restricted to only two of Australia's six state symphony orchestras. Cochran noted the need for a future intensive study on the topic to fill the gap in research.⁵ Twelve years after Cochran's dissertation was submitted the same claim can be made, and it is this gap that the present study aims to fill. Another key point made in her dissertation was that as symphony orchestras receive part of their funding from the state, they have an obligation to be of service to their community.

Cochran's dissertation looks at the early development of the Sydney Symphony Orchestra (SSO) and the Adelaide Symphony Orchestra's (ASO) education departments and notes that in 1980 the SSO initiated a review of its programmes.⁶ The measures taken by the SSO to overhaul their educational output transformed a lacklustre, underutilised arm of the orchestra into a vibrant and enriching part of the Australian music education landscape. Several sources were consulted in the examination of the formation of the SSO's education programme, including Richard Gill's autobiography, *Give Me Excess of It*, and *Play On! 60 Years of Music Making with the Sydney Symphony Orchestra* (Sametz, ABC Sydney, 1992).^{7,8} Brett Johnson's speech, *The Development of an Orchestral Education Program – Sydney Symphony Orchestra 1987–1991*,⁹ provides insight into a key turning point for the SSO's education department. It makes very valuable reading for anyone interested in creating a strong, relevant education programme.

Stephen Boyle's 2007 PhD thesis, *Efficiency and Identity: The Transition of Australia's Symphony Orchestras from Government Departments to Corporate Entities*, gives insight into the process by which the Australian orchestras gained independence from the Australian Broadcasting Corporation (ABC).¹⁰ His thesis gives a comprehensive overview of the early years of the symphony orchestra network of Australia, and insight into the process and impact of the devolution from ABC control. David Garrett's doctoral thesis through the University of Wollongong, *The Accidental Entrepreneur* (2012), provides a more recent analysis of the development of Australian orchestras.¹¹ In addition to Boyle and Garrett's theses, several reviews and reports central to the process of devolution were examined. These included the Dix Report (1981),¹² the Tribe Report (1985),¹³ Federal Government's Creative Nation Policy (1994),¹⁴ and the Strong Report (2005).¹⁵

To provide insight into the founding years of orchestral education work, a variety of sources were consulted, including biographies of Sir Bernard Heinze, Sir Malcolm Sargent, Walter Damrosch, and Sir Robert Meyer. For information about more recent developments, the annual reports of individual orchestras and opera companies were consulted in order to gain a year-by-year overview of activities and plans.

Understanding of the impact of government policy on British orchestral and opera education programming was established through study of various reports and government publications. These included the Music Manifesto *Building on Excellence: Orchestras for the 21st Century* (2007),¹⁶ the *Henley Report* (2011),¹⁷ the *National Plan for Music Education* (2011),¹⁸ the Ofsted report *Music in Schools: What Hubs Must Do*,¹⁹ and the response from the industry by the Musicians' Union: *Summary in Response to Ofsted*.²⁰ The 2014 King's College London report, *Step by Step: Arts Policy and Young People 1944–2014*, was also of great benefit in providing a detailed investigation of 60 years of British arts policy.²¹

The link between a nation's orchestral and opera education work and the music curricula delivered in its school system is of ongoing interest. To gain insight into the impact of the UK curriculum on orchestral and opera education work, a variety of sources were consulted. In addition to the curriculum document itself, the iconic work by John Payntor and Peter Aston, *Sound and Silence*, provided insight into the spirit of adventure and vigour with which a new focus on classroom composition was launched.²² Murray Schafer's work, *Creative Music Education: A Handbook for the Modern Music Teacher*, provides valuable and thought-provoking discussions on the essence of music, alongside creative-based learning plans for use in classrooms.²³ Stephanie Pitts' work, *A Century of Change in Music Education: Historical Perspectives on Contemporary Practice in British Secondary Schools* (2000), also provided crucial insight into the key points that impacted on the development of school music education in the United Kingdom.²⁴

In order to understand the development of the music curriculum in the Australian national curriculum and its potential impact on both the orchestral and opera education field, alongside the wider music education networks, several sources were of key benefit. Personal interviews with a key member of the planning committee of the national curriculum provided vital insight into the development process of the curriculum, although this interviewee needs to remain anonymous for the purposes of this study. The views of Richard Gill, Australia's much beloved and recently deceased music education advocate, on the introduction of the national curriculum were incisive and thought-provoking. Additionally, the national curriculum document itself has been studied in detail, alongside related books and reports, including the *National Review of School Music Education: Augmenting the Diminished*,²⁵ *Bridging the Gap in School Achievement through the Arts*,²⁶ *Education and the Arts*,²⁷ *Transforming Education Through the Arts*,²⁸ and the *Victorian Parliamentary Inquiry into School Music Education Provision*.²⁹

International literature relating to the importance of music and the arts for children and society was also of relevance to this topic. As noted in the introduction, two landmark reports were of chief importance here in addition to the Australian publications noted above. These were the flagship 1999 American report, *Champions of Change*, and the 2015 British publication, *The Power of Music*.^{30,31}

A growing body of research is available on the history, processes, and impact of El Sistema in Venezuela, and its global impact is also receiving scholarly scrutiny. Personal interviews were conducted with leaders of Sistema programmes internationally, including with Elsje Kibler-Vermaas, vice president of learning at the Los Angeles Philharmonic, and with Peter Garden, executive director of performance and learning at the Royal Liverpool Philharmonic Orchestra. Further information was gained through detailed study of evaluative reports, journal articles, books, DVDs, and websites.

The Association of British Orchestras (ABO) has been key to the development of British orchestral education work. In order to gain insight into the ways in which the ABO facilitates networking and seeks to promote examples of best practice in the field of orchestral education, a personal interview was conducted with Fiona Harvey, the education and youth ensembles consultant at the ABO. During this interview, Harvey not only discussed her role at the ABO but also gave valuable insight into the development of the Music Hub model. In addition to this interview, extensive research has been conducted into all relevant ABO publications.

Insight into the links between the orchestral education work of Australia and the United Kingdom can also be gained by studying published reports and conference presentations by leaders in the field. Among the most relevant of these is Christopher Wainwright's Churchill Fellowship Report (2014), in which Wainwright, past director of the Adelaide Youth

Orchestras, discusses his international trip to study leading orchestral education programmes.³² Also of interest to this study is the Churchill Fellowship Report by Nicholas Bochner (assistant principal cellist with the Melbourne Symphony Orchestra), which details his observation of the LSO Discovery Department and related training offered at London's Guildhall School of Music and Drama (GSMD).³³

Insight into the early development of training for orchestral education work in the United Kingdom is chiefly provided through several articles by Peter Renshaw in the *British Journal of Music Education*, published between 1985 and 1992. These articles detail Renshaw's establishment of a new course in amateur skills at London's Guildhall School of Music and Drama, and his thoughts on the need for a fresh approach to the training of orchestral musicians at the tertiary level. The 2005 GSMD book, *The Reflective Conservatoire: Studies in Music Education Research Studies 4*, was also of particular interest. This work offers insight into developing trends in tertiary music education, as well as practical advice on leading workshops and teaching improvisation.³⁴ A further GSMD publication, *The Art of the Amateur*, helped to define and explain the aims and practice of "amateurs," a key role in British orchestral programming but one little known in Australia to date.³⁵ Interviews with Sean Gregory (executive director of innovation and engagement at the Barbican and Guildhall) and Eric Booth (author of the seminal work, *The Music Teaching Artists' Bible*³⁶) provided insight into current trends and best practice in innovatory leadership in the tertiary music industry.

Alongside the question of training is the issue of the structure of the symphony orchestra and its place in society. Informative and provocative points have been made on these topics by several key figures over the past half-century. Ernest Fleischmann's "Community of Musicians" concept, previously discussed in the introduction, was first presented in a lecture at the Cleveland School of Music in 1987. This lecture was subsequently published as the article "The Orchestra is Dead."³⁷ Fleischmann reiterated his views on this topic in a subsequent speech in 2000 to the Royal Philharmonic Society.³⁸ His concept, while radical, was foreshadowed by the views of Boulez as expressed in *Orientations*,³⁹ and also validated by Leonard Slatkin in his book, *Conducting Business*.⁴⁰ Slatkin, writing in 2012, remarked: "Now, more than 20 years later, I think not only was he [Fleischmann] right but also very much ahead of his time."⁴¹ This view is supported by many leaders in the classical music industry today. Looking close to home, Stephen Boyle identified the Adelaide Symphony Orchestra as one that was looking to potentially remodel its structure along Fleischmann's suggestions.⁴² While this has not eventuated, it is a sign of the far-reaching impact of Fleischmann's ideas.

The Royal Philharmonic Society's annual lectures provide insight by leaders in the classical music profession. In addition to Fleischmann's address in 2000, the lectures presented by Nicola Benedetti (2019), Alan

12 Introduction

Gilbert (2014), Roger Wright (2013), Sir Peter Maxwell Davies (2005), and Graham Vick (2003) were of particular interest to this study in their often provocative and visionary commentary on aspects of the relationship between classical music and contemporary society.

Marshall McGuire (former executive manager of artistic planning, West Australian Symphony Orchestra) presented a speech titled *Australian Orchestras – The State of Play* at the Classical Music Summit 2010, which was also of relevance to this study. In this presentation, McGuire was critical of the models of outreach and education commonly used by Australian orchestras, claiming that much more participatory programmes needed to be developed.⁴³ The TED Talks by Richard Gill and Sir Ken Robinson also provided much food for thought on the importance of music education for children’s development.

The report “Psychological Well-Being in Professional Orchestral Musicians in Australia” (2006)⁴⁴ provides insight into the various stresses and pressures under which Australian orchestral musicians are operating. The final report, *Sound Practice*, delivered in 2017 by Ackermann, Kenny, Driscoll, and O’Brian at the conclusion of the five-year research project is a landmark publication in the area of health and wellbeing for orchestral musicians. The report has had a national and international impact on understanding the workplace environment within classical music organisations.⁴⁵ It is the view of the author that participation in education work can help to alleviate many of these stresses and can provide a much more balanced and fulfilling career path for orchestral musicians. Further studies in this area, for example by Abeles and Hafeli (2014)⁴⁶ and Levine and Levine (1996),⁴⁷ point to the potential benefit of education and outreach participation for orchestral musicians themselves.

Several American theses were of value in providing an overview of the orchestral education and outreach in the United States and also offering examples of evaluation of such programmes. *The Contributions of Leonard Bernstein to Music Education: An Analysis of his 53 Young People’s Concerts*, by Brian David Rozen,⁴⁸ discusses the approach taken by Bernstein in his “Young People’s Concerts,” which remain a landmark in orchestral music education today. Bernstein’s education work is also a salient lesson in the impact that a celebrity figure can have: his education concerts were so popular that Americans were putting their children’s names down before birth. *Lillian Baldwin and the Cleveland Plan for Educational Concerts* provided insight into another formative figure in American orchestral education work.⁴⁹

A more current American thesis, *Conversations with Five Music Directors Regarding the Current State and Future of American Symphony Orchestras* (Harrison, 2009), was also consulted.⁵⁰ Prompted by the financial struggles of several American orchestras in the past decade, Harrison seeks to provide possible measures to rectify the fortunes of the American symphony orchestra through interviews with five chief conductors. The points of consensus