



THE LEGACY OF JULLIEN'S WORK FOR COMPARATIVE EDUCATION

Edited by
Charl Wolhuter



The Legacy of Jullien's Work for Comparative Education

Comparative and International Education is a seemingly infinite field, and it has always tested new frontiers since it was launched as a field of scholarly enquiry 200 years ago by the vision of Marc-Antoine Jullien. The philanthropic mission which Jullien spelled out for the field remains its most noble. The contributions to this book look afresh at this mission, within the context of twenty-first century globalised society, while also highlighting and re-assessing other sources in the field.

This book was originally published as a special issue of *Compare: A Journal of Comparative and International Education*.

Charl Wolhuter is Professor of Comparative and International Education at the Potchefstroom Campus of the North-West University, South Africa. He has held Visiting Professorships at institutions including Brock University, Canada; the University of Queensland, Australia; and the University of Modena and Reggio Emilia, Italy. He is the author of various books and articles on History of Education and Comparative Education.



Taylor & Francis

Taylor & Francis Group

<http://taylorandfrancis.com>

The Legacy of Jullien's Work for Comparative Education

Edited by
Charl Wolhuter

First published 2019
by Routledge
2 Park Square, Milton Park, Abingdon, Oxon, OX14 4RN, UK

and by Routledge
52 Vanderbilt Avenue, New York, NY 10017, USA

Routledge is an imprint of the Taylor & Francis Group, an informa business

© 2019 The British Association for International and Comparative Education

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reprinted or reproduced or utilised in any form or by any electronic, mechanical, or other means, now known or hereafter invented, including photocopying and recording, or in any information storage or retrieval system, without permission in writing from the publishers.

Trademark notice: Product or corporate names may be trademarks or registered trademarks, and are used only for identification and explanation without intent to infringe.

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

ISBN 13: 978-0-367-02485-7

Typeset in Minion Pro
by RefineCatch Limited, Bungay, Suffolk

Publisher's Note

The publisher accepts responsibility for any inconsistencies that may have arisen during the conversion of this book from journal articles to book chapters, namely the possible inclusion of journal terminology.

Disclaimer

Every effort has been made to contact copyright holders for their permission to reprint material in this book. The publishers would be grateful to hear from any copyright holder who is not here acknowledged and will undertake to rectify any errors or omissions in future editions of this book.

Contents

<i>Citation Information</i>	vii
<i>Notes on Contributors</i>	ix
1. The philanthropic mission of comparative and international education bequeathed by Jullien: continuing capstone of the field <i>C. C. Wolhuter</i>	1
2. Is Marc-Antoine Jullien de Paris the ‘father’ of comparative education? <i>Erwin H. Epstein</i>	15
3. Travelling researchers, colonial difference: comparative education in an age of exploration <i>Noah W. Sobe</i>	30
4. The Internet as a tool for informal education: a case of Uyghur language websites <i>Rebecca A. Clothey</i>	42
5. A critique of PISA and what Jullien’s plan might offer <i>Katherine Forestier and Bob Adamson</i>	57
6. Revisiting Jullien in an era of globalisation <i>Jason Beech and Fazal Rizvi</i>	72
7. The making of comparability: education indicator research from Jullien de Paris to the 2030 sustainable development goals <i>Manuel Cardoso and Gita Steiner-Khamsi</i>	86
8. Comparison as an approach to the experimental method <i>David A. Turner</i>	104
9. Identity as immunology: history teaching in two ethnonational borders of Europe <i>Eleftherios Klerides and Michalinos Zembylas</i>	114
10. Forum: The rise of international large-scale assessments and rationales for participation <i>Camilla Addey, Sam Sellar, Gita Steiner-Khamsi, Bob Lingard and Antoni Verger</i>	132
<i>Index</i>	151



Taylor & Francis

Taylor & Francis Group

<http://taylorandfrancis.com>

Citation Information

The following chapters were originally published in *Compare: A Journal of Comparative and International Education*, volume 47, issue 3 (May 2017). When citing this material, please use the original page numbering for each article, as follows:

Chapter 1

The philanthropic mission of comparative and international education bequeathed by Jullien: continuing capstone of the field

C. C. Wolhuter

Compare: A Journal of Comparative and International Education, volume 47, issue 3 (May 2017), pp. 303–316

Chapter 2

Is Marc-Antoine Jullien de Paris the ‘father’ of comparative education?

Erwin H. Epstein

Compare: A Journal of Comparative and International Education, volume 47, issue 3 (May 2017), pp. 317–331

Chapter 3

Travelling researchers, colonial difference: comparative education in an age of exploration

Noah W. Sobe

Compare: A Journal of Comparative and International Education, volume 47, issue 3 (May 2017), pp. 332–343

Chapter 4

The Internet as a tool for informal education: a case of Uyghur language websites

Rebecca A. Clothey

Compare: A Journal of Comparative and International Education, volume 47, issue 3 (May 2017), pp. 344–358

Chapter 5

A critique of PISA and what Jullien’s plan might offer

Katherine Forestier and Bob Adamson

Compare: A Journal of Comparative and International Education, volume 47, issue 3 (May 2017), pp. 359–373

Chapter 6

Revisiting Jullien in an era of globalisation

Jason Beech and Fazal Rizvi

Compare: A Journal of Comparative and International Education, volume 47, issue 3
(May 2017), pp. 374–387

Chapter 7

The making of comparability: education indicator research from Jullien de Paris to the 2030 sustainable development goals

Manuel Cardoso and Gita Steiner-Khamsi

Compare: A Journal of Comparative and International Education, volume 47, issue 3
(May 2017), pp. 388–405

Chapter 8

Comparison as an approach to the experimental method

David A. Turner

Compare: A Journal of Comparative and International Education, volume 47, issue 3
(May 2017), pp. 406–415

Chapter 9

Identity as immunology: history teaching in two ethnonational borders of Europe

Eleftherios Klerides and Michalinos Zembylas

Compare: A Journal of Comparative and International Education, volume 47, issue 3
(May 2017), pp. 416–433

Chapter 10

Forum: The rise of international large-scale assessments and rationales for participation

Camilla Addey, Sam Sellar, Gita Steiner-Khamsi, Bob Lingard and Antoni Verger

Compare: A Journal of Comparative and International Education, volume 47, issue 3
(May 2017), pp. 434–452

For any permission-related enquiries please visit:

<http://www.tandfonline.com/page/help/permissions>

Notes on Contributors

Bob Adamson is UNESCO Chairholder in TVET and Lifelong Learning; Chair Professor of Curriculum Reform; and Director of the Centre for Lifelong Learning Research and Development. Formerly, he was Director of the UNEVOC Centre (Hong Kong) and of the Comparative Education Research Centre at the University of Hong Kong. He is the former President of the Comparative Education Society of Hong Kong. He has taught in schools, colleges and universities in France, Wales, England, mainland China, Australia and Hong Kong.

Camilla Addey holds a PhD in Education and Lifelong Learning from the University of East Anglia, Norwich, UK. After completing her PhD studies in 2014, Dr Addey was awarded a prestigious research fellowship (Fritz Thyssen Foundation) at the Centre for Comparative and International Education at Humboldt University in Berlin. Her current research focuses on the expansion of the OECD's global education governance; the contextualisation of global policy tools in lower and middle-income contexts; and the involvement of the private sector in ILSAs.

Jason Beech is a Professor at the University de San Andres, Buenos Aires, Argentina, and holds a Compare International Advisory Board member position on the British Association for International and Comparative Education. He holds a PhD in Education from University College London. He is a researcher of the National Council of Scientific and Technical Research of Argentina (CONICET). His research focuses on global discourses in education and their reception in different contexts.

Manuel Cardoso is an education specialist at UNICEF, New York. He was previously a programme specialist at the UNESCO Institute of Statistics, and was Associate Professor at Universidad de la República, Uruguay, where he taught a senior-year, limited-enrolment elective class on applied quantitative analysis for political science.

Rebecca A. Clothey is a faculty member at Drexel University's School of Education. Her research interests include international higher education policy, issues of ethnicity and community driven education initiatives in China, the US and Turkey. She has published on these topics in such journals as *Comparative Education Review*; *Higher Education Policy* and *Asian Ethnicity*.

Erwin H. Epstein is Professor Emeritus in the Department of Cultural and Educational Policy Studies, Loyola University, Chicago. Erwin does research in Social Stratification, Comparative Education Theory and Educational Policy. His current project is 'The Nazi Seizure of the International Education Review'. Prior to his tenure at Loyola, he was Director of the University Center for International Studies and Professor of Humanistic Foundations of Education and of Rural Sociology at The Ohio State University.

Katherine Forestier worked with the British Council, as Director of Education Hong Kong, managing UK–HK relations at policy and institutional levels, and its research portfolio from 2006–2013. Her increasing interest in research led to the award of a Doctorate with the University of Bristol. She is now Adjunct Assistant Professor with the Education University of Hong Kong, pursuing research interests in comparative and international education; and education policy. As Director of Education Link Limited she conducts other independent research for the education sector, including policy bodies and institutions.

Eleftherios Klerides's has worked as Visiting Professor at the Collège de France in Paris and as a consultant for the World Bank and UNESCO. His research interests include Global governance, European education policy, educational transfer, colonialism and neo-colonialism, the discursive construction of identities and subjectivities, education in the Mediterranean and Southeast Europe, textbook theory and research, and the history of education in colonial Cyprus.

Bob Lingard is currently a Professorial Research Fellow in the School of Education and the Institute for Social Science Research at the University of Queensland and a Fellow of the Academy of Social Sciences in Australia. He has also been Professor at the University of Edinburgh (2006–2008), where he held the Andrew Bell Chair of Education, and the University of Sheffield (2003–2006) in the UK. From 1989–2003, he worked in the School of Education at the University of Queensland.

Fazal Rizvi is Professor in Global Studies in Education at the University of Melbourne. He was previously Emeritus Professor at the University of Illinois, Urbana-Champaign, a Research Fellow at Australia India Institute, the University of Melbourne, Victoria, and Honorary Professor at Victoria University, Australia.

Sam Sellar is Reader in Education Studies at Manchester Metropolitan University. He was previously Postdoctoral Senior Research Fellow in the School of Education at the University of Queensland. His research focuses on intersections between education policy, governance and data. He also has a longstanding research interest in the education work of the OECD and particularly PISA.

Noah W. Sobe is Professor of Cultural and Educational Policy Studies in the School of Education at Loyola University Chicago, where he is also the Director of Loyola's Center for Comparative Education. He works in the areas of history of education and in comparative and international education, and teaches in Loyola's International Higher Education program.

Gita Steiner-Khamsi is a Professor at Teachers College at Columbia University, USA, and at the Graduate Institute of International and Development Studies, Switzerland. She has written on topics related to transnational policy borrowing and lending, global governance and education, global education industry, public-private partnership in education and comparative research methodology. Her geographic research focus is Mongolia and Central Asia.

David A. Turner is Professor Emeritus of Education at the University of South Wales, and Professor at the Institute for International and Comparative Education (IICE), Beijing Normal University. He is a Fellow of the Academy for Social Science and Honorary Member of the British Association for International and Comparative Education. His research interests range across Comparative Education, Higher Education, Education Policy and Leadership and Management in Education.

Antoni Verger is a Lecturer in the Department of Sociology at the Universitat Autònoma de Barcelona (UAB), Spain. Currently, his main areas of research are the global governance of education, and the role of international organisations, transnational civil society networks

and the private sector in global education politics; and the analysis of education privatisation, public-private partnerships, and quasi-markets in education, and their impact on education inequalities.

Charl Wolhuter is a Comparative Education Professor at North-West University's Potchefstroom Campus in South Africa. He is the President of Southern African Comparative and History of Education Society (SACHES). He has served as Junior Lecturer of History of Education and Comparative Education at the University of Pretoria and is a former Senior Lecturer at the University of Zululand, South Africa.

Michalinos Zembylas is Associate Professor of Education at the Open University of Cyprus. His research interests are in the areas of educational philosophy and curriculum theory, and his work focuses on exploring the role of emotion and affect in curriculum and pedagogy. He is particularly interested in how affective politics intersect with issues of social justice pedagogies, intercultural and peace education, and citizenship education.



Taylor & Francis

Taylor & Francis Group

<http://taylorandfrancis.com>

The philanthropic mission of comparative and international education bequeathed by Jullien: continuing capstone of the field

C. C. Wolhuter

ABSTRACT

The aim of this lead article of this special issue of *Compare* is to assess the value of Jullien's vision for the field of comparative and international education today. The life, writings and ideas of Jullien are sketched, followed by a survey of the path of development of the field since the time of Jullien. In view of the exigencies of the early-twenty-first century, the article argues that Jullien's philanthropic vision holds up a beacon for a future trajectory of the field. This article also introduces the other contributions to this volume by using them to illustrate, to refine and to qualify this thesis.

Introduction

Comparative and international education is a burgeoning scholarly field, according to the best of indicators. For example, Easton's (2015) analysis of the annual comparative education bibliography published in the *Comparative Education Review* shows a constant addition to the corpus of literature in the field over the past 45 years. In such a situation, the challenge is always to find a centripetal or integrative force, and any scholarly field always has the need for an élan, or inspiring ideal. The aim of this article, which investigates the value of Jullien's vision in providing such a compass for directing the field, is threefold. Firstly, being the lead article in this special issue, the purpose of the article is to briefly portray the life and writings of Jullien and to place these in historical perspective; that is, within the historical evolution of the field since the time of Jullien. The value of the field, and how it should reposition itself in the new, global society that is taking shape, by taking its cue from Jullien, is a second objective of the article. Thirdly, this lead article will then place the rest of the articles in the volume within the framework of this recommended agenda for twenty-first century comparative and international education, drawing on Jullien.

The article proposes that Jullien's contribution to the field is threefold. Firstly, the name of the field of comparative education came from Jullien. Secondly, Jullien is one of the major contributors to one of the three main epistemological strands in the field. Finally, Jullien's philanthropic vision gave the comparative education scholarly community an inspiring ideal.

Marc-Antoine Jullien de Paris: life and work

Marc-Antoine Jullien de Paris (born 10 March 1775, Paris; died 4 April 1848, Paris) was born into a middle-class family that was active in the politics of the day. His father was a deputy in the National Convention. Two formative influences on his life and worldview were his education and the political events of his time, in which he participated actively. He entered the Collège Navarre in 1785. Here his thinking was shaped by learning about various different intellectual streams: the philosophers of the Enlightenment assured him of the perfectibility of humanity, of the inner voice of conscience and of the demands of reason, and the Encyclopédistes convinced him of the need for continual progress and of the virtues of science (Gautherin 2000). He lived through the French Revolution, the Napoleonic Wars, the restoration of 1815 and the 1830 revolution. In these he took an active part. Jullien served in the Diplomatic Corps (he was sent to London by the Marquis de Condorcet) from 1792, then joined the military and then formed part of the government of Robespierre. He broke with Robespierre and, after a brief stint in journalism, went to Italy to become a scribe in the Army of Italy. Subsequently, he was part of Napoleon's invasion of Egypt (1798), but he later opposed Napoleon, for which he was imprisoned. Jullien experienced the restoration of the monarchy (1815) and spent his last years publishing political and scholarly journals.

While in the employ of Napoleon as a writer for the army's mail service, he was sent to Italy in 1810, and passed through Yverdon in Switzerland, where he became acquainted with the education reformer Johann Heinrich Pestalozzi (1746–1827). Jullien sent his first three sons to Pestalozzi's well known experimental institute in Yverdon. Pestalozzi is widely regarded as the starting point of modern pedagogy in that he substituted experimentation for tradition in classroom practice (Duggan 1916). Pestalozzi also contended, along with many earlier and contemporary reformers, that the purpose of education was to bring about a reformed society. But unlike most of these reformers, he maintained that this could only be achieved when every individual has been properly educated. Thus he appealed for universal education, but with different motives from those of the religious reformers, who were the first people in history to appeal for universal elementary education, albeit with exclusively religious objectives (cf. Duggan 1916, 134).

As can be expected from his occupation as journalist, Jullien was a prolific writer, and a long list of publications, on the politics of the day and on education, flowed from his pen. Among the education writings, Fraser (1964, 8–9) regards the following two, both published in 1810, as significant: *Essai général d'éducation physique, morale et intellectuelle: Suivi d'un plan d'éducation pratique pour l'enfance, l'adolescence et la jeunesse, ou Recherches sur les principes et les bases de l'éducation* (General essay on physical, moral, and intellectual education: Following a practical plan of education for infants, adolescents, and youth, or researches on the principles and bases of education) and *Essai sur l'emploi du temps, ou méthode qui a pour objet de bien régler l'emploi du temps* (Essay on the employment of time, or a method designed to regulate the use of time). What Jullien is best remembered for, however, at least in the field of comparative and international education, is his *Esquisse et vues préliminaires d'un ouvrage sur l'éducation comparée* (Plan and preliminary views for a work on comparative education). It was first published in Swiss and French literary journals in 1816–1817 and then as a pamphlet offprint in 1817.

This publication, or *Plan* (as it is commonly called by comparativists), of Jullien's consisted of two parts. In the first part Jullien laments the state of Europe. This was a continent

devastated by the sociopolitical convulsions, bloodshed and suffering brought about by the French Revolution and the Napoleonic wars, although Jullien attributed this all to the 'moral state of Europe' (Fraser 1964, 33). Jullien saw the root cause of all this to be ignorance of the populace:

It is ignorance, forgetfulness ... degradation of hearts and minds, which have produced revolution and wars, so cruelly prolonged, of which the horrible results have successfully desolated all the countries of Europe. (Fraser 1964, 34)

Jullien saw an ameliorative answer to all this in education:

It is through the return to ... morality ... introduced in public education ... that one can reinvigorate men [*sic*], exercise a beneficial reaction on the coming generation ... to prevent ... new troubles and calamities appearing ceaselessly. (Fraser 1964, 34–35)

Thus, governments should be dedicated to this lofty project of public education, they should have a common goal and they should be interested in perfecting its methods by learning from each other's experience in education. To facilitate this, Jullien proposed the establishment of a 'Special Commission on Education' composed of members collecting data from education systems in all countries in Europe, collating and comparing such data and publishing it in a report. Series of questions on each branch of education, drawn up in advance and classified under uniform headings, would guide such an exercise of collecting data. At a time when nation states started to crystallise out in Europe, it is difficult to decide whether Jullien was advocating some kind of universal, post-national morality. Certainly the outer perimeter of his frame of reference was Europe. Two of his recommendations were for a teacher education institution and a journal of education, both of these covered a pan-European scope (cf. Fraser 1964, 22). The remit of his proposed international commission was also supra-national in scope, but this body was tasked with the collection of information only, to be put at the perusal of (assumably) national policy makers. Similarly it is difficult to ascertain what kind of morality Jullien had in mind, though this envisioned morality seemed to be connected to the establishment of peace and the cessation of bloodshed (19). This morality he connected to the primitive nature of humans (which it could be assumed has a trans-national commonality) (34).

The second part of his publication contains exactly such a questionnaire. Jullien stated that six series of questions should be included, with the following rubrics:

- (1) primary and common education
- (2) secondary and classical education
- (3) higher and scientific education
- (4) normal education (i.e. teacher education)
- (5) education of girls
- (6) education as it is related to legislation and social institutions.

In his publication Jullien provided his lists of questions relating to rubrics 1 and 2; he set out his intention to publish his lists of questions for rubrics 3 to 6 in a later publication, an assignment that he unfortunately never completed.

Such a data bank, according to Jullien, should also serve as the basis for a 'science' of education, which will inform policy makers or politicians in various countries (Fraser 1964, 37). It was envisaged that such an undertaking would provide a prompt and sure means for regenerating and improving public and private education (37). Finally, Jullien appealed for the establishment of a *Journal of Education*. It was thought that such a periodical would

serve as a forum for the investigation of and comparison between institutions and systems of education and as a vehicle of communication among scholars of education.

Jullien's place in the historical evolution of comparative and international education

The prehistory of comparative and international education

Noah and Eckstein (1969) distinguish between two incipient phases in the development of comparative education, namely a phase of travellers' tales and a phase of systematic collection of data, with the intention of borrowing.

Travellers' tales

Comparison is a typically human activity. It could even be argued, drawing on established learning theory such as that of Piaget, that all human knowledge is essentially comparison. It can therefore be postulated that the first human beings, on having made contact with communities, societies and cultures other than their own, started to compare their own societies, communities and cultures, including their own ways of raising children, with those of others. The oldest written account of such comparison is found in the biography that the Greek author Xenophon (c. 430–355 BC) wrote of the Persian king Cyrus. In this biography he compared the Greek and the Persian ways of raising children. Such written comparisons of educational practices have been evident in the literature ever since, and continue to occur today in, for example, newspapers and the popular media. It should be noted that, as the contributions of Sobe and Epstein in this special issue argue, narratives can and do constitute an accepted epistemological strand in the field, in addition to that of positivism; however, because of the unsystematic, biased and unverifiable (validity and reliability are not accounted for) nature of travellers' tales, they can be regarded as belonging to a phase before comparative education became a full-fledged field of scholarly enquiry.

Systematic study of foreign education systems, for the purposes of borrowing

By the beginning of the nineteenth century, a new kind of educational traveller emerged. They were mostly government officials studying education systems and educational developments in foreign countries, with the aim of borrowing best ideas, methods, insights and practices, that is, to import them to improve their own education systems back home. These developments can be understood against the backdrop to the rise of nation states in the regions of Western Europe and Northern America at the time and the establishment of national education systems of primary education in these states, as part of national projects of state and nation formation.

An obvious example of this new kind of educational traveller is Victor Cousin (1792–1867), who, at the direction of the French Ministry of Education, undertook a study tour of Prussia in 1831, and in the following year delivered a report in two parts on his findings, titled *Report on the State of Public Instruction in Prussia*. The fundamental law establishing the French system of primary education, the Guizot Law of 1833, was based on Cousin's report.

While they are comprehensive, these studies of foreign education systems generally do not comply with the rigours of scientific scholarship (Crossley and Jarvis 2000, 261; Noah